The Role of Employers in Bridging Newcomers’ Absorption and Integration in the Canadian Labour Market

A Knowledge Synthesis Project

Authored by Julie Drolet, Tiffany Sampson, Meyer Burstein, Brenda Smith, Allysa Gredling, & Romana Pasca

January 14, 2014

We wish to acknowledge the financial contribution of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) for this project.
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Key Messages</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Summary</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of the Knowledge Synthesis Project Team</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background and Context</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge Synthesis Goal and Objectives</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Methodology</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Knowledge Mobilization Plan</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Findings</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Part One: Academic Peer-Reviewed and Grey Literature</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Impact of immigration policies on supply and development of skills</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Role of employers and/or employer organizations</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Settlement agencies’ role in shaping employer behaviour and providing settlement activities</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The role of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supply and demand of skills for the labour market</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Practices and/or policies for absorption and integration of newcomers</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Part Two: Online Literature Synthesis</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Promising practices and solutions to better integrate newcomers</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Immigration-related policy impacts</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supply and demand</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Employers and gaps in services</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gaps in the employers’ perspective</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Employers’ motivation vs. value-proposition for hiring</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further Research</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appendix A:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A1: Results from the Promising Literature</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A2: Inclusion and Exclusion of the Literature</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A3: Number of Documents and Identified Themes</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appendix B: Criteria for Inclusion/Exclusion Sheet</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appendix C: Key Documents</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appendix D: References</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appendix E: Annotated Bibliography</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Messages

- Employers are key actors in the immigration system.

- Employers are actively encouraged to hire newcomers in Canada, yet newcomers face challenges with the lack of recognition of their foreign education and work credentials.

- Because the Canadian-born work force is aging, baby boomers are retiring, and the number of young workers entering the work force is declining, there is also a growing skills and labour shortage amidst global competition for talent (Grant, 2013; CIC, 2009; Industry Canada, 2008). As skilled Canadian-born workers are becoming increasingly difficult to find, immigrants will play a more significant role in Canada’s labour force (Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2009). Governments in Canada have been taking steps to address these issues by formulating and implementing changes to the immigration program to make it more employer-oriented. Skills mismatches continue to challenge employers across the Canadian economy (Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2013). In this context, there is a need to consider employer practices and behaviour that will help to close the skills gap.

- This report is largely a review of Canadian research to synthesize what is known about employers’ use of and involvement in the immigration program, and employers’ workforce needs. A systematic scoping review of a wide range of literature resources (peer-reviewed and grey literature) and methodologies (qualitative and quantitative) was conducted.

- Various related themes are covered including immigration policies on supply and development of skills; role of employers and employer organizations; role of settlement agencies engaging with employers and shaping employer behaviour; importance of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers; supply and demand of skills for the labour market; and promising practices and policies for absorption and integration of newcomers.

- The synthesis found a lack of evidence of employer engagement in the provision of settlement services, notwithstanding the substantial employer stake in hiring and optimizing immigrant workers. This suggests underinvestment by small and medium enterprises (SMEs) and larger companies in incorporating immigrants into the labour market.

- Further research is needed to better understand the perspectives and experiences of employers in fostering meaningful employment, immigrant settlement, and economic and social integration of newcomers in Canada.

- Finally, the report includes appendices on the literature reviewed with a list of key documents, references, and an annotated bibliography.
Executive Summary

Canada’s Economic Action Plan 2013 recognizes that training is not sufficiently aligned to the skills employers need or to the jobs available, resulting in a skills mismatch that leads to higher unemployment and slower economic growth. Because the Canadian-born work force is aging, baby boomers are retiring, and the number of young workers entering the work force is declining, there is also a growing skills and labour shortage amidst global competition for talent (Grant, 2013; CIC, 2009; Industry Canada & HRSDC, 2008). As skilled Canadian-born workers are becoming increasingly difficult to find, immigrants will play a more significant role in Canada’s labour force (Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2009). Statistics Canada (2008) research indicates that before the middle of the next decade, almost all labour force growth will come from immigration.

Forthcoming revisions to the federal selection system for skilled workers (the proposed Expression of Interest (EOI) system) call for an increased role for employers, in part, to facilitate a better match between skilled immigrants and the labour market. This ‘modernized’ system will be implemented early in 2015. The federal and provincial governments, the community of employers, and immigrant service providers all have roles to play in increasing employers’ capacity to recruit, hire and settle immigrants. The federal government’s role is critical for employers in respect of making decisions on who is admitted to Canada, including immigrants, temporary foreign workers and foreign students. Thus, federal decisions affect employers’ hiring practices in their workplaces and ability to attract, retain and integrate newcomers (IECBC, 2012).

As key actors in the immigration system, employers are actively encouraged to hire newcomers in Canada. Yet newcomers face challenges with the lack of recognition of their foreign education and work credentials, which impacts labour market integration. This hard reality is forcing a re-examination of existing policies with a view to achieving earlier labour market integration, including policies aimed at retaining skilled newcomers already in the country.

The goal of the knowledge synthesis project is to describe the state of knowledge on the role of employers and employer organizations in bridging newcomers’ absorption and integration.

The knowledge synthesis project considers the following questions:

- What is the impact of immigration policies on employer behaviour and response to policy measures and, by extension, on labour supply and skills development uptake?
- What is the “value proposition” for hiring newcomers from employers’ perspective?
- How could employers be motivated to play a greater role in social and economic integration, and what strategies might provide them with the tools and resources to do so?
- What is the potential contribution that settlement agencies can make to employers in shaping behavior and assistance to conduct settlement activities?
In answering these questions, the project sought to:

1) Identify employer interests and perspectives in bridging gaps between labour market demand for skills and the supply of skills using different immigrant flows to accelerate labour market absorption;

2) Identify the most promising policies and practices, so as to better discern and meet future skills needs; and

3) Compile a knowledge synthesis ‘summary’ to inform dialogue between government policy-makers, education and training institutions, researchers, stakeholders, and employers.

The knowledge synthesis project aims to support the synthesis of existing research knowledge and the identification of knowledge gaps in a format accessible to government policy-makers, education and training institutions, and employers. The project did not undertake any original research. The knowledge synthesis methodology included a systematic scoping review of a wide range of literature resources (peer-reviewed and grey-literature) and methodologies (qualitative and quantitative).

The methodology had several critical components, including: selecting and identifying relevant online databases, identifying search terms, building search strings, creating search alerts, building a screening process, and developing a process to review the literature. Twenty-one key academic-based online databases were identified to search for literature on the role of employers and employer organizations in the labour market integration of immigrants. A base of search terms was identified and used in the academic database searches. From the academic database searches, a total of 541 promising documents were identified. Other sources used in the search for literature, particularly ‘grey literature’ (unpublished documents), were Internet search engines such as Google. Promising grey literature was retrieved from several different websites, including: government ministries, non-profit organizations, and sector networks. A total of 62 promising web documents were identified. The final synthesis incorporated two-levels of screening that used a guideline template, which outlined criteria for the inclusion and exclusion of promising documents. The first screening phase entailed reviewing the documents’ titles and abstracts to determine whether or not they matched the criteria. During the second screening phase, the guideline template was also used to assist in the thorough analysis of documents to determine what is known about the topic and to identify knowledge gaps.

This report presents the results and outcomes of the synthesis. Various related themes are covered: immigration policies on supply and development of skills; the role of employers and employer organizations; the role of settlement agencies engaging with employers and shaping employer behaviour; the importance of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers; the supply and demand of skills for the labour market; and the promising practices and policies for absorption and integration of newcomers.

The findings indicate that the international race for skilled labour (Gribble & Blackmore, 2012; McGovern, 2012) in the new knowledge economy (McGovern, 2012; Young, 2007) makes it
necessary for immigration policies and programs to attract the skilled workers that the economy needs as well as to offer and provide a desirable future for immigrants (Watt, Krywulak, & Kitagawa, 2008). The literature describes the pressure to change immigration policies to better reflect labour market realities (Liebig, 2007; Gwynne, 2012). The literature also suggests that immigration policies are trying to address common barriers faced by newcomers (Kelly-Freake, 2007; Walton-Roberts, 2005). The Provincial Nominee Program, Canadian Experience Class, Temporary Foreign Worker Program, and Expression of Interest are prominently featured in the literature with respect to the supply and development of skills.

The federal and provincial governments, the employer community itself, and service providers all have roles to play in increasing employers’ capacity to hire and recruit immigrant talent. Since the federal government decides who is admitted to Canada and the numbers coming each year – including temporary foreign workers and foreign students – it has a tremendous impact on employers. Therefore, reform and streamlining of federal policies, programs, processes, and services are critical and necessary parts of the solution to enhance employers’ capacity to hire, retain, and integrate immigrants into their workplaces (IECBC, 2012).

The development of skills to meet the demands of the future labour market is crucial to increasing Canada’s productivity, fostering innovation, and, ultimately, improving economic prosperity and quality of life. The significance of this project lies in the need to compile, synthesize, and exchange knowledge of employer capacities and practices, as well as their motivations, behaviours, and potential future contributions.

The synthesis found a lack of evidence of employer engagement in the provision of settlement services, notwithstanding the substantial employer stake in hiring and optimizing immigrant workers. This suggests underinvestment by small and medium enterprises (SMEs) and larger companies in incorporating immigrants into the labour market. Employer involvement in settlement has not been extensively or systematically studied, and there has been no attempt to carefully analyze and disseminate best practices in this field.

The report identifies areas of further research with respect to the evaluation of the role of employers in the successful integration of immigrants. In reviewing the academic and grey literature, it is evident that there is a knowledge gap in understanding employers’ role in social and economic integration. There is a lack of research on successful employer settlement and integration practices for newcomers. New knowledge is necessary to identify initiatives, tools, supports, and promising practices developed and implemented by large corporations and Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs).

Finally, the report concludes with additional details regarding the literature reviewed that includes a list of key documents, references, and an annotated bibliography.
Members of the Knowledge Synthesis Project Team

The project is led by Julie Drolet, Associate Professor in the Faculty of Social Work at the University of Calgary’s Central and Northern Alberta Region in Edmonton and Prairie node co-leader of the Pathways to Prosperity Partnership. Dr. Drolet served as the Metropolis BC domain leader in settlement, integration, and welcoming communities, and brings relevant research skills and policy analysis to the project.

Collaborators are:

- Meyer Burstein, Senior Fellow and Director of the Policy and Planning for the Pathways to Prosperity Partnership;
- Allysa Gredling, Coordinator of the Welcoming Communities Initiative at Kamloops Immigrant Services in Kamloops, BC;
- Brenda Smith, Distance and Document Delivery Librarian at Thompson Rivers University in Kamloops, BC;
- Romana Pasca, Program Coordinator of Skills Connect and Welcoming Communities Program Manager at Immigrant and Multicultural Services Society in Prince George, BC;

Additional members of the project team include four student research assistants and a community-based researcher:

- Amber Young, graduate student in the Faculty of Social work at the University of Calgary;
- Soon Young Jang, graduate student in the School of Education at Thompson Rivers University;
- Angele Sandha, undergraduate student in the School of Social Work and Human Service at Thompson Rivers University;
- Amanda Hill, undergraduate student in the Faculty of Arts at Thompson Rivers University; and
- Tiffany Sampson, community-based researcher in Kamloops, BC.

For more information contact: Julie Drolet (jdrolet@ucalgary.ca)
Background and Context

Canada’s Economic Action Plan 2013 recognizes that training is not sufficiently aligned to the skills employers need or to the jobs available, resulting in a skills mismatch that leads to higher unemployment and slower economic growth. While the Canada-born work force is aging, baby boomers are retiring, and the number of young workers entering the work force is declining, there is a growing skills and labour shortage amidst global competition for talent (Grant, 2013; CIC, 2009; Industry Canada & HRSDC, 2008). As skilled Canadian-born workers are becoming increasingly difficult to find, immigrants will play a more significant role in Canada’s labour force (Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2009). Statistics Canada (2008) research indicates that before the middle of the next decade, almost all labour force growth will come from immigration.

A request for proposals was launched in May 2013 by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) in order to better understand the state of knowledge on the ‘Skills Development for Future Needs of the Canadian Labour Market’. Two primary themes were identified to guide projects:

Theme 1) Demand for skills in the future Canadian labour market

Theme 2) Supply and development of skills for the future Canadian labour market.

A knowledge synthesis proposal, led by Julie Drolet, was developed in order to advance understanding of Theme 2 by considering how well Canada supplies the kinds of skills most likely to be in demand in the future labour market, and what are the most promising approaches to improving this performance with respect to immigration.

Employers are key actors in the immigration system. Governments in Canada have been taking steps to formulate and implement changes to the immigration program to make it more employer-oriented. Employers are actively encouraged to hire newcomers in Canada. Yet newcomers face challenges with the lack of recognition of their foreign education and work credentials, and this hard reality is forcing a re-examination of the long-standing federal attachment to the human capital model with a view to achieving earlier labour market integration. Greater and more direct employer involvement in the immigration programs may call for new approaches in the immigration-integration continuum and strategies to support the capacities of employers to engage.

The Expression of Interest (EOI) will provide a new opportunity for an increased role for employers, in part, to facilitate a better match between skilled immigrants and the labour market. This ‘modernized’ system will be implemented by January 1, 2015. The federal and provincial governments, the community of employers, and service providers all have roles to play in increasing employers’ capacity to hire and recruit immigrants. The federal government’s role in the immigration program has a tremendous impact on employers in terms of making decisions on who is admitted to Canada including foreign workers and foreign students. In this context immigration policies and programs affect employers’ hiring practices in their workplaces and ability to attract, retain and integrate newcomers (IECBC, 2012).
Knowledge Synthesis Goal and Objectives

The goal of the project is to describe the state of knowledge on the role of employers and employer organizations in bridging newcomers’ absorption and integration. The knowledge synthesis project set out to ask the following questions:

- What is the impact of immigration policies on employer behaviour and response to policy measures and, by extension, on labour supply and skills development uptake?
- What is the “value proposition” for hiring newcomers from employers’ perspectives?
- How could employers be motivated to play a greater role in social and economic integration, and what strategies might provide them with the tools and resources to do so?
- What is the potential contribution that settlement agencies can make to employers in shaping behavior and assistance to conduct settlement activities?

The knowledge synthesis project objectives are:

4) To identify employer interests and perspectives in bridging gaps between labour market demand for skills and the supply of skills using different immigrant flows to accelerate labour market absorption;

5) To identify the most promising policies and practices, so as to better discern and meet future skills needs and the implications for public policy; and

6) To compile a knowledge synthesis ‘summary’ to inform dialogue between government policy-makers, education and training institutions, researchers, stakeholders, and employers.

