

LITERATURE REVIEW: INTEGRATION OUTCOMES

CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION CANADA

Prepared by Dr. Livianna S. Tossutti
Associate Professor
Department of Political Science
Brock University

With the Research Assistance of:

Doug Hagar, Brock University
Patrick Kelly, Brock University
Isabelle LeBlanc, Université de Montréal et Université de Moncton
Nicole Pitre, University of Alberta



This report reviews research on the factors shaping the economic and social integration outcomes of permanent immigrants to Canada. The impact of source country/region and immigration class are of principal interest, but the effects of secondary explanatory variables, including, but not limited to, education, gender, age, and language ability, are also assessed. The research findings are drawn from English and French-language books, articles and reports published by academic, governmental and non-governmental sources between 2001 and 2011.

The results of these studies are presented in literature review and matrix formats. The report's literature review component is divided into three sections: economic integration, social integration, and combined economic and social integration. The first two sections are further sub-divided into sub-sections discussing individual indicators of economic or social integration. Findings related to the principal explanatory variables lead off each section, and are followed by a discussion of the impact of secondary explanatory variables, beginning with individual-level attributes in order of precedence (e.g. demographic variables, recognition of credentials), followed by contextual variables in order of precedence (e.g. discrimination, social networks, enclave/spatial effects, community size, province, macro-economic conditions, organizational/institutional). Findings gleaned from the few studies examining both social and economic integration are summarized in the third section of the literature review. Final summaries of the links between all explanatory variables and outcomes are presented on pages 23 thru 30, in textual and matrix formats. The report concludes with a discussion of research gaps and data limitations, and proposals for future research directions.

Methodology

The literature search began with an identification of relevant research sources: databases; leading scholarly journals in related academic disciplines (i.e. geography, economics, political science, public policy, sociology, psychology, human resources, Canadian Studies, urban studies, ethnic studies, migration studies); selected federal government departments and agencies (i.e. Statistics Canada, Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Heritage Canada, Human Resources and Development Canada); Quebec's Ministry of Intercultural Affairs and Communities; the Government of New Brunswick; research networks and institutes (i.e. Metropolis, Toronto Immigration and Employment Data Initiative, Canadian Policy Research Network, Centre d'études ethniques des universités); think tanks (i.e. Institute for Research on Public Policy, Fraser Institute, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, Caledon Institute of Social Policy) and non-governmental organizations (The Canadian Council of Refugees, the Maytree Foundation, major francophone organizations in Atlantic Canada and Quebec, the Royal Bank of Canada and the Bank of Nova Scotia). The source list was provided to research assistants, who were instructed to compile a preliminary bibliography for this report.

The literature search identified the most frequent themes in current research on the economic and social integration of immigrants. This allowed the lead investigator to inductively derive multiple indicators of these abstract concepts. As a result, this report summarizes research on the following indicators of economic integration: labour market participation; employment/ unemployment rates; income; finding a job in one's profession, and poverty. It also summarizes research on the following indicators of social integration: a sense of belonging/life satisfaction; perceptions of discrimination; a Canadian ethnic identity; cross-cultural interaction; civic participation; and citizenship. During the study period, a draft bibliography and report were submitted to CIC for comment. In response to CIC feedback, findings dealing with longer-term social integration outcomes such as political participation in the formal arena and political representation were deleted from the final report.

The coding scheme for the matrix identifies the strength and direction of relationships between outcomes and quantitative explanatory variables (e.g. age, education, community size, length of residency, the spatial concentration of immigrants or visible minorities, ethnic enclaves etc.). Since only the strength of relationships between qualitative explanatory variables (e.g. immigration class, country of origin, visible minority status, gender, family status, social networks etc) and outcomes can be described, further elaboration on the nature of the relationship is provided in the corresponding cells. Strong relationships are those characterized by strong statistical effects or consistent and largely undisputed evidence leading to a broad consensus about the links. Moderate relationships are those characterized by relatively weaker effects or more limited evidence. Relationships characterized as “mixed” are those where studies are inclusive. The direction of relationships between quantitative explanatory variables and outcomes will be described as positive or negative; positive relationships indicate that as values of the explanatory variables increase (e.g. education, literacy, length of residency), economic and social integration outcomes improve. Negative relationships indicate that as values of the explanatory variables increase, economic and social integration outcomes deteriorate.

Economic Integration

Labour Force Participation

Region or country of origin is strongly correlated with variations in labour force participation rates. Immigrants from Africa encounter the most formidable barriers to labour market entry, regardless of where they live in Canada. Both males and females from Sub-Saharan African countries reported difficulties finding employment in the Vancouver area due to the non-recognition of their credentials or work experience, and to employer preferences for English accents (Creese & Wiebe 2009). These attitudes exacerbated immigrant deskilling by forcing them to accept part-time, temporary, and sporadic “survival” jobs. African females were doubly disadvantaged; while males were able to obtain manual labour positions, the women tended to work in less well-paid cleaning or light manufacturing industries (13-14). Sub-Saharan African women living in the Halifax region have also been driven to low-paying, part-time, temporary and insecure employment at higher rates than the general population (Topen 2008). The main reasons for this disturbing pattern were grounded in a lack of recognition of their foreign credentials and employment experiences, as well as employers’ negative perceptions of African accents. Parental responsibilities presented special challenges for women seeking to retrain or upgrade their skills. Francophone, African immigrants in Edmonton have also been forced to accept work in low-paying jobs well below their competence and knowledge, often working more than one job to supplement their income (Mulatris 2010). Another study found that although most immigrants from the Balkans had a university education, they too encountered difficulties finding jobs (Malenfant & Martel 2004).

Country of origin variations were also observed in Quebec. European and Asian-born individuals had higher rates of workforce participation than immigrant from North Africa and West and Central Asia. The differences were partly attributed to the fact that a higher proportion of immigrants from these latter regions had been in Canada for less than five years. The lengthy process of language acquisition and credential recognition delayed active searches for employment, as well as the ability to find employment (Ministère de l’Immigration et des Communautés Culturelles 2008). An analysis of the rate at which immigrants to Quebec could access the workforce and find employment in their education domain found that more than 91 percent accessed the workforce by the end of their first five years in Canada, with approximately 69 percent working in a field corresponding with their education domain (Renaud and Cayn 2006). Country of origin emerged as the most significant factor affecting the ability of immigrants to find employment that corresponded with their domain of study and professional competence. No delays

were experienced by immigrants from Western Europe and the USA. Immigrants from the Maghreb, Eastern Europe and the USSR experienced some delays at the beginning, but the disadvantage disappeared over time. Difficulties persisted for immigrants from West Asia and the Middle East, who never seemed to access employment corresponding to their education. Additional conditions that facilitated labour force participation included: domain of study, level of education, pre-migration workforce experience, employment expectations, knowledge of French and the availability of learning opportunities.

Labour force participation rates also vary by **immigration class**, with skilled workers generally finding it easier to find employment than other classes of immigrants. Four years after landing, skilled workers had the highest participation rates (96 percent), followed by refugees (80 percent) and family class immigrants (71 percent) (Xue 2008a). A Toronto-area study found that refugees had the lowest labour force participation rates, with rates remaining low after four years in Canada (Shields et al. 2010, 14). In the Vancouver area, skilled workers had the highest employment and self-employment rates, followed closely by family class immigrants. While pre-existing family networks in the host community helped family class immigrants secure employment shortly after their arrival, education and language ability were not significant factors in helping family class immigrants access the labour market (Hiebert 2011).

The **recognition of immigrant's foreign education and work credentials** is a recurring theme in research on labour force participation (Akbari 2011, 143), with the rate of educational and/or work credential recognition varying according to gender, immigration class and country of origin. During the first four years after landing, about half of all newcomers saw their degrees or work experiences recognized within the first six months after arrival, and slightly more than a quarter received recognition for their work experience within the first four years after arrival (Houle and Ysaad 2010). Females reported more difficulties getting their credential recognized than men, regardless of their immigration class. With respect to differences across immigration classes, close to 50 percent of male refugees and 55 percent of female refugees encountered the greatest difficulties in getting their credential recognized (Zikic et al. 2010). In comparison, skilled immigrants were the most likely to have their credentials recognized and were more likely to check if their credentials would be recognized than all other immigrant classes. Interestingly, less than one-fifth of immigrants checked to see if their credentials were recognized before locating in Canada (6).

Newcomers who obtained their highest level of education or who last worked in the United States or the United Kingdom, were significantly more likely have their education credentials and work experiences recognized than newcomers from other countries. Degrees from France were much less likely to be recognized than degrees from The Philippines and South Korea, but work experience acquired in France was recognized at the same rate as work experiences in the USA or the UK. Newcomers who studied in China or India obtained recognition of their degrees at slightly lower rates than those who studied in the USA or the UK (Houle and Ysaad 2010). The non-recognition of foreign education credentials and a lack of knowledge of English were also cited by new arrivals in Quebec as barriers to finding employment (Gouvernement du Québec 2005). In Laval, recent francophone immigrants from the Maghreb and from Romania experienced considerable difficulties inserting themselves into the workforce due to several factors, one of which was the non-recognition of their education credentials (Germain, Mongeau & Martineau 2005).