Implications

The significance of this project lies in the need to compile, synthesize, and exchange knowledge of employer capacities and practices, as well as their motivations, behaviours, and potential future contributions. Employer involvement in settlement has not been extensively or systematically studied, and there has been no attempt to carefully analyze and disseminate best practices in this field.

In this project there are a number of contributions:

1) To identify the skills, competencies and attributes needed in today’s labour market;

2) To champion solutions to better integrate skilled immigrants in the labour market;
3) To document employer-related strategies, tools, resources and effective best practices to assist in recruiting, hiring, integrating and retaining immigrant skilled workers; and

4) To provide employer insights into the labour market to inform strategic planning and development by government.

**Approach**

**Methodology**

The knowledge synthesis methodology is a systematic scoping review of a wide range of literature resources (peer-reviewed, popular, and grey-literature) and methodologies (qualitative and quantitative). Published studies are found in journal articles, book and book chapters, dissertations, and background materials; as well as research commissioned by government departments and other stakeholder agencies, research institutions, think tanks, and employer and business-related organizations. Unpublished literature (“grey literature”) is primarily created by government agencies, non-government and technical organizations, and research institutes. Both published and unpublished sources are primarily found using library research databases and Internet search engines, such as Google. However, because grey literature is unpublished and may not be available online, obtaining the research reports also requires the expertise of key contacts and stakeholders working in the field.

The primary purpose of the knowledge synthesis was to provide a broad overview of current research and to document key components in order to identify specific gaps based on existing research evidence. The knowledge synthesis methodology has several critical components, including: selecting and identifying relevant search tools, identifying search terms, building search strings, creating search alerts, building a screening process, and developing a process to review the literature. Scoping reviews are a relatively new type of research review that provides a tool for summarizing literature in a topic area (Levac, Colquhoun, & O’Brien, 2010). The “York framework” developed by Arksey and O’Malley (2005) informed the review using five key phases: identifying the research question; identifying relevant studies and study selection; charting the data; collating, summarizing, and reporting the results; and optional consultation. The synthesis was conducted during a five month period (August to December, 2013) and this report was prepared in the final few weeks of the project (December 2013 – January 2014).

Key academic databases were identified to begin the preliminary search for literature on the topic. The databases were prioritized in terms of starting with general and discipline-specific article databases and ending with publishers’ electronic journal collections. General and discipline-specific article databases such as Sociological Abstracts, America History and Life, Canadian Business & Current Affairs (CBCA) Reference, EconLit, and Business Source Complete have many ways to focus searches and the capacity to find large volumes of promising scholarly and popular articles; whereas electronic journal collections such as Sage Journals and Cambridge Journals Online are more difficult to search and are more likely to yield articles that may have already been discovered in the article database searches, and generate lower numbers of promising articles. However, it is necessary to search in these collections as well since they may have unique titles that the other search tools do not index.
The online databases that were searched include: America History and Life, CBCA Reference & Current Events, EconLit, Sociological Abstracts, Business Source Complete, Sage Journals, Academic Search Complete, Social Services Abstracts, Social Sciences Citation Index, Canadian Research Index, Conference Board of Canada, Government of Canada Publications, Statistics Canada, Canadian Newsstand, Cambridge Journals Online, Oxford Electron Journals, Wiley Online Library, JSTOR, Project Muse, SpringerLINK, and Periodicals Archive Online.

Another source used in the preliminary search for literature, particularly for “grey literature” (unpublished documents) is Internet search engines such as Google. Similarly, key terms that were used for academic databases were also used for Google searches, including immigrant, employment, labour market demand, and economic and social integration. Promising grey literature was retrieved from several different web sources, including: government ministries, non-profit organizations, and sector networks. A total of 61 promising documents from web sources were initially identified.

A base search string was identified and used in the noted article database searches, which consists of: (immigra* OR newcomer OR foreign worker) AND (employ* OR labour OR labor). The use of advanced search techniques such as nesting Boolean search operators and truncation (*) to both broaden and focus the scope of search terms was applied. Depending on the database, other search terms such as economic integration, social integration, and government policy were added to the base search string to glean potentially more promising and focused articles. Furthermore, a date limiter ranging from 2003 to the present was imposed. When possible, other limiters were also utilized to assist with focusing the search, including: English, peer-reviewed journals, subject, title, and abstract fields. For example in the article database, CBCA Reference & Current Events the following Boolean search technique was used: Subject (immigra* OR newcomer OR foreign worker) AND Subject (labour OR labor OR employ*) AND Anywhere (skill OR demand).

The following search option limiters were applied: “subject”, “after 2002”, and “peer-reviewed”. Applying the advanced search techniques with the key search terms in all the databases mentioned above resulted in 5,738 initial search results. The titles and/or abstracts of those search results were scanned, and 597 potential articles were identified and uploaded to RefWorks. Utilizing the “remove duplicates” mechanism in RefWorks, articles were screened to ensure that only unique articles were uploaded to the bibliographic management system; 56 documents were removed, leaving a total of 541 promising articles.

As well as conducting searches in the academic databases and Internet search engines, a letter was electronically sent through the project’s Gmail account to 188 stakeholders. A Google search was conducted to develop a list of stakeholders, including employers, employer councils, and settlement agencies in order to compile their contact information. The letter invited the stakeholders to send “grey” literature such as unpublished reports, power-point presentations, policies and procedures that outline strategies, tools, and/or effective best practices for recruiting, hiring, integrating and/or retaining immigrant skilled workers. As a result, thirteen resources were received.

To determine if an item was promising or not for the knowledge synthesis, the reviewer determined if the item’s title was related to the project topic. If there was uncertainty or
clarification needed, the abstract and assigned subject headings were reviewed to determine relevancy. Once an article passed this initial screen, the citation was uploaded to RefWorks in preparation for full screening in the analysis stage. At that point, the item’s eligibility was based on its full content and was determined by more of the team members.

In addition to RefWorks, another tracking and recording tool that was developed for the project was an Excel spreadsheet. The spreadsheet had specific columns to assist in tracking and recording important data information of both academic and grey literature, including: date, database/source, type of literature, key terms, limiters, count, imports, notes, website URL, citations, abstracts, eligibility, potential themes, relevancy for northern and/or small and remote communities and Francophone minority communities, and status of full text. The spreadsheet not only kept track of how many initial articles were found but also provided a record if a published article or a document considered “grey literature” was relevant or not. Details of 541 promising articles were inputted in the Excel spreadsheet for more in depth analysis.

A third tool identified as being important for tracking and recording promising literature was Dropbox. Team members had access to the project’s Dropbox folder that contained four different subfolders, including: academic literature, grey literature, popular literature, and websites. Team members uploaded the full text of promising published and unpublished documents in the corresponding subfolder. Utilizing Dropbox for the knowledge synthesis was not only an organizational component, but also increased the capacity for accessibility. The shared Dropbox folder also included documentation for the team about which kinds of information went into which folder and outlined a file naming structure to ensure consistency.

Finally, a method was initiated to ensure that potentially promising articles were not missed once a search in a database was completed. After a database had been fully mined, a broad scope search alert was created in the databases (i.e., Academic Search Complete) if the feature was available. The following search was identified to be the most relevant broad scope search to use for search alerts: (immigr*a OR newcomer OR foreign worker) AND (employ* OR labour OR labor ). If any articles were later added to the database that met the search alert’s criteria, an email was sent to the project’s Gmail account once a week listing the new articles that had been published and added to the database. In total six different search alerts were created. The email search alerts were monitored and relevant articles were added into the project’s management systems (i.e., RefWorks, Excel spreadsheet, and Dropbox folder).

To determine whether the collated academic and online literature was relevant or not to the research topic (i.e., the role of employer and/or employer organizations in the absorption and integration of immigrants) two levels of screening were developed. The first screening phase entailed reviewing the titles and abstracts of 541 articles recorded in the Excel spreadsheet. Reviewing the online literature that included 61 promising documents was slightly different because the majority of “grey” literature such as government reports, working papers, and toolkits did not have abstracts and therefore documents were assessed in their entirety at this stage. Both processes used a guiding checklist (see Appendix B) that was created by the project team in order to assist with determining relevancy. The guiding checklist used criteria for including and/or excluding publications along with eighteen themes (i.e., employer and/or employer organization’s role in absorption and integration of newcomers, employer’s motivation
for hiring newcomers, promising practices and/or policies for absorption and integration of newcomers, etc.). In addition to the checklist, team members were paired to review a set of articles for inclusion and exclusion. Upon reviewing the articles, if there were any discrepancies, for example if an article was included by one reviewer and excluded by the other, then the pair would have a discussion and come to a consensus on its eligibility. For the second screening, the articles were examined in relation to the potential theme(s) that were assigned to the item during the first level of screening. The second screening served two functions. First, it provided another opportunity to filter the articles using the guideline to evaluate their relevancy in relation to the theme(s). Next, the second screening allowed for a thorough analysis of the literature examining what is known on the topic and where the knowledge gaps exist. A total of 128 documents, including academic peer-reviewed, grey literature, and online literature (web-based resources) contributed to the key findings of this report.

Knowledge Mobilization Plan

The knowledge synthesis project includes a detailed knowledge mobilization plan that takes advantage of the capacity of the Pathways to Prosperity Partnership to reach a broad audience including key policy-makers and researchers. The Pathways to Prosperity Partnership is a national alliance, funded by a SSHRC Partnership grant, designated to promote the economic, social, and civic integration of migrants and minorities in Canada. The partnership includes all key federal and provincial migration ministries; municipalities; national, regional, and local organizations involved in newcomer settlement; and researchers from over 50 universities. Using this network and the targeted, purpose-built communication structures it contains, the research team aims to disseminate the findings widely, employing multiple strategies to target particular knowledge users and audiences, with a view to bridging the gap between research evidence and its use. This will include a variety of forms of information and media for dissemination.

Products will include the final report; policy and practice briefs highlighting the results of the knowledge synthesis, with a particular focus on best practices in employer involvement in immigrant selection and retention; short, plain-language summaries of key findings; an annotated bibliography; a peer-reviewed journal article; a media release; and at least one op-ed piece in a national newspaper. An effort will be made to provide material in a form that lends itself to further dissemination via internal knowledge pathways (i.e., within bureaucracies and other institutions). Products will be disseminated through a variety of venues, including the Library and Best Practices sections of the Pathways to Prosperity website (p2pcanada.ca). Attention will be drawn to these products through articles appearing in the bimonthly eBulletin of the Pathways to Prosperity, with a current distribution of over 2250 active targeted subscribers, including policy-makers, NGOs, and researchers.

In addition to these products, it will be important to disseminate our findings directly to key policy-makers within the Selection Branch and the Integration Branch of Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC), Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC), and provincial immigration ministries – key policy-makers to receive the results. To achieve this, we will capitalize on our formal, well-established connections with these individuals and will
arrange small group meetings and teleconferences to discuss the findings and to ensure that the policy briefs are shared with these individuals and, through them, with their colleagues.

We plan to organize a workshop for policy-makers and employer representatives, at which we will present the major findings and promote interactive discussions of the implications. This event will take place in Ottawa so that federal policy-makers can easily attend. The event will occur in parallel to a meeting of immigration policy-makers (i.e., National Settlement Council) to facilitate participation of provincial representatives. In addition, to inviting key policy-makers and major employers to this workshop, we will advertise it on the Pathways to Prosperity website and through our partners across the country. To ensure that the presentations at the workshop reach a broad audience beyond those present, the presentations will be videotaped, posted to YouTube, and advertised through the Pathways to Prosperity website and eBulletin.

The findings may also contribute to a teaching stream of the Pathways to Prosperity’s Summer Institute, to be launched in 2014. The Summer Institute will provide week-long, multidisciplinary, practical courses to policy-makers, practitioners, and researchers focusing on promising practices and innovation. The products of the knowledge synthesis will be disseminated internationally, through our links with policy-makers and researchers in other countries, including the US, New Zealand, Australia, the UK, and Germany.
Key Findings

The results and outcomes of the synthesis are organized in two parts: 1) Academic peer-reviewed and grey literature and 2) Online literature (i.e., web-based sources).

Part One: Academic Peer-Reviewed and Grey Literature

The first part of the synthesis will present the results and outcomes of the review drawing from the academic peer-reviewed and grey literature using six themes:

1) Impact of immigration policies on supply and development of skills
2) Role of employers and/or employer organizations
3) Settlement agencies’ role in shaping employer behaviour and providing settlement services
4) The role of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers
5) Supply and demand of skills for the labour market
6) Practices and/or policies for absorption and integration of newcomers

Impact of Immigration Policies on the Supply and Development of Skills

Considerable recent work has been done on the implications of skills shortages for the Canadian economy (Tal, 2012; Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2012; Miner, 2012, 2010; Lapointe, Dunn, Tremblay-Cote, Bergeron & Ignaczak, 2008; Samuel & Basavarajappa, 2006). A skill shortage is defined as “…not enough people available with the skills needed to do the jobs which need to be done” (Green, Machin, & Wilksinson, 1998). Internationally, there is a “global war for talent” (Gribble & Blackmore, 2012; McGovern, 2012) in the new knowledge economy (McGovern, 2012; Young, 2007), which results in steep competition to fill a skilled labour force (Watt, Krywulak, & Kitagawa, 2008) with immigration policies that influence who will decide to settle where (Liebig, 2007). In order to remain competitive in this “race” immigration policies have to attract the skilled workers the economy needs as well as offer and provide a desirable future for immigrants (Watt et al., 2008). Globally, there have been attempts to alter immigration policy to fill chronic skill shortages (“Government to welcome”, 2006). However, there is a debate in the literature regarding this reconfiguration, with some identifying immigrants as critical to nation building (Lowe, 2010) and re-conceptualizing the system accordingly to make an explicit commitment to citizenship in order to retain the skills needed (Siemiatycki, 2010).

The literature describes the pressure to change immigration policies to better reflect labour market realities (Liebig, 2007; Gwynne, 2012). For several years, federal policies were perceived
as too limiting in the number of visas granted. Derwing and Krahn (2008) note that even with proactive efforts by municipalities and provinces to attract and retain immigrants, the desired outcomes were not always met because of the immigration cap.

Over the past two decades there has been a substantial shift in composition favouring skilled immigrants over family class entrants. The systems for accepting immigrants do not necessarily reflect the type of workers needed (Gwynne, 2012), and act as a barrier to attaining skilled foreign workers needed in the Canadian labour force (Young, 2007). However, it has been noted that policies that focus solely on skilled workers may be missing a piece to the puzzle to ensure growth of labour market (Aydemir, 2011; McGovern, 2012).