The **country where immigrants obtain an education** is also related to variations in participation rates, with degrees obtained in most Asian countries the least likely to be recognized. An analysis of 2006 census data for immigrants aged 25-65 years found that recent immigrants educated in Pakistan and

South Korea were 27 percent and 22 percent more likely than the Canadian-born, to be out of the labour force. Meanwhile, newcomers who had obtained their degrees in the Philippines, India, or Russia were only slightly more likely to be out of the labour force than the Canadian-born. The author argued that employer bias leads to perceptions that an education obtained in British, American, French and German systems is more easily transferable to Canada than an education in China, Russia, Pakistan and South Korea (Ewodou 2011).

Labour market participation rates improve with **longer periods of residency** (Xue 2006). Results from the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada show that the overall immigrant participation rate increased from 70 percent six months after arrival, to 81 percent two years after arrival. Skilled workers saw the highest participation rates (94 percent), followed by refugees (73 percent) and family class immigrants (70 percent). Refugees saw the greatest increase from 44 percent six months after their arrival, to 73 percent, as a result of their completing training or education. As immigrants become more established, they generally experience fewer jobless days, although the rate declines faster for males than females (Shields et al. 2010, 14). Recent immigrants who had been in Canada for five years or less experienced the most difficulty establishing themselves in the workforce, but that after ten years of residency, their situation was similar to that of Canadian-born citizens (Zietsma 2007).

Immigrant cohort effects have been the focus of several studies on labour force participation. In brief, more recent cohorts have experienced lower participation rates, higher rates of unemployment, and lower earnings than previous waves of newcomers (Somerville & Walsworth 2010, 342). A Laval-based study found that immigrants who came to Canada before 1996 were more active in the workforce than their Quebec counterparts, while levels of workforce activity between immigrants who arrived between 1996 and 2001 were similar to the general Quebec population. The authors recommended pre-arrival credential assessments as a means to smooth the integration process (Germain, Mongeau & Martineau 2005).

An array of individual demographic attributes —**gender, education and age at immigration**— are correlated with participation rates. Overall, females, less-educated immigrants, and older arrivals, encountered more difficulties entering the labour force. After four years in Canada, immigrant women participated at lower rates than Canadian-born females (Boudarbat & Gontero 2008), and at lower rates (76 percent) than male immigrants (93 percent) (Xue 2008a). Parental responsibilities, education, and country of origin helped account for these differences. Foreign-born women with small children at home worked fewer hours, while women with higher levels of education were more likely to integrate into the workforce. Asian female immigrants were the least likely to participate in the labour market, while immigrant women from Europe were less marginalized. The lower participation rates for Asian women were attributed to cultural expectations that they remain at home, as well as to their own perceptions that it was difficult to access well- paid jobs (Xue 2008a). In Laval, Quebec, male immigrants were employed or seeking employment at higher rates than females, regardless of their level of education, although the gender gap was narrower for university graduates. Immigrants with a university degree participated in the workforce at a higher rate (83.7 percent) than those who had not completed grade 9 (36.7 percent). A higher percentage of university graduates were employed (77.8 percent), compared to those who had not completed Grade 9 (33.1 percent) (Germain, Mongeau & Martineau 2005). Younger immigrants also found it easier to integrate into the workforce (Boudarbat & Cousineau 2009; Boudarbat & Boulet 2010b), particularly those who arrived before the age of 18 rather than as adults (Boudarbat & Boulet 2010a).

Social networks exerted a generally positive impact on labour force participation rates (Akbari 2008; Xue 2008c), but their effects are contingent on the network's gender composition and internal diversity. According to LSIC data, women were more likely to find employment because of the size, diversity and density of their networks, whereas male social networks did not offer the same benefits. More diversified social networks also increased the probability of securing employment; belonging to a network composed a large number of people from the same ethnic group harmed one's professional prospects, while having friends from diverse ethnic groups increased the probability of finding employment for all ethnic groups and immigration categories (Xue 2008c). Having friends and family in Canada exerted a positive impact on immigrant health, which in turn increased the likelihood of labour market participation. Since refugees are more likely than members of other immigrant classes to be unhealthy upon arrival, the authors argue that refugees would benefit from the social support that could combat anxiety and depression (Zhao, Xue & Gilkinson 2010).

Employment/unemployment rates:

Between 1981 and 2002, 70 percent of newcomers encountered challenges finding employment. The reasons for these challenges are rooted in individual and contextual factors. Employment and unemployment rates vary according to **country of origin**, with immigrants from Africa and the Middle East generally experiencing the least favourable outcomes. After two years in Canada, the highest unemployment rates were reported by immigrants from Africa (38 percent), the Middle East (34 percent) and Asia at 30 percent (Xue 2006). Unemployment rates for immigrants from China—the leading source country of immigration—stood at 38 percent. Immigrants from North America had the lowest unemployment rate (12 percent), followed by Europe (21 percent), the Caribbean and Guyana (22 percent) and South and Central America (26 percent). After four years in Canada, immigrants from the Middle East had the highest unemployment rates (24 percent), followed by newcomers from Africa (22 percent). The lowest unemployment rates were again reported from immigrants from Europe (14 percent) and South and Central America (15 percent). The countries of origin with the highest unemployment rates were Morocco (32 percent), followed by Sri Lanka (31 percent) and Iran (30 percent), while immigrants from the Philippines (9 percent), Romania (12 percent), and India (16 percent) had the lowest unemployment rates. Differences between source countries were attributed to differences in official language knowledge, credential recognition, category of admission, age and gender (Xue 2008, 16). In 2006, almost all immigrant groups (except for those from the Philippines, Hong Kong, and Poland) had higher rates of unemployment than the Canadian-born (6.2 percent) (Preston et al 2010b, 11).

Similar patterns were detected at the regional level. Between 1996 and 2006, the employment rate for native Quebecers was 11.4 percent higher than the rate of immigrant employment, compared to a gap of 4.9 percent in the rest of Canada. Since the core of Quebec's immigration population is young (25-44 years), well-educated and French-speaking, country of origin plays a role in this problem. Immigrants from North Africa represent a dominant segment of Quebec's immigrant population, and reported the highest unemployment rates of 18.8 percent in 2006. Immigrants from Southern Asia had an even higher unemployment rate at 19.1 percent. Country of origin mattered less for immigrants with a Canadian post-secondary education diploma (Boudarbat & Boulet 2010b). In Atlantic Canada, new Canadians from India, Pakistan, and South Korea posted higher rates of unemployment than immigrants from other regions (Akbari 2011, 146).

Immigration class is an important conditioning factor, as skilled workers fare better than family class immigrants and refugees with respect to employment rates and income, as well as the ability to work

in their field of expertise. According to the 2003 LSIC, 50 percent of immigrants aged 25-44 were employed 26 weeks after their arrival—30 points below the Canadian average. Of those who were employed, 42 percent found a job in their intended occupation; 33 percent did so in their first year. The rate was better for skilled workers: 48 percent found a job in their intended occupation, with 40 percent doing so in their first year. After 52 weeks, the employment rate for immigrants was 58 percent and after 104 weeks it was 63 percent. Skilled workers fared the best at the two-year and four-year time points: after two years, 10 percent of skilled workers (some of whom were in training or were homemakers), 22 percent of family class immigrants and 38 percent of refugees had not found employment (Chui & Tran 2003). After four years, skilled workers still had the lowest unemployment rates (13 percent), followed by family class workers (22 percent) and refugees at 29 percent (Xue 2008). Refugees in particular face hardships of higher unemployment rates, lower wages, and longer jobless periods (Shields et al. 2010, 12; Hiebert 2011).

Despite the relative success of skilled workers in Canada, their Australian counterparts entered the labour market more quickly, earned higher salaries, found work commensurate with their occupational credential, and tended to avoid the unemployment that has been associated with immigrants from certain countries, language, age and gender groups (Hawthorne 2006). The superior performance of the Australian model was attributed to the introduction of pre-migration English language testing and credential screening in the 1990s, and to assessments of labour market demand. In contrast to the Canadian model that selects immigrants with general competences, the Australian model seeks immigrants with specific competences. The second difference was attributed to Canada's acceptance of more immigrants from developing countries (China, India, Pakistan, and Romania). Australia's immigrants are predominantly from the UK, Ireland and South Africa.

Recent immigrant cohorts have experienced higher rates of unemployment and self-employment than previous cohorts. Immigrants who arrived in Canada between 2000 and 2006 had higher rates of unemployment than 1990s arrivals, while immigrants who arrived during the 1990s had higher rates of unemployment than immigrants who settled in Canada during the 1980s (Preston et al. 2010a, 10). Differences in employment rates between immigrants and the Canadian-born were smaller for immigrants who arrived in Canada before 2000 (Zietsma). However, the self-employment rates of new arrivals in Canada and the United States have grown significantly, over and above those of similar domestic borns and previous immigrant cohorts. Newer cohorts of immigrants were more likely to start their own businesses, which helped narrow the gap between the entry incomes of the immigrant and Canadian born. Schuteze argues that Canada's introduction of the skilled and business immigrant classes prevented the decline of immigrant self-employment rates found in America in recent years. While these are positive developments, he cautions that higher rates of self-employment could mean lower and delayed rates of assimilation (Schuetze 2010, 173-4).