A question raised in the literature asks whether human capital acquired abroad transfers into labour market success in Canada (Aydemir, 2011). Immigration-related policies aim to address two common barriers faced by newcomers: 1) language and cultural differences; and 2) cumbersome credential assessment procedures (Kelly-Freake, 2007; Walton-Roberts, 2005). The policies have to go beyond how individuals are admitted and focus on labour market integration (Young, 2007). The Federal government, and some provinces, like Alberta, are addressing these issues by developing more comprehensive language training programs and streamlined credential recognition processes (Derwing & Krahn, 2008).

Throughout the academic literature there is an argument that policies need to go beyond the assumption that highly skilled workers will adapt and change to the host country (Kesler, 2006; Lowe, 2010). Recruiting immigrants and addressing the multiple processes to facilitate settlement and integration is required (Creese & Wiebe, 2012). Policies are needed to address racism and discrimination in the workplace (Atanackovic & Bourgeault, 2013; Kesler, 2006).

Grant (2007) provides more specific initiatives, including developing clear retraining paths for skilled immigrants so that they can obtain qualifications that are recognized by employers; providing supervised work experiences; providing advanced language training for the workplace; developing targeted retraining programs for immigrants in the non-regulated professions; and make retraining opportunities accessible to women and women with young children who are often family class immigrants or refugees.

Language and Cultural Differences

Proficiency in an official language is a key component in Canada’s immigration system.

Grondin (2005) explains that:

[A]mong the immigrants who had made progress, those who had taken language training were more likely to have improved their speaking ability by more than one level. Also, immigrants who had taken language training said that this had helped them in daily communication, adjusting to life in Canada, making new friends, looking for work, personal enrichment, and accessing the media (p. 44).
Chiswick and Miller (2009) explain that foreign workers with proficient English skills are in demand and obtain better, high paying jobs. In Quebec, the province has its own immigration policy specifically designed to give greater priority to potential immigrants who already know French, and pre-migration knowledge of French is expected to improve employment prospects (Godin & Renaud, 2005). Picot and Sweetman (2012) explain that the Canadian Experience Class (CEC) and the Federal Skilled Worker Program (FSWP) both include language assessment tools; however, the assessment differs for each program in that the former requires a higher test result in one of the two official languages than the latter, whereas the latter accepts average scores in both official languages. Picot and Sweetman (2012) note that it is too early to determine whether or not these two different approaches to valuing language proficiency will affect labour market outcomes.

Credentials

The credentialing process is often the first hurdle internationally educated professionals experience (Newton, Pillay, & Higginbottom, 2012). In their case study on the Manitoba PNP, Carter, Pandey, and Townsend (2010) note that data from Statistics Canada’s Longitudinal Immigration Database identified the recognition of credentials “as the major obstacle in obtaining jobs” (p.32) for survey respondents. The literature argues that immigrant skills are underutilized through the lack of recognition of foreign credentials and skills and poor job matching (Reitz, 2005; Shuchman, 2008). One newspaper article depicted a couple who sued Ottawa for falsely advertising employment opportunities for highly skilled foreign workers (“Unable to get jobs”, 2003). The skills mismatch is operationalized when immigrants accept lower skilled and lower paid jobs compared to Canadian born workers (Gwynne, 2012). The mismatch is generally attributed to a lack of foreign credential transferability (Chiswick & Miller, 2009; Newton et al., 2012; Singh & Sochan, 2010). Watt et al., (2008) cites Garth Whyte, executive vice-president of the Canadian Federation of Independent Business, who said “Canada doesn’t always effectively match the skills of would-be immigrants with job categories in which there are shortages” (p. 12). The reluctance to recognize credentials is believed to be a systemic issue (Donaldson, 2007; Watt et al., 2008). The literature identifies that proper credential assessment is essential in the hiring process of skilled immigrant workers (Alberta Employment and Immigration, 2010; Brooks, 2009).

Both government and business understand the importance of recognizing foreign credentials, and considerable efforts are underway to streamline credentialing processes. The issue was noted during CIC’s consultations with employers regarding the Expression of Interest (EOI) application system. According to CIC (2012), “[e]mployers…remarked on the ongoing challenges involved in having foreign nationals’ qualifications recognized by Canadian professional bodies in a timely fashion and in line with the procedures and timelines for immigration processing” (p. 6). When credentials are not recognized, immigrants are discounted (Somerville & Walsworth, 2009) and the country’s ability to sustain a knowledge-based economy is affected (Ikura, 2007). Credential recognition barriers can be seen as counterproductive in the “global race for talent”. In somewhat of a “catch 22” situation, the non-recognition of credentials prevents skilled immigrants from working in their field and acquiring experience (Khan, 2007).
Provincial Nominee Programs

CIC (2012) states that “the [PNP] … has recently become Canada’s second largest economic immigration stream, representing projected 42,000 – 45,000 admissions in 2012” (p. 5). The PNP is a program whereby immigrants are nominated by provincial and territorial governments to meet regional labour market needs and local employer needs (Allan, 2010; CIC, 2012).

It is important to consider policies that regionalize immigration and the PNP is viewed as a type of regionalization policy (Walton-Roberts, 2005). PNPs exist in most provinces and have been “successful in reversing the trend of declining immigration to smaller provinces” (Pandey & Townsend, 2011, p. 508). Manitoba is presented as a “success” in utilizing the PNP (Allan, 2010). Carter et al. (2010) explain that the Manitoba PNP has had success in the settlement of newcomers in towns and rural communities throughout the province, which is due in large part to the province’s support of provincial nominees through skills development and language and job training. Employer’s response to PNPs has allowed them to sponsor immigrants for semi-skilled employment (Carter et al., 2010; Picot & Sweetman, 2012), yet employers report that it remains difficult “to fill labour and skill shortages in a timely fashion” (CIC, 2012, p. 5). Pandey and Townsend (2011) found that the PNP was an effective route to attract and retain immigrants; retention rates for immigrants admitted through PNPs were higher in most provinces than for economic class immigrants arriving through federal programs.

Canadian Experience Class

In addition to the PNP, the Canada Experience Class (CEC) also addresses labour market shortages by permitting skilled temporary foreign workers and international students with Canadian work experience and official language proficiency to be landed in Canada (CIC, 2012; Picot & Sweetman, 2012).

Expression of Interest (EOI)

CIC has announced and is currently working to develop a new application process referred to as the Expression of Interest (EOI) system. It is designed to establish a highly qualified, readily accessible pool of foreign skilled workers for possible selection and admission to Canada. CIC’s consultations with employers on the development of the new application system, have revealed support for the creation of a pool of skilled newcomers available to fill domestic employment openings; a user-friendly system to ensure quick processing times; and a system that would encompass a wide range of occupations and skill levels to address labour market needs in different regions throughout Canada (CIC, 2012).

The EOI model presents an opportunity for CIC to develop a more direct relationship with employers in the selection of immigrants (CIC, 2012). This ‘modernized’ system will be implemented early in 2015. Drawing from a background document and consultations with Canadian employers, CIC may work to enhance the employer experience in the immigration
process; facilitate or promote matches between prospective applicants and employers with unmet skill needs; and engage employers more directly in immigrant selection to address key pressures facing Canada’s labour market and economy.

*International Students*

Over the past few years international students have attracted the attention of policymakers at national and provincial levels as a potential source for qualified labour (Suter & Jandl, 2008). Similarly other countries are developing strategies to facilitate a two-step migration, from international student to permanent resident, to better address skills shortages (Gribble & Blackmore, 2012). For example, the literature discusses strategies to fill the increasing need in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) positions.

*Temporary Immigration*

It is important to note that rights advocates, activists, and unions are concerned about the Temporary Foreign Worker Program (TFWP). The critiques include limited opportunities for skill development, systemic discrimination, and inequitable labour market participation (Buhel & Janzen, 2007; Canadian Centre for Refugees, 2010; Grant, 2007; McGovern, 2012). McGovern (2012) remarks that “the ‘institutionalization of uncertainty’… with temporary migration polices means that these workers have little expectation of developing social attachments, participating in leisure activities or of obtaining better jobs in the future” (p. 491). Overall, the literature consistently cited the same areas for improvement in regards to Canada’s immigration policies and programs, and Watt et al. (2008) summarize the main points as follows:

> Long waiting lists to enter the country, poor mechanisms for recognizing international credentials and overseas work experience, an inadequate points system, false promises of work, a disconnect between temporary and permanent immigration systems… (p. 7).

The TFWP will be further discussed in the next section of this report.

**Role of Employers and/or Employer Organizations**

The role of employers with respect to the absorption and integration of newcomers in Canada is understudied in academic and grey literature. However, the role that is prominently featured in both the academic and grey literature is that of employer organizations and/or community-based partnerships, including multi-stakeholder initiatives and programs to integrate newcomers not only in the workplace but also in the community (Adey, 2007; Campbell, 2004; Crawford, 2007; Kelly-Freake, 2007; Orme, 2007; Stonebridge, 2012; Tumilty, 2008). Newcomers and employers interact and form connections through community based organizations and partnerships (Kelly-Freake, 2007; Orme, 2012; Stewart, 2008). Venture Kamloops and Service Canada (2007) explain to employers the benefits of diversity in the workplace as a continuous commitment, which benefits both the employer and the worker through respectful relationships that attract and retain committed and productive employees. Training programs, diversity
workshops and mentorship are important components with respect to employment organizations' efforts to assist newcomers in developing skills and fostering connections for workplace integration (Brooks, 2009; Campbell, 2004; Crawford, 2007; Huff 2009; Stonebridge, 2012; Tumilty, 2008).

Interestingly, the role of employers with respect to integration was highlighted in a number of studies in relation to temporary foreign workers (TFWs) (Flecker, 2010; Watt et al., 2008). Watt, Krywulak, and Kitagawa (2008) provide three case studies that include the Alberta Oil and Gas Industry, Tower Cleaners and Maple Leaf noting what is done by the companies to assist TFWs’ settlement in the workplace and community. This includes workplace orientation and language training as well as non-work related assistance involving housing and transportation. Assistance with permanent residency was also noted in two of the case studies in that the employers helped TWFs in applying to become permanent residents (Watt et al., 2008).

Employer’s motivation for hiring newcomers

There are multiple perspectives to understand employers’ motivations for hiring newcomers. Overall job gaps due to skill shortages or worker shortages have led employers to recruit foreign skilled workers (“Skills search”, 2008). Employers who provided a more inclusive working environment for immigrant workers were better able to fill positions with foreign talent (Grant, 2009). This was necessary to address changes in a more diverse society; therefore, employers altered their hiring practices to reflect this diversity. For example, Scotiabank needed to hire people who could speak multiple languages, which meant reaching out to newcomers (Grant, 2009). In the technology arena, companies like Google and Microsoft rely heavily on foreign workers and claim that foreign workers are needed to be nationally and globally competitive. Bill Gates has spoken out strongly regarding the need for an apt visa program that admits technically skilled students and newcomers (Herbst, 2008). A prominent argument that is observed in the literature concerns “cheap labour” and the fact that employers are motivated to hire newcomers because they accept lower wages, longer hours, and are “better workers” (Mackenzie & Forde, 2009; Schwartz, 2005). The cheap labour argument also coincides with a presumed cultural bias towards certain immigrant workers. For example, the adult care sector hires numerous foreign care aids (Atanackovic & Bourgeault, 2013). The cultural bias also works the other way, where employers will avoid, or prefer, hiring certain ethnicities. For example, Dalley (2008) found that local Francophone immigrants in Alberta were being passed over for jobs due to their heavy accents.

Employer’s strategies, tools and resources for assisting economic and social integration

Employers have utilized a number of tools and strategies for assisting economic and social integration. An extensive report conducted by SP Consulting and the Whetstone Group (2013) makes several recommendations towards immigration reform including the need for employer inclusion in service delivery. The project critically reviews instruments, policies and practices related to facilitating immigrant labour market attachment and inclusion through a multi-jurisdictional literature review. The report provides several useful strategies, tools and resources
for use by employers to facilitate better immigration processes (SP Consulting & Whetstone Group, 2013). Another theme that frequently appears in publications directed at employers is the importance of creating a welcoming and inclusive workforce. Alberta Employment and Immigration (2008) suggest to employers to inform current employees that they are recruiting, demonstrate pride in diversity, participate in community events, join other organizations that help recruit newcomers, and involve the knowledge of diverse team members. In addition, the government publication emphasizes the importance of accommodating employees with family responsibilities as well as identifies strategies to retain employees (Alberta Employment and Immigration, 2008).

Stakeholder’s share their perspectives on best case practices from specific communities on attracting, retaining and integrating immigrants in second-tier communities (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005). In many articles, employers are urged to provide more training within the employment site (Huff, 2009). The types of training were mainly regarding language and communication skills with English as a Second Language (ESL) program (Brooks, 2009). In order to attract newcomers, employers also implemented support programs to facilitate transferring foreign credentials (Tumilty, 2008). In some articles, employers are believed to hold a cultural bias as a “tool” in hiring practices - to hire a specific skill set perceived to be better held by specific countries of origin (Findlay & McCollum, 2013; MacKenzie & Forde, 2009).

**Employer’s use of immigration policies**

Building a faster and more flexible immigration system was a commitment made in the Canada Economic Action Plan (CIC, 2012). Present immigrant workflow programs in Canada, such as the Economic Permanent Immigration, PNP and TFWP, do not appear to be ideal for the current needs of employers in Canada. The difficulty lies on both skill sides: employers find that luring workers who are highly skilled, such as doctors or engineers, is a difficult and complex process (Shuchman, 2008), but filling semi-skilled and low-skilled positions is also a challenge (CIC, 2012). The current system does not always allow for employers to accelerate labour market absorption as quickly as preferred, and while both government and business recognize this issue, they continue to discuss possible remedies (CIC, 2012).