The **non-recognition of foreign work experience and credentials** poses a major challenge to immigrant employment. According to an analysis of the 2003 LSIC, 26 percent of immigrants aged 25-44 years reported that a lack of Canadian work experience was the most serious problem they encountered when searching for employment in the first two years after their arrival. Twenty-one percent identified the non-recognition of their foreign employment experience or credentials as the most serious problem they encountered (Chui & Tran 2003, 10). In Quebec, new arrivals were unemployed at rates of 18-20 percent and were in need of government assistance. As in other parts of Canada, their difficulties were linked to a lack of recognition of their foreign diplomas and work experience, and to a lack of Canadian work experience (Gulian 2010). Immigrants working in regulated professions (i.e. health, business and natural and applied sciences) were less likely to find full-time employment six months after arrival than immigrants working in the unregulated hi-tech sector (Hall & Sadouzai 2010). Foreign work experience in a regulated profession did become positively associated with employment four years after

arrival. The difference in employment outcomes was attributed to the transferability of skills in the technology sector and to institutional barriers in credential recognition (194-195).

Language proficiency is also strongly and positively related to the employment prospects of immigrants. Indonesian refugees living in the Vancouver area reported that a lack of English language proficiency affected their ability to find employment, form friendships and create social capital. The high cost of living and inadequate assistance under the Refugee Assistance Program prevented these refugees from completing language training courses in their first year of arrival. Many took part-time jobs before their RAP support expired, presenting difficulties for them in juggling employment, household responsibilities and ESLA classes. Their lack of language proficiency led to further struggles in the years after arrival since many found it difficult to obtaining even low-skilled employment. Most work was temporary, sporadic, short-term contract employment (Brunner, Hyndman, & Friesen 2011). The authors recommend that CIC provide English courses for refugees and more information before they leave their country of origin (107). A report by the Canadian Council for Refugees noted that young adult refugees are often trapped “in a cycle of low-paid labour” as a result of their not acquiring the language skills that will improve their employability (2011, 11). Language training was interconnected to many other areas of concern such as access to health and social services.

In Winnipeg, most francophone immigrants felt that it was essential to know English, as only a tiny minority could work solely in French. Many saw their skin colour as a source of difference and discrimination, in that they were treated inequitably in the evaluation of their competence and education (Lafontant 2009). In the Outaouais region, immigrants reported that language and the non-recognition of their diplomas were barriers to finding work (Boissoneault 2009)

The **country where an education was obtained** and **perceptions about the quality of the education system** are linked to employment rates. Overall, employment rates are higher for immigrants who completed their post-secondary education in Canada. In 2007, more than half of established immigrants with a Canadian university degree were employed at rates comparable to those of Canadian-born citizens, while longstanding immigrants with foreign degrees were employed at lower rates. Recent immigrants with university degrees from Canada, Europe or South East Asia (especially the Phillipines) were employed at rates comparable to those of Canadian born citizens, while employment rates for immigrants with degrees from South America, Asia, or Africa, were significantly lower (Gilmore & LePetit 2008). Immigrants who graduated from institutions in most OECD (Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development) countries did better than immigrants with degrees from India, Pakistan, the People’s Republic of China, and South Korea (Mata 2008). Immigrants who were educated in school systems ranked below Canada’s (based on the results of international testing in mathematics and other subjects) experienced more difficulties finding employment. This was not a factor for immigrants educated outside their country of origin (Sweetman 2004).

While immigrants with a post-secondary **education** have lower unemployment rates than high school dropouts (Preston et al. 2010a, 9; Preston et al. 2011, 14), the unemployment gap between immigrants and the Canadian-born actually increases at higher levels of education (Palameta 2007). This was also true for the most recent immigrants with a postsecondary education (certificate, diploma or degree) who reported lower rates of employment than their Canadian-born peers (Gilmore & LePetit 2008). The discrepancies have been attributed to negative perceptions about foreign-acquired higher education. While immigrants with a foreign university degree in a regulated profession were unemployed at a rate of 7 percent, the unemployment rate for immigrants who had studied in Canadian universities was 4.2 percent (Zietsma 2010). In 2006, just 24 percent of foreign-educated immigrants who had studied a regulated profession were practicing in their field, compared to 62 percent of Canadian-born

professionals. Although employment opportunities improved with the passage of time and additional Canadian education, immigrants with educational and work credentials obtained outside Canada lagged the Canadian-born by 27 percent in their ability to secure employment in their chosen field of expertise, even after 10 years in the country.

Longer periods of residency are also associated with fewer difficulties finding employment: the proportion of immigrants reporting challenges decreased from 50 percent six months after landing, to 40 percent in year 2, to 29 percent in year 4 (Xue 2007). According to 2003 LSIC data, one-fifth of immigrants aged 25 to 44 had not found employment after two years in Canada (Chui & Tran 2003). After four years, 19 percent of immigrants were unemployed (Xue 2008a). Palameta found that immigrants needed more than 10 years before their rates of unemployment declined and corresponded with those of the native-born population. Frequently-cited barriers included a lack of Canadian work experience, difficulties with the recognition and transferability of foreign credentials, and a lack of proficiency in English or French (Palameta 2007).

Other demographic attributes associated with variations in unemployment and employment rates include **gender and age**. Female immigrants experience higher rates of unemployment than immigrant men (Zietsma 2007; Preston et al. 2010b, 12) and Canadian-born women (Zietsma 2007). Recent immigrant women in particular had some of the highest unemployment numbers in the country—in 2006, their unemployment rate was 14.6 percent (10). Likewise, female employment rates (48 percent) were lower than male employment rates (68 percent) (Xue 2006). These differences persisted even after four years in Canada, with females reporting an unemployment rate of 23 percent and males an unemployment rate of 16 percent (Xue 2008a). Young immigrants, especially recent arrivals, experienced higher rates of unemployment than their Canadian-born counterparts (Zietsma 2007)

Employer discrimination has been identified as a barrier to employment in several studies. African newcomers with education levels comparable to the general population had higher rates of unemployment than the population, a lower average income, a higher rate of poverty and salary gaps attributable to discriminatory workforce hiring processes (Labelle, Field & Icart, 2007). Immigrants from the Mahgreb also felt that discrimination was an obstacle in their search for employment in Montreal and Sherbrooke. Area service providers felt that they had no power to influence employers and could not intervene even when they witnessed implicit discriminatory acts for fear of damaging partnerships (Lenoir-Achdjian, Arcand, Helly, Drainville & Laaroussi-Vatz 2009). Taxi drivers in Toronto with Masters, engineering or medical degrees also identified racial discrimination as a challenge; even those who referred to a lack of Canadian work experience as the most important problem regarded this as a smokescreen for racial discrimination. A lack of familiarity with the professional vocabulary and jargon used by Canadian businesses also limited their opportunities to work in their field of expertise. An experimental study of randomly generated resumes sporting either Anglo-Saxon or foreign names found that applicants with Pakistani, Indian, or Chinese names were less likely to receive a callback (Hathiyani 2008). The callback differences were reduced for individuals with Canadian experience. Generally, experience—and not foreign credentials and education—appeared to be a driving force behind employers contacting the applicant. Discrimination was also identified as one of the barriers to the employment of immigrants in Quebec (Gulian 2010)

The impact of **social networks** on employment outcomes is contingent on the structure and ethnic composition of the network. Xue assessed the impact of different types of networks (kinship, friendship, organizational) and the size, density, diversity and quality of those networks on the employment outcomes of immigrants during their first four years in Canada (2008b). Kinship networks included

relationships with family members and relatives living in Canada; friendship networks consisted of ties with friends and workmates; organizational networks were defined as the relationships immigrants have with groups and organizations, religious groups, ethnic or immigrant associations. He found that friendship networks exerted the greatest impact on employment outcomes, while organizational networks had no impact. Ethnically diverse networks were positively correlated with employment. Interestingly, females were more likely to benefit from social networks.

Researchers who interviewed immigrants of North African origin in Montreal and Sherbrooke reached a similar conclusion about social networks composed of people from the same ethnic group. The presence of a large, established community of co-nationals did not necessarily mean that new immigrants would access information and jobs through social networking. That said, women were more likely to be part of, and benefit from, stronger social networks. This was partially attributed to their greater willingness to accept jobs below their education level; flexibility and a willingness to work in fields outside one's educational expertise seemed to help the integration process (Arcand, Helly & Lenoir 2009). Thomas also found that diverse professional networks were more closely linked to a successful job search than networks formed on strong bonds between individuals. Since immigrants were usually connected to a smaller number of professionals, this increased their difficulties finding employment. In relative terms, age, gender, matrimonial status and ethnicity played a stronger role than social networks in helping immigrants secure employment. Older and better-educated individuals were more successful. Married men were more likely to be working, and married women less so. **Visible minority status** and speaking a language other than French or English also reduced the probability of finding employment (Thomas 2011).

Finally, contextual factors such as **macroeconomic conditions and community size** shape the employment prospects of newcomers. Immigrants in Toronto were particularly vulnerable to the 2008-2009 global recession, with new arrivals experiencing some of the highest unemployment rates. The decline of traditional industries such as manufacturing and construction negatively affected the overall workforce, but its impact on immigrants was particularly severe (Kelly et al. 2011, 14). Although unemployment among immigrants has decreased since 2008-2009, much of that improvement was driven by low-paying and part-time service sector jobs.

Unemployment rates for immigrants are higher in larger than in smaller centres (Federation of Canadian Municipalities 2009; Desjardins & Cornelson 2006). Possible explanations for these findings were attributed to the language skills of immigrants in smaller centres, labour market discrimination, the non-recognition of credentials, and a possible skills mismatch. Immigrants living outside big city centers were more likely to find employment commensurate with their education, earn higher incomes, and learn an official language (Bernard 2008). Bernard suggested that smaller regions tended to attract immigrants who spoke English or French. A lack of work experience, different educational backgrounds, and a lack of information about how to search for a job were all contributing factors to the integration problem in larger urban settings.

Income

Most research evaluating the economic integration of immigrants focuses on income earnings (Hum and Simpson 2004). Between 1980 and 2000, low income rates increased for the immigrant population and declined for the Canadian-born population, leading to a widening gap (Hou & Picot 2003). By 2006, immigrants earned 38 percent less than non-immigrants (Aydemir & Skuterud 2004). New immigrants usually earn less than their native-born peers, and for recent newcomers, the income gap with native-born Canadians can be quite significant (Picot & Piranio 2012, 8). More recent immigrants earned about 60 percent of Canadian-born individuals in the first five years after landing and about 78 percent of Canadian-born individuals after 11 to 15 years (Picot & Piranio 2012; Frenette & Morissette 2003).

Numerous studies concur that income levels vary across **immigration classes**. An analysis of the Landing Information Data System (1980-1995) and the 1996 Census Public Use Microdata File, found that skilled immigrants had the highest initial incomes compared to family class immigrants and refugees. However, the wages of family class immigrants and refugees rose to nearly the same level as those for skilled immigrants with the passage of time. Family class immigrants benefitted from existing social networks and were more likely to upgrade their education and skills. Refugees without social networks in the host community or high levels of education or skills eventually improved their language skills and educational level, resulting in rising incomes (Wanner 2003).

A Vancouver study found that skilled workers reported the highest incomes of all immigration categories, while business class immigrants had the lowest income levels due to their lower levels of language ability and education (Hiebert 2011). Within the refugee class, incomes for government-assisted refugees (GARs) and privately sponsored refugees (PSRs) were just \$1,000 below the average for all immigrants. Neither education nor language proficiency affected the incomes of refugees since most did not hold university degrees and very few could speak an official language fluently. For landed-in-Canada refugees (LCR), the 25-64-year-old age group reported slightly lower incomes than GARs and PSRs. Hiebert attributes the refugees' success to the peer support networks they formed when arriving and settling in Canada. However, refugees in other parts of the country did not fare as well as those based in Vancouver. In Hamilton, the incomes of government-sponsored refugees were very low and many continued to rely on financial support from social services beyond one year following their arrival. Insufficient language proficiency, education, Canadian work experience and adaptation challenges hindered their ability to find jobs (Navaratna 2007).

Country/region of origin is another strong predictor of immigrant earnings; in general, immigrants from Asia and Africa earned less than immigrants from other world regions. Between the 1980s to early 2000s, both immigrants and the Canadian-born experienced a decline in their entry earnings. Green and Worswick found that a combination of new entrant effects (39 percent), shifts in the source country of immigration (16 percent) and declining returns on foreign-acquired human capital (24 percent) explained the decline in entry earnings between the 1980-1982 and 2000-2003 immigrant cohorts (Green & Worswick 2010, 79). Shifts in the country of origin away from the United States, Europe and the United Kingdom to Asian and African countries, have made it more difficult to transfer human capital because skills are not well-matched or less well-understood in Canada (97). Another study found that the earnings of immigrants from northern, western, or southern Europe were not significantly below those of immigrants born in North America, while immigrants from all four Asian regions had earnings that were between 14 and 16 percent lower than immigrants from North America (Aydemir & Skuterud 2004, 11). Hou and Picot have estimated that about fifty percent of the increasing income gap can be attributed to immigrant characteristics such as country of origin, linguistic competence, family type, and age (2003).

Regional studies also reveal income differences between immigrants from different parts of the world. In the Toronto labour market, immigrants from Hong Kong (\$26,310.70) and Guyana (\$25,590.70) reported the highest average annual earnings and immigrants from Pakistan (\$13,346.60) and China (\$15,019.40) the lowest average annual earnings among immigrants from major source countries. The earnings difference were partly attributed to length of residency in Canada: 63 percent of Guyanese immigrants and about 50 percent of Hong Kong immigrants had arrived before 1991, compared to just 26.5 percent of immigrants from China and 12.6 percent of immigrants from Pakistan (Preston et al. 2010b, 8-9). Immigrants from Sub-Saharan countries had lower wages than the provincial average in Nova Scotia, a finding attributed to the non-recognition of their education and work experience, to the unique challenges faced by females, and to employers' negative perceptions of their language abilities (Topen 2008). The wider immigrant-Canadian-born wage gap in Quebec has been linked to the province's reliance on immigration from non-traditional countries in the 1980s and 1990s and to more skilled immigrants in the rest of Canada (Nadeau & Seckin 2010).

Immigrant cohort effects are strongly related to deteriorating incomes. In the 1980s, immigrants were earning between 24 and 36 percent less than the 1965-1969 arrival cohort; by the early 1990s, they were earning 56 percent less than the benchmark cohort (Aydemir & Skuterud 2004, 9). More recent cohorts of immigrant males (1993-1996, 1997-1999, and 2000-2002) reported lower entry earnings than the 1980-1982 cohort, and this discrepancy has grown in recent years (Green & Worswick 2010, 84). Between 1981 and 1993, there was a 20 percent reduction in real wages for entry cohorts (91). Larger declines were observed for immigrants with a post-secondary and university education than for newcomers with less education (86). Country of origin and negative returns on foreign experience helped account for these patterns (102). The same pattern occurs at the regional level. In 1981, immigrants to Atlantic Canada earned 10 percent *more* than their non-immigrant peers; by 2006, immigrants living in this region were earning 10 percent less than their non-immigrant peers (Akbari, 2011, 147-148).

Picot has argued that it is unlikely the earnings of immigrant arrivals between 1975-1979 and 1990-1994 will catch up with those of Canadian-born residents, despite their high levels of education and language skills (Picot 2004). In the 1970s, immigrant earnings approached 97 percent of Canadian-born earnings after twenty years. However, immigrants (males and females) who entered Canada in the 1980s earned 85 percent of Canadian-born residents and those who arrived in the 1990s earned 70 percent. The passage of time did not improve these cohort effects. Immigrant cohorts who arrived at the end of the 1980s and beginning of 1990s still had one of the highest rates of low-income in comparison to those who arrived during the 1970s (Hou & Picot 2003). An analysis of the Longitudinal Immigration Data Base (1980-1996) also revealed that immigrants who arrived in the 1990s earned less than immigrants who arrived in the 1980s. However, they were able to draw alongside native-born Canadians more quickly than previous cohorts, due to their university education, other personal attributes (i.e. work ethic, work patterns, social capital, entrepreneurial ability) and contextual factors (i.e. market opportunities and changing economic conditions) (Li 2003).

More recent data from 2004 suggest that newcomer incomes are lower for post-2000 arrivals than for pre-2000 arrivals (Picot, Hou, & Coulombe 2007, 6). Certain sub-groups of immigrants were hit particularly hard during the mid 2000s—those coming from Africa and East Asia, older newcomers, and individuals in the IT sector (Picot, Hou, & Coulombe 2007, 6; Picot 2008). The government's focus on highly educated and trades-qualified immigrants had little effect on raising immigrants' income in the short-term. The chances of immigrants receiving low-income wages rose while their ability to move into a higher income bracket decreased (Picot, Hou, & Coulombe 2007, 34). Regardless of these bleak indicators, the longer-term prospects for immigrants improved for all age and ethnic groups (35).

The **non-recognition of foreign diplomas and work experience** has been identified as the cause of the growing salary gap between immigrants and non-immigrants (Girard, Smith & Renaud 2009). Immigrants who were educated in Canada earned 32 percent more than immigrants who were not educated in Canada (Ferrer, Green & Riddell 2006, 391), although another study estimated that the impact of the devaluation of foreign education was more modest. According to Aydemir & Skuterud, immigrants received a slightly lower rate of return on their foreign schooling compared to the same number of years in Canadian schooling—6.1 percent and 6.4 percent respectively (2004, 9). Immigrants also saw a lower rate of return for each additional year of schooling—for native-born Canadians the average rate of return was 8 percent, compared to 6 percent for foreign-born Canadians (8-9). The devaluation of immigrant skills has been attributed to employer perceptions about the suitability of immigrants' educational backgrounds, to employers' failure to properly evaluate foreign credentials, to discrimination (Ferrer & Riddell 2008, 2), and to the inferior skills and qualifications of immigrants (Preston et al 2010a, 3).

Canadian employers do not place the same value on foreign work experience as they do on Canadian work experience. The linear return for foreign work experience is substantively less (at 1.4 percent) than for Canadian work experience (5.7 percent). This pattern is not as strong for immigrants who arrived in Canada before they reached the age of 18 (Aydemir & Skuterud 2004, 9). Alboim et al.'s analysis of the Survey of Literacy Skills Used in Daily Activities (LSUD) estimated that the rate of return for foreign work experience was one-third the rate of return for domestic work experience (2005). A small portion of this difference was attributed to the language skills of immigrants. Meanwhile the rate of return on Canadian work experience and education was the same for immigrants as for native-Canadians.