Both the grey and academic literature discuss the importance of having employers involved in the development of immigration policies and programs (CIC, 2012; McMahon, 2013; Rheault, 2013). Although employers are using the programs currently in place, particularly the TFWP, there is evidence to suggest considerable dissatisfaction by employers with current policies and practices. This is a driving factor in reshaping immigration policies in Canada (Rheault, 2013). The TFWP appears to be favoured by employers because it permits rapid entry that meets specific industry needs (Rheault, 2013). The direction being taken by Canada is to develop an EOI system based on the skilled worker systems of Australia and New Zealand (McMahon, 2013). The academic literature also scantily addresses the relationship between demographics reliance on temporary foreign workers, as well as which industries are more likely to use the TFWs (Fuller & Vosko, 2008).
Employer’s perspectives on hiring newcomers or temporary foreign workers

The grey literature seems to have more of a focus on presenting both the positions of labour unions and employers when addressing the hiring of TFWs and newcomers, particularly in relation to the debate over whether TFWs are employed at the cost of native born workers (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005; Cryderman, 2013; Ebner, 2006). The focus of employers, as depicted in the literature, appears to be on the challenges of hiring TFWs and newcomers. These challenges generally fall under the following headings: language; networking; training; social perception; strict requirements; pre-screening; and human resource tools (Adey, 2007). The TFWP was viewed as a costly and time consuming process albeit essential for filling the skills shortage; helping to expand business; improving the skills base of the labour force; and increasing innovation and productivity (Adey, 2007; Grant, 2009; Sorensen, 2013; Watt et al., 2008). The challenges vary by industry and size of employer. For example, small and medium size enterprises (SMEs) find the scope of the TFWP limiting as they do not typically have a dedicated human resources team to attract and hire newcomers.

Additionally, the TFW program can simply be too costly for SMEs (Watt et. al, 2008). Industries located in rural areas communicate a greater need for the TFWP (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005; Stewart, 2008) because of difficulties in attracting employees. Overall, it appears employers are in favour of formalized hiring programs, but believe modifications need to occur in the current system in order for the program to better meet the needs of the labour market (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005; Sorensen, 2013). A caveat highlighted in an Australian study by Almeida, Fernando, and Sheridan (2012) is that current employer recruitment practices may actually be contributing to underutilization of immigrant professionals. Of note, also present in the academic literature is a focus on how employers recruitment strategies are seemingly based on the employers perceptions of TFWs as “good workers”, a stereotype which may contribute to labour segregation and a second class labour force (Findlay & McCollum, 2013; MacKenzie & Forde, 2013; Vanderklippe, 2012).

There is a large gap in the literature on skills implementation in the labour market from the perspectives of employers. In Canada language classes are delivered by agencies and funded by government. The literature discusses the challenges and complexity of providing workplace ESL classes and what employers can do to improve workplace communication (Brooks, 2009). Although the literature identifies difficulties employers face when hiring skilled immigrant workers, there is little information directly from the employers’ perspective, or information on what employers are actually doing in the workplace. The literature mostly focuses on barriers that arise in the workplace and what employers could be doing to address those barriers.

Knowledge of employer capacity and practices in assisting in newcomer settlement

There is a gap in the literature on employers’ capacity and practices in assisting newcomer settlement. The Canadian Labour and Business Centre’s (2005) report that has been previously mentioned does provide insight into how employers understand the issue of newcomer settlement and what actions employers might take to assist in the integration process. The report identifies key issues, barriers, and challenges for immigrants integrating into the labour force of five communities Fredericton, Hamilton, Victoria, Saskatoon, and Windsor, as well as initiatives,
programs and strategies that are taking place in each community (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005). There is consideration of how to assist immigrants in employment integration such as workplace trials allowing immigrants to gain Canadian work experience as well as workplace multiculturalism training (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005). There is also an understanding that more needs to be done to link services of different levels of government and community services with the business sector, particularly in smaller centres, including funding and tax incentives for employers to attract, employ and integrate newcomers in their respective communities (Canadian Labour and Business Centre, 2005). Further research is needed to better understand how employers view their capacity to help newcomers and to evaluate the extent to which employer practices reflect the reality.

**Key components and specific gaps found in previous research**

A major theme in the literature is the role that diversity plays in the labour market and in the workplace for both employers and employees, particularly as it concerns newcomers integrating into the workforce. From an employer’s perspective, it is good business to hire immigrants in order to have employees who can interact with a broad range of customers from different cultural backgrounds (Keung, 2004). As an employer, it is critical to attract and retain employees who are innovative and have special expertise that produces good results (Keung, 2004). With increasing demand for skilled and semi-skilled labour, it is more important than ever before for employers to plan and implement strategies to address their labour needs (“Global flow of labor”, 2008). In a study conducted by KPMG International, a number of actions were recommended to foster a diverse work environment such as “[exposing] staff to global cultures and [pursuing] a policy of workplace diversity” (“Global flow of labor”, p. 28). By employing immigrants, employers may build a workforce that is diverse; however, to retain employees there must be active diversity policies in place. Lucio and Perrett (2009) point out that trade unions tend to focus on bargaining issues that impact the majority of workers; this despite the fact that the workplace landscape is becoming more diversified and other issues need to be taken into account, such as bargaining for “extended leave for religious purposes or religious holidays” (p. 334). There is a need to better understand the different practices that employers might implement in order to foster a more accommodating workplace environment and the challenges that are encountered in doing so.

**Settlement Agencies’ Role in Shaping Employer Behaviour and Providing Settlement Services**

There is scant literature regarding the role of settlement agencies in shaping employer behavior; as well the perspective of employers is largely absent. The literature does discuss the role of settlement agencies in providing employment preparation services for newcomers, such as resume writing and job interview preparation (Weiner, 2008, Campbell, 2004; Amundson, Yeung, Sun, Chan, & Cheng, 2011). The literature also discusses the role that settlement agencies have in immigrant integration into the work force. This literature focuses on identifying barriers to employment (such as recognition of credentials, lack of Canadian work experience, and language barriers) and the resources needed to overcome these barriers (Kelly-Freake, 2007).
There is a wide literature discussing the different types of settlement organizations, whether they have charitable status and/or government funded (Couton, 2011; Campbell, 2004; Weiner, 2008). As stated, the main focus of the literature seems to be on how agencies work with newcomers and government; but there seems to be a gap in the literature regarding how settlement organizations work with employers. Hiebert (2009) discusses the role of settlement programs designed to help immigrants enter Canadian society as a vital element in the welcome accorded to newcomers. Programs include a range of supports including language training, basic orientation, host programs, and employment counseling, but are not necessarily designed to address the most pressing, heterogeneous, and complex needs of newcomers (Hiebert, 2009).

The Role of Successful Job Placement for Absorption and Integration of Newcomers

It is evident in the literature that employment is a critical component for the absorption and integration of newcomers (Galiev & Masoodi, 2012; Grenier & Xue, 2011; Lochhead, 2003). However, it is also one of the greatest challenges that immigrants can encounter in the settlement process (Statistics Canada, 2005). In fact, the literature points to the first year as being the most critical for newcomers in terms of attaining employment in their intended occupation (Frank, 2013; Grenier & Xue, 2011). Statistics Canada’s (2005) findings indicate that “six months after their arrival most immigrants had tried to enter the labour market; of those 44% were employed and 26% unemployed” (p. 72). With that being said, the literature also suggests that over a time span of generally ten years, newcomers will have either attained employment stability or be employed in their intended occupation or the equivalent to (Godin & Renaud, 2005; Plante, 2011).

Nonetheless, there were varying views on the measurement of “success” in relation to integration into the labour market. Plante’s (2011) assessment is based on two employment outcomes, namely: an immigrant being employed in their field of study or that of a similar occupation; and earning at a rate that is at or above the national median earnings within the immigrant’s field of study or that of a similar occupation. For Grenier and Xue (2011), successful integration is the outcome of connecting skills with labour market demand. Finally, Frank (2013) views the attainment of successful employment by immigrants with respect to “the rate at which they obtain employment matching the pre-migration or intended occupations stated on their applications for immigration” (p. 77). Factors that involve human capital such as education level, language proficiency, and pre-migration work experience are critical in determining employment outcomes for immigrants (Frank, 2013; Grenier & Xue, 2011). Furthermore, other determinants are also important to note such as sex, age, marital status, having children, location, and belonging to a visible minority group. Plante (2011) states:

Being male, not being a member of a visible minority group, living in a married or common-law relationship, having pre-school children, and living in population centres also figured among the characters and determinants more closely associated with a ‘positive’ integration of full-time full-year paid workers in the Canadian labour market (p. 60).
Interestingly, research studies indicate that working in either a professional or non-professional occupation makes a difference for employment integration in that immigrants who seek lower skilled jobs enter the workforce more quickly than those trying to obtain work in a highly skilled field (Grenier & Xue, 2011; Statistics Canada, 2005). As for the challenges that immigrants encounter obtaining a job in their occupational field, Statistics Canada (2005) states that the “lack of Canadian job experience, lack of foreign credentials recognition or work experience, and lack of knowledge of at least one official language were among the most serious cited problems or difficulties reported” (p. 73). These challenges reported by Statistics Canada (2005) are prevalent issues in the literature. Galiev and Masoodi (2012) provide recommendations for better integrating newcomers into the labour market, including: creating and implementing policies that are understood by those they are intended for, namely immigrants; mounting educational initiatives that provide information on employment integration to new immigrants; and creating programs and/or initiatives that provide opportunities for newcomers to gain Canadian work experience. Kazemipur and Nakhaie (2013) consider immigrants’ integration as a dynamic process that is determined by the nature of the interaction between immigrants and the host society, and argue that immigrants’ fluctuating attachment to Canada is a result of changes in their economic statuses. It is clear that job placement is critical for the absorption and integration of newcomers.

Supply and Demand of Skills for the Labour Market

The literature focusing on the demand for skills mainly discusses labour shortages in regards to their negative impact on economic growth. Employers’ perspectives on the skills shortage is explained in part as a reflection of jobs that non-foreign workers are not willing to do (Schwartzman, 2009). Schwartzman (2009) also argues that labour conflict or current labour agitation by workers has led employers to fill positions with foreign workers. However, there are different scenarios for skilled and semi-skilled workers in the literature. For example, Hennebry and Preibisch (2012) examine the Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP) where there is an immense worker supply in areas like Latin America. Hennebry and Preibisch (2012) use the SAWP as an example of how the agricultural sector needs a larger workforce for short periods, which cannot be filled from domestic sources. Huff (2009) argues that there is a mass skills shortage that has led to the importation of a larger Hispanic workforce to fill gaps. In comparison, analyses of migration in connection with the sciences, technology, engineering, and math (STEM), focused on issues of attraction and retention of highly-skilled immigrants in order to remain competitive in the national and global contexts (Pekkala Kerr & Kerr, 2013).

The demand for skilled foreign workers by developed countries was a central topic of much of the research that was examined, whereby continued economic growth was associated with immigration to boost the domestic labour force. This was made necessary by declining birth rates and aging populations (Azmier, 2005). Like many western countries, the United Kingdom has a demand for foreign skilled workers. It has been projected that by 2014 there will be over 730,000 new high-skilled positions to be filled in science and technology fields; however, due to a decline of graduates in these fields, employers have encountered challenges in recruiting and hiring for existing high-skilled positions, and therefore have had to address this gap by recruiting from other countries such as India and China (“Skills search”, 2008).
Hjerm (2004) studied the different labour outcomes for immigrant entrepreneurs versus all immigrants. The study found that immigrant entrepreneurs had lower incomes than their counterparts. The report by Yssaad (2012) indicates that most of the growth in immigrant employment in 2010-2011 occurred in the health and social assistance sectors, as well as in information, culture, and recreation services sectors. Yssaad (2012) further breaks down the highlights of the research on labour outcomes by demographics. Another significant report by Zietsma (2010) examines 2006 labour market outcomes for immigrants by province, region, census metropolitan area, sex, selected age-sex group, and educational attainment. The report also looks at immigrant employment by industry and occupation (Zietsma, 2010).

Lowell and Kemper (2004) discuss the shortage of healthcare workers from physicians to nurses’ aides, which has not been addressed by current policies. However, Alberta was mentioned in many newspaper articles to be expanding residency spots and investing in support programs to address medical labour shortages (Tumilty, 2008). Internationally Educated Nurses (IEN) are mentioned in many publications as a solution to nursing shortages, and were aimed at educating employers on how to better recruit and integrate IENs (Roth, 2012).

Practices and/or Policies for Absorption and Integration of Newcomers

In the literature reviewed, there are a number of practices and/or policies for the absorption and integration of newcomers. It is widely recognized that Canada’s national and provincial policies designed to help immigrants integrate along with a significant unionized labour force where workers enjoy strong labour protections and social protection benefits (Lowell & Kemper, 2004). Many studies underline that learning the ‘host country’ language is an important aspect of immigrants’ integration into the labour market, and that good knowledge of the ‘host country’ language is correlated with higher income from work (Delander, Hammarstedt, Månsson, & Nyberg, 2005). Recommended solutions include better access to language training adapted to the workplace, access to mentoring programs, the availability of financial assistance programs, job-related training, and a community-based strategy to address barriers to employment (Adey, 2007; Liebig, 2007; Park, 2011).

In Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries, mentorship programs are increasingly popular among integration measures to facilitate access to networks and provide knowledge about the functioning of the labour market (Liebig, 2007). Employers identify supports and solutions, including mentoring programs, employment equity and diversity initiatives; in-house expertise in workplace acculturation; proactively supporting immigrants to attend networking opportunities; opportunities for cross-cultural training; and additional supports such as student visa processes, information portals for hiring immigrants and a pre-security clearance qualification program (Adey, 2007; Venture Kamloops and Service Canada, 2007). Employer councils can also be used to champion the integration of skilled immigrants into the labour force (Adey, 2007).

Social capital and social networks in ethno-cultural communities provide psychosocial support with immediate friends and family, as well as helping newcomers acquire the requisite skills and
resources needed to join the economic mainstream progressively (Ngo & Este, 2006). In interviews conducted with employers, the importance of personal networks was confirmed for the hiring of immigrant care workers, whereby employers inform current employees about available positions and referrals come by word of mouth for jobs within their homes or care centres (Atanackovic & Bourgeault, 2013).

Service providers create opportunities that bring immigrant professionals and employers together for dialogue and learning (Ngo & Este, 2006). Immigrant settlement agencies assist with the absorption and integration of newcomers by providing local perspectives on employment, wage standards, working conditions and labour market trends, and assisting newcomers with finding suitable pathways through the Canadian job search process (Kelly-Freake, 2007). Local partnerships, working groups, and organizations that work together to tackle barriers use social marketing campaigns to promote greater understanding of the social and economic value of immigrants. The ability to build strategic alliances is particularly important in small cities (Kelly-Freake, 2007). In Australia, research on the integration and retention of medical graduates in rural communities shows a need to fully appreciate the context-specific factors influencing professional and social integration in smaller communities (Han & Humphreys, 2006). This entails a more holistic approach rather than a “one-size-fits all” policy (Han & Humphreys, 2006). In Northern Ontario, a partnership between the Timmins Economic Development Corp. (TEDC) and Progress Career Planning Institute (PCPI) consider ethnocultural communities as a “built-in cultural network” that fosters a sense of connectedness in a smaller community context that lacks some of the amenities and services available in larger urban centres (Stewart, 2008).