Language proficiency is consistently and positively associated with higher incomes. Immigrants who were unable to speak English reported incomes nine percent below those of peers who could (Aydemir & Skuterud 2004, 11). Immigrants who received their training in Canada usually had superior language skills, therefore resulting in higher earnings compared to immigrants who received training in their country of origin (Bonikowska, Green & Riddell 2008). Language proficiency was identified as one of the reasons why the immigrant-domestic born income gap for recent, university-educated immigrants rose in Canada during the 1990s, but fell in the United States (Bonikowska, Hou & Picot 2011). In the 1980s, immigrants with similar university diplomas as Canadians and Americans earned 25 percent less than people born in either of these countries. This gap increased rapidly and reached the point where by 2005, university-educated immigrants in Canada were making 67 percent less than the Canadian-born. In the United States, the income gap never reached this point. The authors propose that much of the difference in entry wages could be attributed to the use of pre-arranged employment visas in the United States, to the possibility that more highly skilled immigrants chose the US over Canada, to differences in the occupational composition of the two countries, and to changes in the language proficiency of immigrants entering Canada (41-2).

A lack of proficiency in the dominant language of a region can be a significant barrier for labour market success, particularly in smaller jurisdictions such as Atlantic Canada where there are few opportunities for immigrants to interact with their own communities (Akbari 2011, 140-1). In Quebec, French language acquisition is the key to the successful integration of immigrants. Béland recommends that the provincial government continue to put substantial resources into improving the French-language skills of newcomers, as 70 percent of them do not speak an Official Language at home (Béland 2008).

Perceptions about the inferior quality of certain education systems have been linked to lower immigrant earnings. Immigrants from countries with higher quality education systems, as measured by international math and science test scores, had higher rates of return for their education. Moving from the

25th to the 7th percentile of educational quality resulted in a 10 percent income increase for immigrants with 16 years of education. The difference in income between immigrants from the lowest quality and highest educational systems was 30 percent for males and 25 percent for females (Sweetman 2004). According to 2006 census data, Anglo-American educated individuals earned, on average, \$5500 more than foreign-educated persons working in the same occupation and jurisdiction (7). Foreign-obtained education credentials were valued at different rates; degrees from continental Europe were associated with higher returns than degrees from South America (Lo et al. 2010, 9). Degrees from West Asia, the Middle East, Africa, and East Asia provided the most meagre returns, but diplomas and degrees from Southeast Asia were positively associated with earnings (9).

Immigrant incomes generally improve with **longer periods of residency**. After an initial earnings disadvantage relative to comparable native-born workers, the negative 'entry effect' erodes with time spent in the host country and immigrants eventually catch up and even overtake the native-born (Hum & Simpson 2004, 56). Other variables such as the ethnic origin, region of settlement, socio-demographic characteristics, age, language, etc. all play a large role in determining immigrant integration and require further research (57). Preston et al. also found that new arrivals were particularly vulnerable to income gaps and bouts of unemployment (Preston et al. 2010, 15).

Literacy is also positively correlated with incomes. According to the 1998 Ontario Immigrant Literacy Survey, differences in literacy accounted for two-thirds of the income gap between immigrants and the Canadian-born for university educated immigrants (Ferrer, Green & Riddell 2006, 408). Another study found that immigrants with the lowest-to-minimum literacy skills had a slightly lower hourly wage than native-born Canadians. The study, based on criteria developed by the ABC Canada Literacy Foundation, detected a substantial increase in earnings for immigrants moving from Level 2 to Level 3, which seems to suggest that Level 3 is the "tipping point" for the improvement of labour market outcomes. Immigrants scoring at the highest levels (four and five) earned, on average, more than native-born Canadians (Kelly et al. 2010, 8). At Level 1, an individual has very poor skills; at Level 2, individuals can understand very basic instructions and carry out simple tasks; at Level 3, individuals have the "minimum skills level suitable for coping with everyday tasks---roughly at the secondary school level"; at Level 4 and 5, individuals have a comprehensive command with higher-order information processing skills (4-5).

Lower earnings for immigrants who received their education or work experience in their host country were largely explained by lower scores in cognitive skills, including prose literacy, document literacy, numeracy and problem-solving skills (Bonikowska, Green & Riddell 2008). A 1.5 standard deviation increase in literacy distribution improved the earnings of male and female immigrants by approximately 30 percent (65).

Other individual-level attributes that are associated with income outcomes include: **ethnicity, age at immigration, and gender**. Among male immigrants with a high school or less education, South Asians fared the best in terms of entry earnings, followed by white, black and then Chinese men. The patterns for university-educated men were similar. For immigrant women with a high school education or less, the entry earnings of black and white women were similar, but there was evidence of decreasing entry earnings for more recent cohorts of Chinese and South Asian immigrant women. Greater income disparities between racial groups in recent arrival cohorts were observed for university-educated women: white and black female immigrants earned 20 percent more than Chinese and South Asian newcomers (McDonald & Worswick 2010).

Arriving in Canada at an earlier age tends to be associated with more positive income outcomes. An analysis of census data collected between 1986 and 1996 found that older immigrant arrivals had

lower returns on foreign employment experience and foreign education than younger immigrants, possibly due to the easier acculturation process for younger immigrants (Schaafsma & Sweetman 2001, 1094). However, the relationship between age at immigration and earning potential was not linear. Immigrants who arrived late in their teens before their post-secondary education, had lower earnings than those who arrived earlier or later. The authors suggest that this may be because this group obtained less education than slightly older or younger age groups (1095). Preston and her colleagues found that regardless of their schooling, immigrants who arrived earlier in their lives earned more on average than those who arrived later (2010a, 8). Immigrants to Quebec who arrive at a very young age earned incomes and participated in the labour market at rates very similar to native-born Canadians, while immigrants who arrived as adults did not adapt as quickly, although their incomes improved with more time spent in Canada (Boudarbat, Boulet & Zhu 2010).

Female immigrants earn less than men and other non-immigrant women across all age brackets (Akbari 2011, 150). According to 2006 census data, the average immigrant male took home \$28,037, compared to \$16 540 for immigrant women—an earnings gap of over \$11 000. Canadian-born women also earned more (\$18,408) than immigrant women. Immigrant women from the European Union (EU), Latin America and Eastern Europe were the lowest income earners (Preston et al 2010b, 4-5), while immigrant men from within the EU, Asia, Latin America and Eastern Europe were among the lowest income earners (Preston et al, 2010b, 3; Adsera and Chiswick 2007). The most disadvantaged group was comprised of female newcomers with little formal education (Preston et al. 2011, 14).

Higher levels of education did not necessarily lead to higher incomes. Picot and Hou (2009) analysed the impact of changes in the selection criteria for immigrants which brought in more highly-educated people and more skilled workers, engineers and IT specialists. They found some improvement in the initial gains made by immigrants during the 1990s. However, a number of well-educated immigrants and skilled workers found themselves in lower income brackets and were unable to capitalize on their human capital to earn higher incomes during the first two years after their arrival. Amongst immigrants living with chronic low incomes during the first four years after their arrival, the proportion of immigrants holding a university degree increased from 12 percent in the 1993 cohort to 41 percent in the 2000 cohort. Possible explanations for the difficulties in translating education into positive and substantial income gains included: the inability of the workforce to accommodate a high volume of very well-educated workers, the potentially lower quality of education received in non-traditional countries of origin and linguistic challenges (Picot & Hou, 2009). Preston and her colleagues found that university-educated immigrants still had lower earnings than Canadian-born individuals with equivalent education (2010, 15). University graduates born in Pakistan and Iran experienced the lowest annual earnings of all immigrants who were university graduates, as well as some of the highest unemployment rates. At the bottom of the rung were female immigrants without a university degree who experienced the worst labour market outcomes.

Social networks formed through family, friendship and workplace ties are positively correlated with weekly wages, although not all networks produce the same income returns for immigrants. For both males and females, an increase in workplace ethnic diversity from a total concentration of one ethnic group to a completely diverse workplace network, was associated with an increase in weekly wages. For female immigrants, employment gained through family connections produced the best returns (Xue 2008b). For male newcomers, employment gained through family connections also produced positive, but statistically insignificant returns. For males, it was the features of social networks — their diversity, contact with family sponsors and kinship size— that played the largest role in determining wages. For example, less-educated male immigrants with larger kinship networks benefited more (in terms of finding work and earning higher wages) than females in the same education category (17). Frequent contact with

and geographic proximity to relatives also exerted a positive impact on their weekly wages. Another study confirmed that diverse social networks increased income levels by 1.4 percent for each additional professional known to newcomers. The size of the network, the frequency of contacts and the strength of the bonds did not have an impact on personal income (Thomas 2011).