Canada’s TFW stream includes seasonal agricultural worker program, live-in caregiver program, and temporary foreign workers, including high-skilled workers. In recent years, the dramatic rise in the number of temporary foreign workers compared to permanent residents is apparent. For decades, the United Food and Commercial Workers Union has established temporary worker centres that provide workers with language services and skills training, advocated for better wage and working conditions, and negotiate with employers to provide workplace ESL training, housing, transportation and community integration supports, as well as a pathway to permanent residency status via collective agreement negotiations (Flecker, 2010). The United Steel Workers, working with Migrante Ontario, established the first Independent Homeworkers Association for the mostly female temporary workers who arrive under the Live-in Caregiver program, providing subsidized access to dental care and financial and telecom services to help connect the workers with their families back home (Flecker, 2010).

The perspectives of employers are often overlooked despite their central role in importing labour (Rodriguez, 2004). “Immigrant employment programs tend to be project-based, ad hoc, or piecemeal initiatives with limited time frames” (Adey, 2007, p. 120). The most common barriers encountered by immigrants include lack of Canadian work experience, lack of information about available programs and services, lack of employer contacts and networking opportunities, barriers related to licensing and accreditation, lack of knowledge of local labour market information and employment opportunities, and difficulty accessing language and technical skills upgrading programs and the expense associated with bridging and training programs (Adey, 2007).
The next section of the report will share the finding from the online literature synthesis.

**Part Two: Online Literature Synthesis**

The online literature review was run using Google as a search engine and identifying particularly useful and relevant portals based on recurring sources of interest. Search terms used include: immigrant, newcomer, employ, labour market demands, economic integration, economic outcomes, integration, employment tools, best practices, strategies, hire, mentorship and employer attitudes. All searches were conducted within webpages from Canada. The initial search collected 61 different sources, the majority of them grey literature with some academic articles. Two community based practitioners reviewed the materials using the developed literature checklist and determined that 34 of the documents from the initial search were pertinent to the research question.

The second part of the report will present the results and outcomes of the synthesis drawing from the relevant online literature using six themes:

1) Promising practices and solutions to better integrate newcomers
2) Immigration-related policy impacts
3) Supply and demand
4) Employers and gaps in services
5) Gaps in the employers’ perspective
6) Employers’ motivation vs. value-proposition for hiring

These have been reviewed in depth and the findings are presented here.

**Promising Practices and Solutions to Better Integrate Newcomers**

Due to the similar nature of these two themes, they tended to occur in tandem over 90% of the time; therefore, the main findings identified in these themes are presented together. Approximately 68% of the relevant online literature that was reviewed fell under these two themes. There were a number of common practices and solutions that emerged.

The most prevalent were:

- The importance of mentoring and internships as a tool for successful labour market integration (Fester, McKitrick & Amyot, 2010; Toronto Region Immigrant Employment Council [TRIEC], 2008; CIC, 2012; Weiner, 2008; Hawthorne, 2008; Bamford, 2003; ALLIES & Accenture, 2013);
• Helping immigrants and their families overcome obstacles in all areas of life while also providing targeted employment and business start-up assistance (Maytree Foundation, 2004; Wayland, & Goldberg, 2010; Bamford, 2003);

• The development of cross-cutting partnerships and strategies that engage multiple stakeholders in overcoming/addressing barriers (The Maytree Foundation, 2004; Thomson, n.d.; Rai, 2013; Ontario Ministry of Finance [OMF], 2010; CIC, 2012; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Weiner, 2008; London-Middlesex Immigrant Employment Council [LMIEC], n.d.); and


Additionally, it was identified that bridging programs and language training are critical to seamless integration (TRIEC, 2008; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Weiner, 2008; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Alexander, Burleton, & Fong, 2012; Bamford, 2003; ALLIES, 2013).

There is a need for greater concern with organizational policies, standards, and practices regarding diversity and discrimination in the workplace, such as:

• Implementing equal opportunity employment programs;

• Providing employee multicultural and diversity awareness training; and

• Developing policies to address discrimination in the workplace (Thomson, n.d.; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Weiner, 2008; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Bamford, 2003; ALLIES, 2013).

The most commonly cited barrier to successful labour market integration for skilled immigrants is the requirement of Canadian work experience and a lack of appreciation of foreign credentials (Fester, McKitrick, & Amyot, 2010; Rai, 2013; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; LMIEC, n.d.; Bamford, 2003).

Immigration-related Policy Impacts

How immigration policies and programs impact the supply and development of skills was another common theme found within the online literature identified in more than 47% of the reviewed resources. Immigration has become increasingly recognized as a necessary policy component to a competitive and dynamic economy, particularly among advanced nations (Rai, 2013; Weiner, 2008; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Alexander et al., 2012). Because of this, there is a call for more flexible migration policies that help configure immigration to regional and local needs through specially designed and targeted attraction and retention policies (Maytree Foundation, 2004; Rai, 2013; CIC, 2012; Bamford, 2003; Liu, 2006).
In the literature one of the most prevalent changes identified in the immigration program has been a switch in source countries from European immigrants to less traditional countries of origin. This is explained in part due to a more competitive global labour market as well as Canada’s policy shifts to attract higher educated, skilled workers (CIC, 2012; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Alexander et al., 2012; Bamford, 2003). Additionally, they face greater wage gaps and take longer to achieve economic integration than immigrants from traditional source countries (Lo, Preston, Wang, Reil, Harvey, & Siu, 2001; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Weiner, 2008; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Statistics Canada, 2008; Liu, 2006). This shift in source countries and the greater focus on human capital characteristics has meant that language skills, higher education and adaptability are now more important issues than they have been in the past (Rai, 2013; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Weiner, 2008; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Alexander et al., 2012; Bamford, 2003). Since the mid to late eighties these changes created new service challenges and better coordination in available services has been identified as key for supporting the successful integration of newcomers (Fester et al., 2010; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Wayland & Goldberg, 2010; Alexander et al., 2012; Bamford, 2003).

Supply and Demand

Just over 35% of the online articles discussed the supply and demand of skills for the Canadian labour market. While most of the resources did not discuss the specific needs of the labour market, it was noted on many occasions that low birth rates and an aging population are slowing the growth of the labour force. As a result, it is essential that newcomers work to their full potential, which requires that immigrants are fully integrated into the labour market (Fester et al., 2010; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Statistics Canada, 2008; Kukushkin & Watt, 2009). While Canada has done a great job of attracting foreign skilled workers, successfully integrating them into the labour market in recent years has been more challenging (Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Alexander et al., 2012). Much of the literature on supply and demand discusses a skills mismatch (CIC, 2012; Hawthorne, 2008; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Liu, 2006; Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2013). Better alignment of policies, programs and processes with current labour market demands would resolve these issues (CIC, 2012; Alexander et al., 2012). “Strategic workforce management and skills development is ongoing when jobs and required skills are continuously shifting to reflect changes in business, technology and customer expectations” (Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 2013, p. 22). Additionally, granting provinces more control over the composition and level of immigration in their geographic regions has proven to be successful as they have differing labour market needs (Rai, 2013; LMIEC, n.d.; Alexander et al., 2012).

Employers and Gaps in Services

Service providers need to work with employers in order to recognize and value immigrants’ skills (LMIEC, n.d.; Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011; Alexander et al., 2012; Bamford, 2003; Liu,
For example, credential recognition services are not well known among employers, and as a result many employers discount internationally educated applicants because they are unable to assess their credentials (Dejardins & Cornelson, 2011).

A multitude of language services are available across the country, and it can be very challenging for employers – and immigrants – to assess their credibility or effectiveness in advance (Alexander et al., 2012; Bamford, 2003; Liu, 2006). Greater employer participation in employment and training services is needed and could help to alleviate some of these barriers (Ontario Chamber of Commerce [OCC], n.d.). It is suggested that better promotion of available services is necessary, but also that immigrants – and the employers they work for – require additional services beyond general settlement to help evaluate credentials, assess licenses and other targeted employment programs (LMIEC, n.d.; Liu, 2006). Additionally, there is debate about the role that funding plays in this process. Some assert that there is a lack of funding, but others say that adequate funding is available and that inadequate targeting, and coordination in the planning, development, and delivery of labour market services and programs that are at fault. Either way, the gaps and barriers for immigrants have a direct impact on their labour market experiences and on the ability of employers to maximize the use of human capital (Fester et al., 2010; Mulholland & Biles, 2004; Liu, 2006).

Gaps in the Employers’ Perspective

The most prevalent gap identified in the online literature is the perspective of employers and their role. While this information is starting to become more available, it is unclear whether the lack of information is due to the researchers failure to engage employers, or if the employers themselves are apathetic. There is an abundance of online resources available to employers about the value of diversifying their workforce and successfully integrating newcomers into the workplace, but the advice is not usually framed from an employer perspective. Although it is noted that there is an important role for employers to play in the overall integration and settlement of newcomers, information on what that role really looks like is discussed in less than 25% of the relevant literature. As a result, with no employer involvement and input in the matter the majority of employers may not be taking on a role in the greater settlement process despite an identified need for them to do so.

The Immigrant Employment Council of BC (2012) commissioned an independent study to consult with employers throughout BC to obtain their views and advice on needs and solutions regarding hiring and retaining immigrants in their workforces. The final report outlines a number of implications for employers:

1. Employers need to play a leadership role in improving immigrant employment; their involvement in developing workforce solutions is critical to the successful integration of immigrants. The immigrant employment system – labour supply and demand generally – needs to be balanced by programs and resources that are employer-facing, not merely immigrant-facing.
2. Employers are challenged by the myriad of services and service providers, resulting in confusion and a low level of awareness. SMEs in particular do not have the resources or patience to navigate the systems for relevant information and services; nor the ability to work with multiple service providers.

3. Employers have a critical need for concrete solutions and outcomes – tools, resources, and information – that will help them attract, hire and keep skilled immigrants. They are increasingly aware of immigrants being an important part of the solution, but many employers do not know where to start or how to connect with the solutions.

4. Employers are frustrated, feeling they do not have a voice or a role in addressing the workforce challenges they face. They do not want more discussion or consultation; they want a role in developing on-the-ground strategies that lead to action (IECBC, 2012, p. 26).

The report validates a focus on employers to create and champion solutions to address the needs of employers, in order to meet the macro end goal of integrating more skilled immigrants into the workforce.

Employers’ Motivation and Value-Proposition for Hiring

The online literature clearly articulates a number of motivations and value-propositions for hiring newcomers and foreign workers. There is, however, minimal discussion about how employers can help with newcomers’ social and economic integration. This assistance could include supporting educational/licencing exams (financially, with time off/flexible scheduling, etc.); supporting language training initiatives (whether onsite or within the community); developing/engaging in community-based mentorship programs; and working with local settlement agencies to support the integration of the employee’s family (Welsh, 2012). Some of the common motivators that were identified include increased sales revenue; higher customer numbers; the ability to provide service in multiple languages; access to diverse local and global markets; increased competitiveness; and alleviating a labour/skills shortage (Welsh, 2012).

The Immigrant Employment Council of BC (2012) commissioned an independent study to consult with employers throughout BC to obtain their views and advice on needs and solutions regarding hiring and retaining immigrants in their workforces.

In the final report it is stated:

Most employers have bought into the value proposition for immigrant hiring but do not know how to navigate the plethora of information and resources. “One-stop” resources and effective packaging and distribution of information to employers are critical – resources and packaging must be user-friendly and accessible (p. 10).
Immigrant service providers are funded by governments to serve thousands of immigrants each year including delivering or managing training and employment programs and services. While some employers appreciate the work of immigrant service providers, they would like to see more focused employer services (i.e., translation of transcripts, assessment of credentials, work English, orientation to the world of work and specific industries, etc.) and better outreach from service agencies to employers and industry associations. Employers identified a current disconnect that needs to be bridged, and services and agencies need to be better coordinated if service providers are to play a pivotal role in enhancing employers’ capacity to hire and retain immigrant talent.
Further Research

The synthesis found a lack of evidence of employer engagement in the provision of settlement services, notwithstanding the substantial employer stake in hiring and optimizing immigrant workers. This suggests underinvestment by small and medium enterprises (SMEs) and larger companies in incorporating immigrants into the labour market. Employer involvement in settlement has not been extensively or systematically studied, and there has been no attempt to carefully analyze and disseminate best practices in this field.

Research is needed to better understand the perspectives and experiences of employers in fostering meaningful employment, immigrant settlement, and economic and social integration of newcomers in Canada. In reviewing the academic and grey literature, it is evident that there is a knowledge gap in understanding employers’ role in social and economic integration. As Crawford (2007) notes, “[m]eaningful employment allows new immigrants to become active, contributing community members, shifting the focus from social and economic support to social and economic benefit” (p. 4). Therefore, it is critical to better understand how employers and employer organizations, particularly the former, foster meaningful employment and settlement for immigrants. Further research could explore the employer’s perspective on how they help in the absorption and integration of immigrants and what benefits or challenges are faced by the employer in this process.

Research on good practices by leading employers and by small and medium employers should be undertaken to share successful immigrant employment practices that can be of value to other employers (ALLIES, 2013).

Immigrant employment councils, community organizations, government and other stakeholders must look to employer leaders for meaningful immigrant employment solutions in urban and small city contexts. Future research should consider a scan of these solutions from the perspectives of employers.

Research is needed to better understand how decent work (‘good jobs’) and decent employment that provide living wages, benefits, and social protection mechanisms can be made available to more workers in the mainstream market and in immigrant communities.

Research is needed to identify what additional supports are required for newcomers to find and retain employment in diverse labour market contexts. New knowledge is necessary to identify initiatives, tools, supports, and promising practices developed and implemented by large corporations and Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) from their perspectives.

Research is needed on employer-initiated programs aimed at helping employees and their families to settle, as well as promoting a more receptive local environment. Employers’ role vis-à-vis newcomers’ families has yet to be considered.
Appendix A

A1: Results from the Promising Literature

Appendix A1 provides a breakdown of the results for initially identified promising literature retrieved from searches in library article databases, Internet search engines, and sent from employers, employer organizations, and settlement agencies. Note that “online literature” is used to refer to web documents retrieved from Internet search engines such as Google.
Appendix A2 illustrates the results of the first screening phase that included reviewing titles and abstracts of documents to determine eligibility regarding inclusion or exclusion. Note that “online literature” is used to refer to web documents retrieved from Internet search engines such as Google.
### A3: Number of Documents and Identified Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literature</th>
<th>Theme 1</th>
<th>Theme 2</th>
<th>Theme 3</th>
<th>Theme 4</th>
<th>Theme 5</th>
<th>Theme 6</th>
<th>Theme 7</th>
<th>Theme 8</th>
<th>Theme 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer-Reviewed</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grey/Popular</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix A3 illustrates results from the first screening phase in which potential themes were identified by reviewing promising documents’ titles and abstracts.