Immigrant incomes **vary by province**, but there is mixed evidence about the impact of **community size and ethnic enclaves**. In a comparative study of immigrant entry salaries in three provinces, Ontario came out on top with Quebec lagging Ontario and British Columbia (Boudarbat & Boulet 2007). While the income gap between the Canadian-born and immigrants in Census Metropolitan Areas had increased for each immigrant cohort from 1981-2001, the uniformity of this trend in Montreal, Toronto, Ottawa, Hamilton, Winnipeg, Edmonton, Calgary and Vancouver, led the authors to conclude that the labour market experiences of immigrants did not differ significantly across cities (Warman & Worswick 2004). Meanwhile, lower immigrant incomes in larger urban centres in British Columbia have been attributed to the strong presence of ‘older stock’ immigrants in smaller communities, compared to larger urban areas where a higher proportions of recent immigrants from non-western source countries reside. The size of a particular ethnic community in an urban area was unrelated to income (Bauder 2003), and residential ethnic enclaves exerted no significant effects on hourly wages (Zie & Gough 2011). However, ethnic workplace enclaves were associated with lower hourly wages (2011).

Working in a related or equivalent profession

Slightly more than 46 percent of Canadian-educated persons worked in their field of study, compared to just 23.7 percent or less of foreign-educated individuals (Lo et al., 2010, 7). In 2006, foreign-trained and educated immigrants were less likely than the Canadian-born to work in position that corresponded to their domain of study, work competence/experience, and expected income (Plante 2011). Even when they worked the same number of hours and weeks in a year, immigrants generally earned less than immigrants who studied and were trained in Canada, and less than Canadian-born workers who received their post-secondary education at home (Plante 2010). Very few recent immigrants worked in a field directly associated with their education and work experience (17 percent). This proportion increased to 41 percent when immigrants had superior or closely-related required skills and knowledge (i.e. engineers working as architects or in administration), but was still below the rate for immigrants who had studied in Canada (61 percent) or for Canadian-born citizens with a Canadian post-secondary education (63 percent).

The world region where credentials were acquired influenced the likelihood of an immigrant working in a profession closely related or equivalent to the domain of study. Immigrants from Europe, North America, Oceania, and South Africa were more likely to work in their profession than immigrants from other regions (Plante 2010). A study of physicians and engineers found that 92 percent of Canadian-born physicians, and 85 percent of physicians born and educated in Africa and South Asia were practicing medicine. Individuals born and educated in other regions of Asia and Eastern Europe were far less likely to practice medicine at 66 percent (Boyd & Schellenberg 2007). By 2001, only 26 percent of engineers educated outside Canada were employed in their field compared to 41 percent who were born in Canada. Seventeen-percent had secured an administrative position in comparison to 28 percent of their Canadian counterparts. Engineers born in North America, Europe and Oceania (39 percent) were almost as likely to find employment in their field as the Canadian-born (40 percent). Engineers born in South East Asia were much less likely to find employment (15 percent).

The likelihood of working in one's profession varies according to **immigrant cohort effects** and **the professional sector**. Ninety percent of Canadian-born and educated physicians were actively practicing medicine, compared to just 55 percent who studied outside Canada. One third of foreign-trained physicians were employed in fields unrelated to health sciences or medicine. Physicians who arrived in 1980 were more likely to find employment in their chosen profession (86 percent) than post 1990 arrivals (70 percent) (Boyd & Schellenberg 2007). Immigrants with a background in the health sciences were more likely to practice their chosen profession than teachers, engineers and lawyers (Zietsma 2010). Skilled workers in regulated professions (i.e. teaching and health-related) were twice as likely to be hired in an equivalent profession as immigrants with business, finance, or administration credentials. Members of the former group were highly likely to find full-time employment and to expect an income equal or superior to the median income of their professions (Plante 2011).

The **devaluation of foreign education** results in the under-utilization of labour capital and increases the likelihood of unemployment and recourse to jobs that are incommensurate with an immigrant's education or training (Akbari 2011). Not surprisingly, **language proficiency** was positively associated with obtaining work commensurate with one's professional capacities (Chicha 2010; Plante 2011), as was a **longer period of residency**. Immigrants who have been in Canada for more than 10 years were generally more likely than newcomers to work in a profession equivalent or corresponding to their work experience and domain of study (Plante 2011).

Inter-provincial variations were also observed, with immigrants more likely to be employed in positions corresponding with their education and training in the Atlantic provinces (51 percent) or in provinces experiencing strong economic growth, namely, Saskatchewan (47 percent) and Alberta (57 percent) (Plante 2010; Zietsma 2010). Quebec and British Columbia granted the right to practice in regulated professions at a lower rate than the national average (Zietsma 2010).

Poverty:

Nationally, the number of recent immigrants living below the low-income cut-off (LICO) rates rose from 24.6 percent in 1980, to 31.3 percent in 1990, and 35.8 percent in 2000. The incidence of low income increased for all immigrants regardless of education or age group (Picot 2004). Immigrants in general are more likely to be living in poverty than the Canadian-born and are much more likely to depend upon their families rather than government transfers for financial support (Fleury 2007). Hiebert's Vancouver area study also found that a tiny minority of recent immigrants (1.5 percent) received social assistance — a lower rate than for the host population (2011). He attributes this to the large proportion of business immigrants who are often excluded from these programs due to their higher wealth and asset levels.

As with other indicators of economic integration, poverty rates and/or access to social assistance vary according to **country of origin**. Between 1980 and 2000, LICO rates declined for immigrants from Western Europe, Southeast Asia, the United States and the Caribbean, and rose for immigrants from Asia, Northern Europe, Eastern Europe, Southern Europe and Africa (Picot 2004). In Quebec, a comparison of 1996 to 2004 immigrant cohorts in the skilled worker category observed an 183 percent increase in the rates of recourse to social assistance, although the number of newcomers admitted during this period increased by 276 percent (Pinsonneault et al. 2010). Almost 50 percent of recipients stopped using social assistance in the 12 months following their first demand and 75 percent had stopped after 3 years. Immigrants from France and Romania became independent more quickly than immigrants from other countries. Immigrants from Algeria (80 percent), Morocco (60 percent), Romania (60 percent), and

cohorts admitted from 2001-2004 experienced the greatest challenges in freeing themselves from social assistance. Newcomers who arrived in 2001 and 2002 called on social assistance much faster and in larger numbers than all other previous or subsequent cohorts, perhaps due to the technological bubble burst and the fallout from 9/11.

Lower levels of language proficiency, holding a degree from a lower quality education system (as measured by the sending country's scores in international literacy and numeracy tests, the **non-recognition of work experience**, and **discrimination** were linked to higher LICO rates (Picot 2004). **Length of residency** and **family status** were also relevant: recent immigrants were more likely to belong to the working poor, and sole-support parents or unattached individuals were more likely to live in poverty than members of two-parent families and attached individuals (Fleury 2007, 19).

Social Integration

Sense of Belonging and Life Satisfaction

A sense of belonging to the community enables community members to develop emotional ties with each other and imbues them with feelings of autonomy, environmental mastery, and purpose in life (Lai & Hynie 2010, 93-94; Evans 2007). Studies have shown that immigrant inclusion in the community is challenged by **language barriers**, **work and family commitments** and **discrimination** (Goodkind & Foster-Fishman 2002).

Length of residency, visible minority status and country of origin affect a sense of belonging to Canada. Recent immigrants expressed a weaker sense of belonging to Canada compared to other Canadians, but a stronger sense of belonging increased with time spent in Canada (Soroka, Johnson & Banting 2007). Visible minority immigrants expressed a weaker sense of belonging than white immigrants; immigrants from East Asian, African or Caribbean countries expressed the weakest feelings of belonging, even with an increased number of years in Canada (572-575). A very high percentage of South Asians (88 percent) expressed strong feelings of belonging to Canada, as well as to their own ethnic communities, province and municipality (Tran, Kaddatz & Allard 2005).

Racism was identified as a barrier to a sense of belonging for Black African youths who struggled with conflicting identities and values between their families and the host culture. While schools encouraged autonomy and independence, these values clashed with new immigrant ethnic cultures emphasizing deference to authority and adherence to tradition. The culture clash was most apparent at schools where immigrant youth faced racist attitudes and pressures to assimilate. This clash led to many immigrant youths adopting different personalities for home and social settings. Females tended to experience more clashes with parents over the issue of appropriate dress (Baffoe 2011). African refugee students in Manitoba faced myriad challenges, including poverty, separation from their families, loneliness, cultural dissonance and acculturation stresses, racism, a lack of access to psychological counseling, difficulties with required academic skills, and limited proficiency in English (Kanu 2009). Kanu recommends that local schools implement more welcoming policies for refugees and that the federal government accelerate the arrivals process for refugees and waive loans for refugee resettlement.

The potential impact of contextual factors on life satisfaction has been examined from several perspectives. Murdie and Ghosh concluded that the **spatial concentration** of immigrants exerted no impact on the life satisfaction of respondents in 30 Bangladeshi households (2010). In Atlantic Canada,

social networks fostered immigrant interest in the region, life satisfaction, and feelings of inclusion. They also served as gateways for additional newcomers and as anchors encouraging long-term settlement (Gallant 2008 74).