*Theme 1*: Supply and demand of skills for the labour market  
*Theme 2*: Employer and/or employer organization’s role in absorption and integration of newcomers  
*Theme 3*: Impact of immigration-related policies and programs on supply and development of skills  
*Theme 4*: Employer’s ‘value-proposition’ for hiring newcomers  
*Theme 5*: Employer’s motivation for hiring newcomers  
*Theme 6*: Employer’s strategies, tools and resources for assisting economic and social integration  
*Theme 7*: Promising practices and/or policies for absorption and integration of newcomers  
*Theme 8*: Settlement agency’s role in shaping employer behaviour and efforts in settlement activities  
*Theme 9*: Employer’s role vis-à-vis workers’ families  
*Theme 10*: Employer’s use of immigrant flows to accelerate labour market absorption  
*Theme 11*: Employer’s perspective on skills shortage  
*Theme 12*: The role of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers  
*Theme 13*: Employer’s perspectives on hiring newcomers or temporary foreign workers  
*Theme 14*: Gaps or barriers between community services and employers  
*Theme 15*: Labour market skills implementation from employer perspective  
*Theme 16*: Knowledge of employer capacity and practices for assisting in newcomer settlement  
*Theme 17*: Solutions to better integrate skilled immigrants in labour market  
*Theme 18*: Key components and specific gaps found in previous research
Appendix B

Criteria for Inclusion/Exclusion Sheet

First Author Last Name:

First 4 words of Title:

Is the paper a Systematic Review? □ Yes □ No

□ Quantitative Only □ Qualitative Only □ Mixed □ Best-evidence synthesis □ Meta-analyses

□ Grey literature (please describe ________________________________).

Is it focused on the supply and demand of skills for the future labour market? □ Yes □ No

Is the role of employers and/or employer organizations in bridging newcomers’ absorption and integration considered? □ Yes □ No

Is it relevant to Northern and/or small and remote communities? □ Yes □ No

Is it relevant to Francophone minority communities? □ Yes □ No

Literature Themes: Must be directed at one or more of the following themes (Please tick all that apply):

□ supply and demand of skills for the labour market
□ employer and/or employer organization’s role in absorption and integration of newcomers
□ impact of immigration-related policies and programs on supply and development of skills
□ employer’s ‘value-proposition’ for hiring newcomers
□ employer’s motivation for hiring newcomers
□ employer’s strategies, tools and resources for assisting economic and social integration
□ promising practices and/or policies for absorption and integration of newcomers
□ settlement agency’s role in shaping employer behaviour and efforts in settlement activities
□ employer’s role vis-à-vis workers’ families
□ employer’s use of immigrant flows to accelerate labour market absorption
□ employer’s perspective on skills shortage
□ the role of successful job placement for absorption and integration of newcomers
□ employer’s perspective on hiring newcomers or temporary foreign workers

□ gaps or barriers between community services and employers
□ labour market skills implementation from employer perspective
□ knowledge of employer capacity and practices for assisting in newcomer settlement
□ solutions to better integrate skilled immigrants in labour market
□ key components and specific gaps found in previous research
□ other(s) (please describe)

______________________________________
______________________________________
______________________________________
Outcomes: [Must address one of the following]

☐ identified the skills, competencies and attributes needed in the current labour market.
☐ championed solutions to better integrate skilled immigrants in the labour market.
☐ documented employer-related strategies, tools, resources and effective best practices to assist in recruiting, hiring, re-visioning, integrating and retaining immigrant skilled workers.
☐ provided employer insights into the labour market to inform strategic planning and development of services and resources.
☐ unsure (please describe outcome______________________________________________).

Exclusion criteria: Not directly relevant to the research topic; quality of methodology; theoretical adequacy; or other.

Primary Reason for Exclusion:

NOTES:
Appendix C

Key Documents

Key documents were identified from the peer-reviewed, grey/popular, and online literature found through article database and search engines searches contributed by stakeholders such as employers, employer councils, and settlement agencies. These documents provide pertinent information and perspectives for consideration regarding the topic of the role of employer and employer organizations in newcomer’s economic and social integration.

Peer-Reviewed, Grey/Popular, and Online Literature


**Stakeholder Literature**


Appendix D

References


Derwing, T., & Krahn, H. (2008). Attracting and retaining immigrants outside the metropolis: Is the pie too small for everyone to have a piece? The case of Edmonton, Alberta. Journal


Grant, P. R. (2007). Accessing the higher echelons of a host country's labour market: Policy directions from the personal experiences of skilled immigrants. Journal of International Migration and Integration, 8(2), 135-139. doi: 10.1007/s12134-007-0021-0


Appendix E

Annotated Bibliography


Gives examples from Alberta employers on how to retain and engage a highly motivated and diverse workforce.


Provides an update on the implementation progress of a Foreign Qualification Recognition Plan for Alberta (FQR Plan). Includes highlights and recent accomplishments in specialized information comprehension, assessment standards and resources, and bridging gaps regarding qualifications and set standards in the workplace, educational institutions, and professional organizations. Also sets future priorities.


Reviews research from the Internationally Trained Workers Partnership (ITWP) and examines the barriers to employment for foreign-trained workers from both immigrant and employer perspectives.


Contends that the federal government could put the equivalent of 370,000 more people to work if it modified the immigration system to focus on the job market’s long-term needs.


Reviews how Manitoba’s *Worker Recruitment and Protection Act* is being used to recruit and protect foreign workers. Identifies some of the challenges that the regulatory framework does not address and how it is hoped that a new Letter of Understanding (LOU) to exchange information and strengthen protections for TFWs will alleviate these challenges.


Highlights the successful practices used by employers, such as credential recognition, mentoring, professional upgrading, language training, and developing community
partnerships. Based on an analysis of the immigrant employment practices of winning employers for the Best Employers for New Canadian Awards in 2011 and 2012.


Uses a case study of regional Australian employers to examine how organization-based factors influence an employer’s screening and recruitment of immigrant professionals. Reviews some of the key factors which can influence employers, including organizational size, type, resource availability, ethnic diversity of clients, level of role criticalness, industry-based culture, and management style. Findings indicate that employers are not primarily driven by a human capital lens during the recruitment process.


Reviews the transition experiences of 20 successful Chinese immigrants. Focuses on their transition stories and what facilitated and hindered their transition. Identifies four major categories for successful transition: having a positive attitude and personality, skills and resource development, education and work experience, and community and family support. Also identifies some of the common problems that hindered transition. Discusses the immigrants’ perspective about the effectiveness of the employment counseling process.


Examines the employment and recruitment of immigrant care workers in Canada’s older adult care sector. Based on data from interviews with 77 workers and 24 employers in care settings and on the results from 149 online employer surveys conducted in 2007-08. Findings indicate that workers largely enter this sector through social networks rather than through recruitment agencies, that regulation is needed to prevent instances of abuse, and that immigration admission policies could be better aligned with Canada's needs for older adult care.


Studies the efficacy of immigrant selection based on skill requirements in the Canadian context. Findings indicate that the “point system” results in the selection of applicants with much higher skill levels than would otherwise be achieved by family preferences. However, immigrants who are admitted for their skill levels do not necessarily perform better in the labour market and factors used to assess admissibility have very limited ability to predict short-term labor market success.

Identifies the immigration trends and challenges in Western Canada, specifically in Regina and Vancouver. Identifies that although Canada's immigration levels remain high, immigration activity to the West has been declining over the past twenty years, although this trend seems to be reversing. Nevertheless, the West's share of immigrants remains below its share of the population. Emphasizes that extended periods of proportionately light immigration will impact labour force needs and the region’s capacity to attract more immigrants and the challenges that the West faces in trying to fill these shortages.


Examines the ways in which constraints posed by the terms and conditions of funding limit how immigrant-serving agencies can innovate, fulfil their mission, and provide the continuum of settlement services needed to meet the needs of immigrants and to maximize settlement. Recommends policy changes that could result in the consistent provision of comparable services across the country, which could help smaller centres and all regions benefit from immigration, and could help more Francophones immigrate successfully.


Examines the experiences of internationally educated physicians, nurses, and midwives who were pursuing professional integration, both those who achieved this goal and those who decided to redirect their efforts in other directions. Assesses the barriers and facilitators that they feel have influenced their success at becoming integrated into provincial health care systems in Canada. Makes recommendations for changes to policies and programs.


Examines how immigration may be used to tackle the problem of labour shortages. Outlines the results of a CFIB membership survey about this topic. Includes a background review, immigration statistics, and detailed information gathered from discussions with experts in the field, government officials, immigration consultants and business owners themselves.


Identifies “best practice” patterns in the fields of human resource management, adult education, and training and development to illustrate the complexity of providing workplace ESL and assisting in the integration of immigrant workers.
Discusses Capacity Canada's national review of initiatives related to access to professions and trades (commonly referred to as APT processes). The review was designed to help Capacity Canada better understand APT processes and to determine the next steps needed to improve them across Canada. While recognizing that each APT process across the country has distinct considerations, these processes are components within the larger framework of immigrant employment, and having an awareness of this overall framework will guide the work of Capacity Canada to ensure comprehensive and workable solutions.

Outlines the objectives, target groups, activities, resources, innovations, barriers, solutions/keys to success, outcomes, impact and benefits, and use as a model of Skills for Change (SfC), a non-profit organization in the Greater Toronto Area specializing in the development and delivery of sector-specific employment preparation programs for highly skilled new immigrants. SfC provides supports and eases labour market integration of skilled immigrants through mentoring, professional partnerships, and skills, technology, language and career training.

Discusses the recent policy shift in which Canada has been increasingly relying on temporary migrant workers to fill labour shortages. Reviews the Canadian Experience Class (CEC), which offers temporary migrant workers the possibility of permanent residence based on "skilled" work experience. A significant proportion of the Canadian migrant workforce are "lowerskilled" workers and, in some cases, temporary workers are filling permanent labour shortages. Questions why these needed workers are not given access to permanent residence.

Provides a brief analysis of Canada’s immigrant policy and considers the economic and social impact on immigrants and the nation by examining newcomer demographics, settlement patterns, language, education, employment, earnings, and services such as public transit as well as considering immigrant policy-related issues.

Reviews how Canada's skills and labour shortages are affecting members of the Canadian Chamber of Commerce. Identifies key emerging issues and proposes an action for plan for the business community, governments, the educational sector, and other stakeholders.


Concentrates on the employer’s role in training existing talent and portrays the views of HR executives, employers, and educators relating to customizing education for employers, apprenticeships, planning for reskilling and redeployment, youth job-readiness training, and the demand for soft skills.


Presents the results of a series of roundtables in five of Canada’s “second-tier” cities (i.e., Fredericton, Hamilton, Victoria, Saskatoon, and Windsor), which were held to consult with local and regional stakeholders on integrating immigrants into the workforce, to elicit local perspectives on possible solutions to the labour market integrations challenges facing immigrants, and to learn about local initiatives. Provides an overview of the main immigration trends and issues which were common to all five cities, and identifies the immigration-related issues and challenges which were specific to each location.


Provides an overview of the provincial nominee programs (PNPs). Reviews their use by various provinces and describes the programs’ objectives and operations. Uses Manitoba as a case study to evaluate the program’s potential to meet the goals of attracting, retaining, and integrating immigrants into smaller centres and provinces by examining retention rates, labour market outcomes, and other measures of social integration to determine whether Manitoba’s program has been effective in identifying immigrants who will remain within the province and successfully integrate into the communities’ economic and social life. Describes how the program and immigration policy in general differ between Manitoba and the other provinces, and discusses the data's potential implications regarding immigration policy at both the provincial and federal levels.


Using the U.S. 2000 Census, examines the determinants of occupational attainment and the impact of occupation on earning among foreign-born men. Identifies that years of schooling and proficiency in English are key factors in determining access to high-paying
occupations among immigrants. Finds that, due to the limited international transferability of skills acquired on the job, foreign labor market experience has a negative impact on current occupational status, especially among those in high-status jobs.

Provides an access point for more information about federal programs to hire foreign workers, including temporary workers, live-in caregivers, international students, permanent students, and interns.

Provides a summary of feedback from Citizenship and Immigration Canada’s (CIC) roundtable meetings in Ottawa, Toronto, Calgary, Vancouver, Winnipeg, Halifax, and St. John’s with Canadian employers about using an Expression of Interest (EOI) application system to create a pool of skilled workers ready to begin employment in Canada. Meetings were held to discuss how such a system could help meet employer needs.

Reviews some of the relevant CIC programs and new initiatives regarding concerns about the language proficiency of new Canadians and reviews proposed solutions to administrative barriers for skilled trades and foreign educational credentials. Discusses the proposed Expression of Interest (EOI) initiative.

Measures the impact of income, unemployment, and self-employment on immigrant social structures and in the settlement and adaptation of immigrants in host countries, including Canada. Data is drawn from administrative data collected by the Canadian government on three census labour market variables: income, unemployment, and self-employment. Finds that organizational density is positively associated with self-employment and negatively associated with income and unemployment.

Describes the process to create a mentorship program for internationally trained professionals in Ontario’s Niagara region. Identifies the program’s objectives, challenges, and solutions to those challenges.

Explores the gendered processes that produce weak economic integration in Canada, based on interviews with well-educated men and women who migrated from countries in sub-Saharan Africa. Identifies four policy implications that should be considered: the efficacy of Canadian immigration policies that prioritize the recruitment of well-educated immigrants without addressing the multiple barriers that result in deskilling; government policies and settlement practices that undermine more equitable economic integration of immigrants; the importance of tackling the "everyday racism" that immigrants experience in the Canadian labour market; and the need to re-think narrowly defined notions of economic integration in light of the gendered nature of contemporary labour markets, and immigrants' own definitions of what constitutes meaningful integration.


Describes the experiences of a recent influx of African-born Francophones to Alberta.


Describes the increasing size of the immigrant employment and wage gap in Canada over the past 30 years. Suggests that the gaps may be due to both genuine skill differences between immigrants and Canadian-born workers, and labour market inefficiencies preventing immigrants from making full use of their skills. Recommends that extensive language training, faster credential recognition, and other integration initiatives may help to alleviate this gap. Also suggests the need for more rigorous evaluation of existing programs to help understand why gaps persist and how to address them.