Ethnic identification:

Visible minority status, longer periods of residency, language proficiency, discrimination, social networks and religious affiliation were correlated with the likelihood of immigrants identifying as “Canadian” (Walters, Phythian & AnisEFF 2007). Black immigrants were least likely to report a Canadian identity, while South Asians were most likely to express what the authors refer to as an “assimilated” Canadian ethnic identity. Chinese and white immigrants were most likely to have an integrated identity, where they identified multiple ethnic groups in addition to “Canadian”. Immigrants who had lived in Canada for a shorter period, who spoke a non-official language at home, who experienced discrimination since arriving in Canada, and who had more friends from the same ethnic group, were less likely to express an “assimilated” Canadian identity, than immigrants who had been in Canada longer, who spoke English at home (Quebec results were excluded due to the different meaning of “Canadien” in Quebec), who had not experienced discrimination, and who had more diverse social networks.

Perceptions of discrimination:

Discrimination is particularly devastating to new Canadians who already face challenges adapting to a new country. With all else held equal, **visible minority** immigrants were more than twice as likely as white immigrants to perceive discrimination (Preston et al. 2011, 10). Discrimination occurred most frequently within the context of social interactions (46.3 percent) than in the workplace (33.8 percent). The higher rates of discrimination reported by visible minority immigrants have been associated with slower rates of social integration, as measured by a sense of belonging, self-identification with Canada, trust in others, income, voting and volunteering (Reitz & Banerjee 2007). Reitz and Banerjee have estimated that 33.6 percent of visible minority immigrants who arrived in Canada in the past ten years experienced discrimination, compared with 19.2 percent of white Europeans. The highest rate of discrimination was experienced by Blacks (44.8 percent) followed by Chinese (35.4 percent) and South Asians (28.2 percent).

Gender is also related to perceptions of discrimination, as men (33.8 percent) were more likely to experience discrimination than women (27.6 percent). **Education** was relevant, but in an unexpected direction: immigrants with post-secondary degrees were more likely than less-educated newcomers to report discrimination in the workplace (Preston et al 2011, 7). Interestingly, **language proficiency** was also correlated with experiences with discrimination: non-white immigrants with higher levels of proficiency in one of the official languages were more likely to report workplace discrimination—11.6 percent for newcomers with a high school diploma compared to 30.6 percent for those with a post-secondary degree—while the reverse was true for white immigrants (7-8). Visible minorities with a better knowledge of English or French were also more likely to perceive workplace discrimination than visible minorities with limited fluency in an official language. The findings imply substantial under-reporting of discrimination among individuals with weaker language skills.

Cross-cultural interaction:

Ethnic enclaves often have negative impacts on immigrant income and cultural interaction, making it less likely that newcomers will learn the dominant language of their new country (Warman 2007). They have been associated with a statistically significant decrease in knowledge of the local native language; this is especially true for immigrants from countries where English or French are not well-known (418). Enclave effects are contingent on the immigrant's age at immigration, with higher exposure to one's own group particularly harmful for immigrants who were adults when they immigrated. This is especially true for female immigrants (417). Since larger ethnic communities can encourage immigrants to associate with individuals from similar backgrounds, Lai and Hynie recommend improving newcomer knowledge of social support and community services in order to counteract isolation from the broader community (Lai & Hynie 2010). However, using a different measure of cross-cultural interaction, Aizelwood and Pendakur found that the percentage of visible minorities in a census sub-division was not significantly related to immigrants talking to their neighbours or seeing friends (2005).

Public services and spaces can facilitate cross-cultural interactions provided they are culturally sensitive. The creation of a neutral, third space outside of work and home helped refugees improve their language skills and provided them with employment networking opportunities (Canadian Council for Refugees 2011). One Quebec-based study argued that the norms embodied by public services did not address the needs of children and young adults who do not understand how public services work. These groups had difficulties accessing professional orientation, sport, health, psychological and other services. The study recommended improved collaboration between community services and public services in order to facilitate the integration of this age cohort (Metropolis 2011).

Germain has argued that **community organizations** serve different purposes contingent on the immigrant class they serve. For more fragile populations of immigrants who are less educated and perhaps more stigmatized, the ability of community organizations to support inter-community interactions (bonding social capital) is essential. Immigrants who were not highly qualified benefitted from formal and structured resources. For very qualified workers, particularly those who already know people in Canada, community organizations may be more useful as guides. If social capital is to be developed within immigrant populations, there is a need for hybrid services tailored to the needs of particular populations (Germain 2009). In Montreal, community organizations were welcoming places for immigrant and refugee women, providing them with new social relationships, volunteering opportunities, and decreased feelings of isolation (Cloutier 2011). Community organizations in some minority francophone settings lack the funding to make information about services more accessible to immigrants (Beaudry & Belkhdja 2008).

Civic Participation:

Civic participation refers to different forms of community involvement such as joining a voluntary or civic organization, volunteering and philanthropy. The mobilization of newcomers within associations, workplace groups, religious institutions, and community organizations can build interpersonal trust, foster a sense of civic duty, and increase political awareness (Bloemraad 2006, 65). Bloemraad's study of immigrants in the Portuguese and Vietnamese communities found that **political institutions in their homelands** contributed to lower levels of participation in a wide range of activities (e.g. participating in community events and charitable fundraising, voting, and volunteering on campaigns or local groups

etc.). **Language barriers** also adversely affected immigrants' ability to participate in politics and in the wider realm of civic activities, such as volunteering, community events, fundraising etc. (65-76).

Length of residency and age are linked to variations in volunteering and/or joining voluntary organizations. Although immigrants generally volunteered at lower rates than Canadian-born citizens (Anderson & Milligan 2011) and newcomers joined voluntary organizations at lower rates than the general population or more established immigrants (Aizelwood & Pendakur 2005; Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason 2008), these differences diminish with more time spent in Canada (Anderson & Milligan; Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason). Young immigrants were less likely to volunteer and join voluntary associations than Canadian-born youths (Tossutti 2003), while older immigrants, and immigrants who had spent a longer period of time in Canada, volunteered for more hours. Household income, employment status, and gender did not have any impact on the likelihood of immigrants volunteering (Hall 2006).

The impact of **visible minority status or ethnic background** has also been explored. In their survey of immigrant members of faith institutions, Anderson & Milligan found that respondents of Korean, Western European, Jewish, Northern European, and Japanese origins reported the highest rates of volunteerism, while immigrants of West Asian, Arab, Southern European and Chinese extraction reported the lowest levels (2011). In another study, Black immigrants were significantly more likely to join voluntary organizations than immigrants from "other" visible minority groups (not including Chinese and South Asians). Amongst newcomers, immigrants from the "nonvisible", Black and Chinese groups joined voluntary organizations at higher rates than immigrants belonging to "other" visible minority groups (excluding South Asians) (Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason 2008). **Gender, education, income and marital status** also exert effects on the voluntary organization memberships of immigrants, with males, the more highly-educated, the better-off (i.e. incomes over \$50,000) and married/common-law individuals more likely to join these associations than female, single, unmarried individuals (Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason 2008).

The impact of **family and religious ties** on memberships in voluntary associations was explored in an analysis of the 2002 Ethnic Diversity Survey. While frequent religious worship increased the likelihood of immigrants joining a voluntary association, it did not have the same effect for newcomers who had been in Canada for 10 years or less. Family ties, as measured by higher levels of trust in family and frequent contact with family members exerted no significant effects on the associational involvements of immigrants in general and of newcomers (Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason 2008). **Personal motivations**, such as the desire to acquire social capital and local work experience, prompted newcomers to volunteer (Handy & Greenspan 2009).

With respect to community-level factors, while experiences with **discrimination** exerted a negative impact on economic outcomes and the propensity to identify as an ethnic "Canadian", such negative experiences actually increase the likelihood of immigrants and newcomers joining a voluntary association. A tentative explanation for this unexpected pattern is that negative experiences in Canadian society motivate involvement in, rather than a retreat from, community life (Tossutti, Wang & Kaas-Mason 2008).

Studies of community-level factors have shown strong, positive correlations between rates of immigrant volunteerism and communities with **higher densities of immigrants**, but a negative correlation between immigrant volunteerism and communities with a **higher density of visible minorities** (Anderson & Milligan, 2011). Using a different measure of integration, Aizelwood and

Pendakur found that the percentage of visible minorities in a census sub-division was not significantly related to immigrants joining organizations (2005).

A few words must be said about research on the related concept of social capital, and how it is influenced by race, ethnicity, and immigration. Social capital refers to the social networks, norms of generalized reciprocity, and interpersonal trust that foster coordination and cooperation for mutual benefit (Putnam 2000). Some studies have found evidence of a negative correlation between social capital and ethnic diversity (Howe et. al. 2006; Kay and Johnston, 2007). Kazemipur has countered that Canada may be an exception to the negative relationship between social capital and increasing numbers of immigrants and ethnic minorities that has been observed in the United States, Australia and Europe (2008). He has found that immigrants add to the overall stock of social capital in terms of higher levels of confidence in public institutions (e.g. the judiciary, government, police, welfare system, education and health care), and involvement in religious activities. However, they fall behind native-born Canadians on other dimensions of social capital, particularly those involving social interactions with the host population – e.g. volunteering, group activities, trust, neighbourliness, and social networks.