Evaluates a Swedish pilot project to help unemployed immigrants with weak Swedish-language skills by sandwiching work-oriented language teaching with practical workplace training to enhance the employability of project participants and to alert them to available training and further education opportunities. Participation in the pilot project resulted in much speedier transfers from unemployment to employment, training, and education.


Describes the results of study commissioned by the City of Edmonton to determine how to attract more immigrants and discusses the report’s attraction and retention
recommendations. Given that the current federal government has no plans to increase immigration levels overall, different provinces and cities in Canada will be put in the position of having to compete for a relatively small number of newcomers. Discusses these challenges and concludes that without changes to federal policies, many communities may continue to struggle to attract immigrants.

Outlines the role that the Department of Canadian Heritage has played in addressing challenges related to the recognition of foreign credentials in the early 21st century. States that the problems related to foreign credential recognition are not simply labor market issues; they indicate Canada's "institutional openness" and acceptance of newcomers. Presents several community-based projects aimed at facilitating the recognition of foreign credentials.

Addresses how a social economy approach may provide better social and economic outcomes for immigrants, refugees, and cultural communities. Argues that, because of their goals to develop communities and support individuals, social economy organizations (i.e., non-profits, co-operatives, and collective social enterprises) should support the integration of immigrants and refugees.
Explores how the current policy environment supports/hinders settlement and integration efforts, the role of social capital in understanding settlement and integration, and knowledge about the role of enterprise development with immigrant and refugee communities. Examines the current academic and practitioner literature to establish the context of newcomer settlement, to review the current public policy environment, and to identify promising practices for settlement and integration.

Provides an in depth plan focusing on jobs and economic growth, specifically in the creation of jobs, ways to foster growth in the Canadian economy, and how to support long term prosperity through initiatives, programs and services.

Analyzes how the practices of employers and labour recruiters for migrant labour have shaped how migrant labour is sourced and used in the UK labour market, specifically in the rural agribusiness sector, and how labour migration channels have evolved since
2004. Based on in-depth interviews undertaken in four case study areas. Offers a new typology of recruitment/employment practices and a schema illustrating the changing spatial impacts of migration channels in areas of destination.

Describes Canada’s temporary foreign workers program (TFWP) as a means of creating a “flexible” workforce and outlines some of the challenges that temporary workers face.

Using longitudinal data, examines the rate at which recent immigrants to Canada obtain employment which matches their previous or intended occupations. Reviews the impact of socio-demographic factors such as visible minority status and area of residence and of human capital factors to influence the rate at which this cohort of immigrants obtains job matches. Finds that immigrants who seek high-status occupations obtain job matches at slower rates than those seeking lower-status occupations.

Investigates the consequences of different types of temporary employment (i.e., fixed-term or contract, casual, agency, and seasonal employment) for workers in Canada, using data from the 2002-2004 waves of Survey of Labour and Income Dynamics. Focuses on the intersection of gender, race, and immigrant status to capture the implications of inequality for temporary work. Highlights the importance of gender relations in shaping workers’ experience of insecurity in different types of temporary employment.

Argues that while language proficiency and cultural and social familiarity are essential tools for the integration of newcomers, integration cannot be achieved without immigrants reaching their professional goals first. Based on in-depth semi-structured interviews conducted individually and in focus groups with Alberta immigrants on their experiences within and outside of the Language Instruction for Newcomers to Canada (LINC) program.

Discusses a study regarding global flow of labor and talent by KPMG International which revealed that the supply of labour in major economies is expected to decrease significantly over the next decade, which will create challenges for business leaders and opportunities for the global workforce to migrate to understaffed countries for employment. The study predicts that selected countries in Africa, Latin America, and the Middle East will not face the same labor shortages.
Investigates whether new immigrants achieve stability in the labour market upon arrival in Quebec. Based on a longitudinal survey that describes the biographical trajectories of the Settlement of New Immigrants (SNI). The survey studied the attempts of 1,000 immigrants to establish themselves over a period of 10 years in the greater Montreal area. Demonstrates that although continuous sequences of employment are growing overtime, thus ensuring new immigrants greater stability in the labour market, racial discrimination also impacts labour market participation, particularly for natives of North Africa and the Middle East.

Grant, P. R. (2007). Accessing the higher echelons of a host country's labour market: Policy directions from the personal experiences of skilled immigrants. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 8*(2), 135-139. doi: 10.1007/s12134-007-0021-0
Discusses the various articles published in the journal issue. Contemplates the problem of skilled workers around the world as a part of the globalization process. Reviews the immigration restrictions in most countries, as well as discrimination based on gender and race, that may limit the movement of skilled workers around the globe. Offers solutions to develop a free exchange of labour in the world, such as the development of clear paths for skilled immigrants to obtain necessary qualification to be accepted by employers, the provision of supervised work skill gains, and the provision of language training.

Reviews the ambiguity of what a “skills shortage” means by discussing what employers mean when they say they face a “skill shortage” and how it affects not only the general perceptions about the adequacy of skills supplies, but also Britain’s policy formation. Aims to contribute to an increased understanding of employers’ perceptions of skills shortages in Britain using a simple statistical method and the Employer Manpower and Skills Practices Survey (EMSPS) to examine the factors underlying the employers’ experience of skills shortages, filling vacancies, and deficiencies in the qualities of their existing workforce to identify similarities and differences.

Examines the labour market outcomes of recent Canadian immigrants in terms of the duration until access to a first job in their intended occupation. Based on information on employment trajectory provided by the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada. Investigates the roles that factors related to human and social capital play in speeding up the matching process between actual and intended occupations. Findings indicate that the initial year in Canada is critical for an immigrant to land a job in the intended field; after that period, the hazards of finding employment in the intended occupation flatten down.
In general, those planning to work in nonprofessional jobs (e.g., sales, transport and equipment operators, primary industry, and processing and manufacturing occupations) tend to find the first job in their intended occupation more quickly. Education, English language ability, Canadian work experience, and friend networks also facilitate access to the intended occupation.


Reviews the recent changes to migration policy in Australia which affect the post-study work entitlements of international students studying at Australian universities and examines the underlying rationale and consequences of these changes. Examines the migration policies in the United States, United Kingdom, New Zealand, and Canada. Finds that the recent changes to skilled migration policy in Australia, along with bleak economic conditions in many key host countries, has opened up opportunities for Australia to re-position itself favourably.


Examines the relationship between knowledge of official languages by new immigrants and their chances of obtaining an appropriate job. Provides a profile of new immigrants during their first four years in Canada and examines their knowledge of official languages (OLs), language training, and the improvement of language skills. Also reviews their labour market status at six months, two years, and four years after their arrival in Canada. Contains an in-depth analysis of the effect of knowledge of official languages on five job characteristics used as indicators of what might be an appropriate job. Based on data from the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada (LSIC), which followed a cohort of immigrants over the course of their first four years in Canada.


Reviews a report that examines why the labour market in the US is struggling to retain foreign expertise, particularly in the science and technology sector as well as discusses alternative pathways to attract and retain skilled workers such as H-1B visas.


Identifies which factors may facilitate or inhibit the integration of international medical graduates (IMGs) into rural Australian communities and affect their intention to stay in rural practice. Based on 57 in-depth interviews with IMGs practicing in rural Victoria, Australia, findings indicate four different types of IMGs: “satellite operators” (city-oriented); “fence-sitters” (affiliated with city fringe areas); the “ambivalent” (unsure about their future settlement place); and those “integrated” into rural communities. This
typology may help target better support and incentives to increase IMG rural retention rates towards those doctors most likely to remain in rural practice on completion of their mandatory period.


Studies and compares the labour market integration rates in the first five years of arrival for all categories of recently arrived degree-qualified migrants in Canada and Australia. Also analyzes the labour market outcomes of economic migrants in Canada and Australia, in the context of similar economic cycles. Determines that degree-qualified economic migrants perform better in Australia than in Canada.


Critically examines Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP) within the policy and scholarly debates on “best practices” for the management of temporary migration and concludes that, rather than being an inspirational model, Canada has taken steps away from internationally recognized frameworks for “best practice”. Reveals that while the Canadian program involves a number of successful practices (e.g., cooperation between origin and destination countries, transparency in the admissions criteria for selection, and access to health care for temporary migrants), it does not adhere to the majority of best practices emerging in international forums (e.g., recognition of migrants' qualifications, providing opportunities for skills transfer, avoiding imposition of forced savings schemes, and providing paths to permanent residency).


Examines the economic outcomes of immigrants in an urban centre – Vancouver based on determinants, including: language, educational level, entry year, gender, age, country of origin, and admission category. Using data from the Longitudinal Immigration Database, the report discusses immigration trends in Vancouver comparing them to other major cities such as Toronto and Montreal as well as explores the integration system from immigrants in an urban centre like Vancouver.


Examines income and disposable income for immigrant entrepreneurs in Sweden in relation to immigrants that are not entrepreneurs. Finds that immigrant entrepreneurs have substantially lower incomes than employed immigrants and only marginally higher levels of disposable incomes compared to the unemployed, when other background variables are held constant. Suggests that while entrepreneurship for immigrants may or
may not be positive for the individual, it is not a successful way to fight economic marginalization and segregation.

Reports that business experts are advising companies to train Latin American immigrants due to the problem of the aging US labour force and to offer immigrants training in English language, computer basics, and mentorship efforts.

Reviews the Government of Canada’s approach and progress to ensure that internationally trained professionals have access to fair, accessible, coherent, transparent, and rigorous credential assessment and recognition processes.

Provides insight into British Columbian employers’ engagement in and issues relating to the recruitment and retention of skilled immigrant talent and recommends more employer involvement in matching workforce needs to leverage immigrant talent. Offers 30 recommendations organized by type of organization (i.e., federal and provincial governments, employers and business associations, and IEC-BC) and scope (including policy and program design, program and service delivery, information, communication and promotion, and employer capacity and support) regarding what BC employers want and need to enhance their capacity to recruit, hire, retain, and integrate immigrants into their workforces. Argues that the recommendations and resulting implementation should be guided by seven principles for action that are relevant for all immigrant employment facilitators including government, employers, business groups, and service providers.

Provides an overview of population and workforce aging in Canada and its impact on the labour force, productivity, and living standards. Reviews how different policy options could offset this impact and discusses the policy-related barriers and impacts of an aging workforce. Explores the relationship between aging, skills and productivity, and the impact of an aging workforce on levels of skills investment. Suggests possible policy directions based on the research findings, and indicates areas for further research to support policy development.
Examines immigrants’ economic experiences in relation to their attachment to Canada through two prominent viewpoints – the ‘assimilation’ and ‘structural-historical’ theories. Using data from the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada, the study considers the relational perspective of integration by measuring the immigrant’s attachment to the host country regarding his/her experiences in the labour market. Findings suggest that integration is a dynamic process and that there are theoretical and policy implications to consider.

Reviews the Career Essentials program that is offered through AXIS (Acquiring Experience; Integrating Skills) Career Services in Newfoundland and Labrador. The program assists internationally educated workers in obtaining recognition for their skill sets and experience, clarifying their individual goals, and marketing themselves to potential employers to help newcomers to gain the skills necessary to find satisfying and sustainable employment in their fields of expertise. The inclusive, practical, client-centered programs and services are designed to address the full continuum of challenges and barriers facing internationally educated professionals and tradespersons.

Examines the patterns of joblessness among immigrant men and women to Britain, Germany, and Sweden from 33 countries of origin. Reviews the policies regarding access to welfare, access to the labor market, job segregation, and institutional support for women's employment. Gaps in joblessness between immigrants and the native-born are larger in Sweden than in Britain and Germany, but long-settled immigrants have more similar outcomes across the three countries than recent newcomers. Immigrant women in Sweden work at higher absolute rates than immigrant women elsewhere which suggests that gendered employment policies are a crucial dimension of immigrant economic incorporation.

Reviews the role that credentials play in immigrants' experiences in Canada. Examines the theoretical basis of the non-recognition of foreign credentials and describes the impact of non-recognition.

Explores how businesses can adapt and implement “immigrant-friendly” programs and practices along a recruitment, integration, development, and retention continuum to
lessen the challenges that immigrants face when trying to enter the Canadian labour market (e.g., credential recognition, language issues) and/or integrating into workplaces (e.g., discrimination, different workplace cultures). Provides practical insights on how businesses can effectively leverage the skills, knowledge, and creative capacity of international talent. Also identifies some “keys to success” to make immigration work in Canadian businesses.

Addresses how the Canadian labour market will evolve over the next ten years and what the role of Canada’s immigration program will be given the upcoming demographic challenges of the retirement of a large number of baby boomers and the limited number of new workers coming from domestic sources.

Identifies likely trends in the level, composition, and sources of labour demand and labour supply, and in the industrial and occupational distribution of employment. Seeks to identify occupations where the current and projected states of supply and demand suggest that imbalances could develop or persist over time.

Focuses on the labour market integration of immigrants in Denmark. Reviews government proposals to implement more restrictive policies in order to improve the contribution of immigration by improving their integration.

Describes employers’ attitudes and practices in hiring newcomer jobseekers in order to examine the access to employment issue through the lens of employers. Finds that the employers’ perceived disconnect between immigration and skill shortages leads to their maintaining the status quo in hiring practices, that employers' preferred hiring strategies and technologies are based on existing social networks which largely exclude newcomer jobseekers and that employers interpret personal attributes based on mainstream social and corporate cultural norms which disproportionately disadvantage newcomer job seekers.

Reviews the current state of knowledge about Toronto immigrants’ economic experiences and identifies research and policy gaps that impede efforts to facilitate immigrants' successful settlement. Divided into four sections: 1) examines the changing division of labour by gender and ethnicity since 1971 due to deindustrialization and compares the industrial distribution of employment of immigrants with that of Canadian-born workers; 2) reviews the extent of immigrant entrepreneurial activities in Toronto, the nature and structure of various ethnic economies, and their role and impact on the overall economy; 3) analyzes the economic performance of Toronto's immigrants; and 4) addresses the concerns of the Canadian public by exploring the economic impact of Toronto's immigrants on Canadian society.

Describes the longer transition period that new immigrants require to find gainful employment. Discusses rising poverty rates and that today's immigrants are having more difficulty gaining access to employment.

Describes the London-Middlesex Immigrant Employment Council’s Employer Leadership Strategy to help business leaders share their successes in utilizing recruitment and retention sources in order to engage colleagues in their companies, networks, and sector industries to leverage international talent.

Explores the recent shifts in directions in immigration policy in response to the challenge of matching the selection process to the labour market and the labour market’s failure to fully utilize many of Canada’s more skilled immigrants. Explores some of the policy changes that have taken place in Canada over the past 10 years, and concludes that migration policies are being revised and changed to address problems that are not fully understood. Expresses concerns that, without proper evaluation of current and past policies, such policy changes blur the understanding of where the gaps and issues lie in the system and how to address the real needs.

Comments on a June 2003 roundtable discussion held in Brussels on policies and practices related to low-skilled migration. Notes that most international migrants have little education. North American and European government, business, and other representatives were divided into four sessions: 1) the demand for, and supply of, lower-
skilled migrants; 2) the economic/social impact of lower-skilled migrants on host countries; 3) practices in Europe and the US to integrate immigrants; and 4) the impact of low-skilled migrants on their sending countries. Discusses the need to develop policies capable of dealing with the socioeconomic impacts on both the sending and receiving countries and the importance of integration related issues such as guest worker programs, naturalization policies, amnesty, and partnerships between governments and the private sector.

Examines the inclusion and exclusion of ethnic minorities and migrant workers in trade unions. Reviews the range of approaches and models developed in relation to the question of representing ethnic minorities and migrants when it comes to trade union strategies, but also the range of understanding of ethnic minority needs. Argues that the issue of minority ethnic workers raises questions of trade union identity and purpose, which points to much deeper issues related to the role of regulation and strategies of inclusion.

Reviews the attitudes and strategies of a UK-based employer in developing the use of migrant labour. Integrates analysis of the attitudes of employers with the views, experiences, and aspirations of migrant workers.

Provides analysis and policy insights on a range of municipal levers to identify how local government practices can assist in immigrant integration.

Argues that the state plays a major role in the processes of labour market stratification for migrant workers via skill-based admissions policies, restrictions on freedom of employment, and differential access to social rights and citizenship. Legislation and, in the case of the highly skilled, requirements for formal certification further strengthen these inequalities.

Primarily an update to the findings of his 2010 report, *People without Jobs, Jobs without People: Canada’s Labour Market Future*. Explores and analyzes what the implications of the aging population and changing requirements in the workforce aging will be for
Canada’s labour force. Examines policy options that should be considered by governments, industry, and post-secondary institutions. Suggests ways to better prepare for future jobs.


Describes integration policy and programs in Canada (excluding Quebec). Notes that the Canadian approach has two defining features: the “two-way street” approach to integration, and the delivery of the bulk of services by third parties, primarily in the non-governmental sector. Describes the Canadian “shared citizenship” or “diversity model” and then explores the major policies and programs in place to facilitate the integration of newcomers. Also discusses the challenges and some of the policy/program solutions to these challenges in housing, the labour market, education, and newcomer relations with public administration (i.e., civic participation, justice, and health). Concludes that better coordination of programs and policies would benefit newcomers. Also mentions that more focus on the intersections of other identity markers with newcomer status would better address the needs of newcomers as they seek to integrate into Canada.


Reviews recent literature related to the migration and transitioning experiences of internationally educated nurses (IENs). Extracted and synthesized five common themes: 1) reasons for and challenges with immigration; 2) cultural displacement; 3) credentialing difficulties and “deskilling”; 4) discriminatory experiences; and 5) strategies of IENs which smoothed transition. Concludes that the professional skill and cultural diversity that IENs can bring to any nursing unit will not be fully realized without substantial efforts to reduce practice limitations (deskilling) and discrimination. Suggests that individual strategies for easing the transition should be taught to IENs, possibly through mentorships by experienced IENs.


Investigates how some immigrants manage to re-establish themselves as professionals in Canada by examining the professional re-entry process and describing how immigrant professionals address pre-migration preparation, post-migration individual challenges, and post-migration structural challenges. Depicts factors that influence the efforts of immigrant professionals to re-establish themselves professionally in Canada. Examines theoretical, service, and policy implications. Based on in-depth interviews with six immigrant professionals from various backgrounds.

Explains one of the priorities identified in the *Emerging Stronger* framework which is meant to help Ontario deal with challenges and take advantages of opportunities to have a strong economy. Describes the current situation, challenges, next steps, and case studies.


Discusses the economic importance of immigration, recent trends in immigration and integration issues. Suggests recommendations to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of delivering public services. Part of the Commission on the Reform of Ontario’s Public Services to understand and address Ontario’s economic challenges, to establish a balanced and sustainable fiscal position, and to sharpen the efficiency of all government activities to provide Ontario with excellent and affordable public services.


Reviews the current labour market and immigration trends in Hamilton, Ontario and discusses the development of the Hamilton Immigrant Workforce Integration Network and outlines its structure, goals, and activities for its first year. Also describes community initiatives in the area of credential recognition and immigrant workforce integration.


Provides an overview of the federal and provincial governments’ Provincial Nominee Programs (PNPs) and assesses their impact on the flow of immigrants to smaller provinces which have struggled to attract and retain skilled newcomers. States that retention rates for immigrants through Nominee Programs were higher in most provinces than for economic class immigrants arriving through the federal programs. Concludes that PNPs were effective as a means of both attracting and retaining immigrants.


Examines immigrant and Canadian-born employees’ incidence, subject and objectives of, and satisfaction with, job-related training. Compares the differences among immigrant sub-groups and other characteristics related to the incidence of training. Also investigates perceived barriers to training among immigrants and the Canadian-born.


Analyzes the employment and wage trajectories of high-skilled workers born in America when a high-skilled immigrant arrives at their work site, using employer-employee data during the 1995-2008 period from the US Census Bureau. Follows the subsequent career path of workers both within firms (e.g., changes in employee salary, relocation to other sites) and across firms (e.g., movements to new jobs or out of workforce, long-term salary adjustments).
Reviews the existing research, discusses recent changes to immigration policy and programs, and presents a number of policy recommendations to address the challenges that new immigrants face in finding employment.

Using 2006 Census data, offers a profile of internationally-educated paid workers and their labour market outcome. Focuses on the different characteristics and determinants which are associated with an easier integration in the Canadian labour market.

Focuses on ways to measure the successful integration of immigrants in the Canadian labour market. Uses the following two “positive” employment outcomes to measure success: 1) working in an occupation related to their field of study or in an occupation requiring similar or higher skill levels; and 2) having earnings at or above the national median earnings calculated for the occupation corresponding best to their field of study.

Provides a labour market opinion which evaluates why some governments choose to use the temporary foreign worker program as a preferred method of regulation and what the impact of hiring temporary foreign workers (e.g., Canada's seasonal agricultural workers program and live-in caregiver program) is on the Canadian labour market.

Considers the significance of immigrant skill underutilization in the Canadian labour market, and demonstrates that the economic, social, and political repercussions are compounded by the declining employment prospects for new immigrants. Reviews the impact on Canadian immigrants of institutional factors, in particular those associated with changes in the labour market and the knowledge economy, and suggests that this new environment is not entirely immigrant friendly because it provides more institutional obstacles to the effective integration of highly skilled immigrants. Identifies some of these institutional barriers and constraints which must be confronted and examines which reforms are necessary to forge an effective immigrant skill-utilization policy.
Examines claims that corporate lobbying influences immigration policies, prompting governments to open the doors to foreign labour. Finds that corporate lobbying is linked to temporary worker inflows, but does not impact permanent migrants.

Examines the role that employers play in the social incorporation of immigrant labour by recruiting foreign-born labour into the U.S. economy. Speculates that the temporary government policies for the recruitment of skilled and unskilled foreign-born labour and the employer attraction to this type of labour will continue into the future.

Addresses how the aging population is leading to greater diversity and inclusiveness essential to fill roles and maintain performance by hiring skilled immigrants. Reviews that businesses need to take full advantage of this diversity.

Examines the characteristics of the visible minority population and labour force, including those employed by firms under the Legislated Employment Equity Program and the Federal Contractors Program. Discusses the future growth of the visible minority labour force and reviews the socio-economic impact and implications of the study’s findings.

Presents quantitative and qualitative evidence that rejects the conventional wisdom that immigrants fill the jobs that nobody wants and proposes that immigrant hiring is a management strategy to deal with rising native labour agitation. Uses the case of poultry processing in the southeastern United States to develop this argument.

Discusses the historical, political, and economic contexts that have led to Canada's increasing reliance on temporary migrants to meet domestic labour market needs. Argues that temporary labour migration is problematic and that both migrants and Canada would better be served by renewing the link between migration, permanent residency, and citizenship in Canada.

Provides general policy recommendations for credentialing internationally educated nurses (IENs) who migrate to practice nursing in developed, high-income countries. Although examples draw on IEN experiences in Canada, the suggestions may have broader application to other internationally educated professionals wanting, or needing, to practice outside their home country of education. Study was guided by a biographical narrative (qualitative) research methodology with 12 IENs volunteer participants providing recommendations based on their personal experiences. Recommends that the credentialing process should be made transparent, standardized, and harmonized both prior to, and upon arrival in their destination country and that national immigration agencies and nursing regulatory bodies could better coordinate their activities when processing potential IEN migrant applications.


Examines the experiences of skilled immigrants to Canada and the US and how they face different challenges. States that Canada’s point system for selecting Economic Class applicants makes skilled immigrants vulnerable to a number of threats after the migrant lands, including Canadian employers who discount foreign credentials and work and who impose a discriminatory income penalty on minorities. Asserts that the vulnerabilities reported in Canada do not appear to be transferable to the United States because immigration policy in the U.S. stresses pre-landing employment commitments via employer sponsorship, so prospective Economic Class migrants to the United States do not migrate without first knowing how their credentials and “minority status” will affect employment opportunities. Identifies that skilled workers admitted to the U.S. on H-1B temporary visas do face similar challenges as noted in the Canadian experience as well as many additional concerns.


Reviews the academic and grey literature concerning effective policies and practices supporting immigrant labour market attachment. Provides an overview of the known barriers to labour market attachment at the macro (systemic) and micro (individual) immigrant levels. Identifies policies and practices that address the barriers explored in each area from the international and Canadian perspectives. Also identifies gaps in the research and makes recommendations.

Examines the early settlement experiences of immigrants, from pre-migration to the first six months after arrival. Provides an overview of the Longitudinal survey of immigrants to Canada (LSIC) population, looking at both pre-migration characteristics as well as those at arrival. Identifies problems and difficulties newcomers experience in four key areas of integration: accessing health services, finding housing, accessing education and training, and finding employment. Also examines challenges to integration in terms of what help was needed and received and from whom, or needed and not received.


Presents demographic information to supply an up-to-date picture of the various aspects of the Canadian population. Contains charts/tables along with brief analytical commentary.


Highlights the CARE Centre for Internationally Educated Nurses, a bridging model that has helped immigrant nurses successfully move from pre-registration to achieving registration and moving into nursing jobs in Ontario. Identifies the activities, impact, keys to success, and challenges of the CARE Centre program, as well as the lessons the model offers to leaders of other organizations seeking to help internationally educated professionals.


Offers a comparative analysis of admission and retention policies toward foreign students in selected industrialized countries, with a specific focus on the regional level, where such policies have only recently evolved. Discusses the extent to which countries and regions have been successful in retaining foreign graduates for their labor markets and where they encountered problems.


Provides an analysis of the growing divide between have and have not occupations. Discusses that while there is a lack of skilled applicants for some positions, there is also a growing labour surplus for other occupations.


Reviews the current literature on the social, cultural, political, and economic outcomes of making communities more welcoming and inclusive, both across Canada and
internationally. Also contains a synthesis of the findings and an annotated bibliography, both organized by theme and sub-theme. Broad thematic areas are social inclusion, civic participation, and economic integration.


Walton-Roberts, M. (2005). Regional immigration and dispersal: Lessons from small- and medium-sized urban centres in British Columbia. *Canadian Ethnic Studies, 37*(3), 12-34. Examines the factors that contribute to immigrant settlement and integration in the Kelowna, B.C. and Squamish, B.C. regions, and evaluates the urban policies and practices that their municipal governments employed to attract, retain, and integrate immigrants. Findings suggest that these municipal governments do not actively attract immigrants, but they are involved in funding services that assist in immigrant settlement. Links the successful attraction and retention of immigrants to the preexisting social and economic context, rather than to the size of the community.

Watt, D., Krywulak, T., & Kitagawa, K. (2008). *Renewing immigration: Towards a convergence and consolidation of Canada’s immigration policies and systems*. Retrieved from Conference Board of Canada website: http://www.conferenceboard.ca/e-library/abstract.aspx?did=2758 Analyzes Canada’s immigration policies and systems within the global context and offers suggestions for the future as a means of alleviating Canada’s skilled labour shortage in the face of growing competition for international talent. Identifies key issues, trends, and implications for immigration policies and systems with the view that the countries that best adjust their immigration programs to meet the needs of employers, immigrants, and communities will fare the best in this competitive world. Examines Canada’s immigration system through the perspective of Canadian businesses and industry sectors and offers insights into how the permanent and temporary foreign worker programs are meeting the needs of employers and immigrants. Offers suggestions to encourage and promote the development of effective and timely future immigration policy.

Explores the human capital brought to Canada by newcomers and reviews the educational and employment prospects of their children by synthesizing existing research on the transmission of educational and economic status across generations and tries to reconcile seemingly contradictory settlement trends. Makes recommendation about how to enable the labour market integration of newcomers and their families.


Reviews the public and private programs and services aimed at helping newcomers integrate into the Toronto labour market.


Provides support for the development of a “one-stop” HR Support Centre for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) in four regions across northeastern Ontario (i.e., the districts of Parry Sound, Nipissing, Timiskaming, and Cochrane) to hire and retain skilled labour.


Analyzes the knowledge spillover costs and benefits that firms hiring high-skilled immigrants face. Focuses on organizations which are intervening to broker new relationships between high-skilled immigrant job seekers and employers that address the lack of “spillover knowledge”. Primarily focuses on Toronto Region Immigrant Employment Council (TRIEC) programs which illustrate a relatively new approach to improving labour market integration of high-skilled immigrants. Explains the effects of these programs in terms of knowledge spillover effects.


Analyzes the labour market situation of immigrants between 2008 and 2011, based on data from the Labour Force Survey. Focuses on core-aged immigrants and concludes with an overview of the labour market trends among their younger and older counterparts.


Reviews the many ways in which the security (i.e., work, job, employment, and voice and representation) of Asian immigrants has been comprised. Changes to immigration policy and the restructuring of legislation such as British Columbia’s Employment Standards
Act, have led to further marginalization within the labour market and the creation of deregulated and hazardous workplaces.


Examines the extent to which immigrants in 2006 with a field of study that typically leads to a regulated occupation were working in that occupation. Reviews how this match rate varies by province, by the immigrants' source countries, and by the amount of time they spent in Canada. Also considers the type of work performed by those not working in the occupations for which they studied.