Citizenship:

The majority of newcomers decide to naturalize as early as six months after arriving in Canada. Ninety-five percent of residents of Canada are citizens—81 percent by birth and 14 percent by naturalization (Tran, Kustec & Chui 2005). **Age at arrival, length of residency and country of birth** are related to variations in citizenship acquisition. Younger arrivals are more likely to apply for citizenship than older arrivals. Second, the more time newcomers live in Canada, the more likely they will become citizens: 57 percent who had lived here for 4 to 5 years, 79 percent who had lived here for 6-to-10 years, and 90 percent who had been in the country for 30 years or more, were citizens. Third, newcomers from Asia and Africa were more likely than newcomers from Europe and the U.S. to become citizens. This was attributed to the fact that developed countries such as Japan and the U.S. do not allow or make it difficult for their citizens to obtain dual citizenship.

Social and Economic Integration

A limited number of studies have identified factors affecting both the economic and social outcomes of immigrants. **Longer periods of residency and language proficiency** are positively correlated with improved economic and social outcomes. After four years in Canada, LSIC immigrants assimilated both economically and socially: more of them secured employment, purchased homes and became involved in a variety of social activities. Social networks (friends, family, and co-workers) played a crucial role in helping newcomers overcome integration and other challenges. As immigrants became more settled, stressors unique to newcomers—such as language and integration fell to the wayside and were replaced by more ordinary stressors such as finances (Xue 2007, 28). A lack of English language proficiency affected the ability of Indonesian refugees who had been living in the Vancouver area for five years to find employment, form friendships and create social capital (Brunner, Hyndman & Friesen 2007).

Ethnic enclaves often have negative impacts on immigrant income and cultural interaction, making it less likely that newcomers will learn the dominant language of their new country. Enclave effects are contingent on the immigrant's age at immigration, with higher exposure to one's own group being particularly harmful for immigrants who were adults when they immigrated (Warman 2007).

Psychological stresses can exacerbate the challenges associated with economic and social integration. African refugee students in Manitoba faced poverty, separation from their families, loneliness, cultural dissonance and acculturation stresses, racism, a lack of access to psychological counseling, difficulties with required academic skills, and limited language skills. The author recommends that local schools implement more welcoming policies for refugees, and that the federal government accelerate the refugee resettlement process and waive resettlement loans (Kanu 2009).

Explanation of Linkages in Matrices/Summary of Findings

Economic Integration

A complex mix of individual attributes and contextual factors, often interacting with other variables, shape the economic integration outcomes of immigrants. Nevertheless, five explanatory variables were notable for their strong and consistent influence on economic integration outcomes. These variables — country/region of origin, cohort effects, period of residency, the recognition of foreign credentials/experience, and language proficiency — were associated with at least four or all of the economic indicators. Generally, immigrants from Asia and Africa, post-1990s arrivals, newcomers, immigrants who have not had their credentials recognized, and those who lack proficiency in an Official Language, were less likely to participate in the labour market and work in their chosen profession, and more likely to be unemployed, earn lower incomes, and live in poverty.

Each of the items in a second cluster of explanatory variables — immigration class, education, perceptions about the quality of the education system where an immigrant obtained his/her degree, gender, employer discrimination, social networks, and community size— helped account for three economic indicators. In brief, skilled workers and males tended to experience better outcomes on the labour market participation, income and employment/unemployment indicators. Immigrants who obtained degrees in countries that were perceived to have superior education systems were less likely to be unemployed and live in poverty. Employer discrimination was also identified as a strong barrier to labour market participation and employment, and was associated with higher LICO rates. Social networks formed through family, friendship and workplace ties generally exerted positive effects on labour market participation, income and employment rates, particularly if they were ethnically diverse. Family networks also proved to be more beneficial for female earnings. With respect to community size, immigrants residing in larger cities were less likely to participate in the labour market and were more likely to be unemployed. Conflicting results were found concerning the incomes of immigrants in larger and smaller centres.

The evidence with respect to education was less conclusive. While immigrants with higher levels of education were more active in the labour market, the returns on their education were not as clear with respect to the income and employment indicators. For instance, immigrants with a post-secondary education had lower unemployment rates than high school dropouts, but the unemployment gap between immigrant and the Canadian-born increased at higher levels of education. These patterns were attributed to the devaluation of foreign degrees in regulated professions, perceptions that education systems in non-OECD countries are inferior, employer discrimination, the inability of the workforce to accommodate a high volume of well-educated workers in the 1990s, and linguistic challenges.

A third set of indicators — visible minority status/ethnicity, country where education obtained, age at immigration, and province of residency— contributed to explaining at least two economic indicators each. Visible minorities found it more difficult to find employment. South Asian immigrant males

earned higher incomes than males from other racial categories, while White and Black females earned more than their Chinese and South Asian counterparts. Immigrants who arrived at a younger age were more likely to participate in the labour market and earn higher incomes than older arrivals. A three-province study found that immigrants in Ontario earned more than immigrants in BC and Quebec. Immigrants living in Atlantic Canada, Saskatchewan and Alberta were more likely to work in a profession related or equivalent to their education and skills.

The following explanatory variables in the last cluster helped account for one economic indicator each: professional sector; literacy; age; family status; ethnic enclaves and macroeconomic conditions. Immigrants with a background in the health sciences were more likely to practice their chosen profession than teachers, engineers and lawyers, although only half of foreign-trained physicians were practising medicine. In general, skilled workers in regulated professions (i.e. teaching and health-related) were twice as likely to be hired in an equivalent profession as immigrants with business, finance, or administration credentials. Higher literacy rates were positively correlated with income, younger immigrants reported rates of unemployment than older immigrants, and sole support parents/unattached individuals were more likely to live in poverty. Newcomers were particularly hard-hit on the employment front by the 2008-2009 global recession. Evidence about enclave effects on income was mixed: residential ethnic enclaves and the size of a particular ethnic community in an urban area exerted no significant effects on different indicators of income. However, ethnic workplace enclaves were associated with lower hourly wages.

Social Integration

A relatively large volume of research in this field has focused on the domain of civic participation. Research on cross-cultural interaction, discrimination and citizenship has attracted less attention. A complex array of individual-level factors influenced patterns of civic participation: country of origin, racial/ethnic background, period of residency, education, income, language proficiency, gender, age, marital status, patterns of religious worship, and personal motivations.

Factors negatively associated with civic participation included emigration from a country with non-democratic or weak democratic traditions, and a lack of language proficiency. Rates of volunteerism and associational memberships varied across ethnic and visible minority groups, with immigrants of Korean, Western European, Jewish, Northern European, and Japanese origins reporting the highest rates of volunteerism, and Black immigrants higher rates of voluntary association membership than immigrants from “other” visible minority groups. Immigrants who were male, who reported higher incomes and education, and who were married or in common-law relationships, were more likely to join voluntary organizations than females, individuals with less education and lower incomes, and who were single. Immigrants who have lived in Canada for a longer period of time and older immigrants volunteered at higher rates than newcomers and young immigrants. Immigrants who attended religious institutions more frequently are more likely to belong to voluntary associations than those who never attend. The desire to acquire social capital and local work experience has also been linked to higher immigrant rates of volunteerism. Higher levels of family trust and contact had no impact on rates of voluntary association membership. Research on community-level variables detected strong, positive correlations between volunteerism and communities with higher densities of immigrants. Mixed evidence was found with respect to the impact of the spatial concentration of visible minorities on measures of civic participation. Interestingly, experiences with discrimination increased the likelihood of immigrants and newcomers joining a voluntary association.

A sense of belonging to Canada/life satisfaction increases with additional time spent in Canada and language proficiency. Individuals from East Asia, Africa and the Caribbean, visible minorities and individuals who have been subject to racism, were less likely to express a sense of belonging to Canada. Personal work and family commitments can have a negative effect on a sense of belonging. While co-ethnic social networks improve life satisfaction/sense of belonging, the spatial concentration of immigrants exerted no effects on belonging.

Black immigrants, newcomers, immigrants who speak a non-official language at home, immigrants who have experienced discrimination, immigrants with a religious affiliation and immigrants with less diverse social networks, were less likely to express a Canadian ethnic identity.

Visible minorities, males and individuals with higher levels of education and language proficiency were more likely to experience more discrimination than non-visible minorities, females and individuals with more education and better language skills.

Research on the factors associated with cross-cultural interaction is very thin and inconclusive. While immigrants in ethnic enclaves were less likely to meet others outside their own ethnic group, the spatial concentration of visible minorities was unrelated to immigrants seeing friends or talking to their neighbours. Community organizations can facilitate cross-cultural interactions provided they are adequately funded and deliver tailored services to sub-groups of the immigrant population. Public services can be helpful providing they are delivered in a culturally sensitive manner.

Immigrants from developing countries are more likely to acquire citizenship, as are younger arrivals and people who have lived in Canada for a longer period of time.

Gaps in Research/Limitations of Sources

The author of this report and the authors of the studies that have been reviewed here, have identified thematic gaps in the research and data quality issues. It is obvious that the volume of research on economic integration far outpaces research on several important dimensions of social integration. Relatively-speaking, our knowledge of the factors influencing cross-cultural interactions and discrimination is very thin. The same could be said about research on the conditions leading to poverty—a particularly “wicked” problem for recent newcomers, many refugees, and many immigrants from Africa and Asia.

The persistence of country/region of origin and credentialization effects in research on economic integration suggests that more attention needs to be devoted to examining the procedures and criteria used by employers and professional associations to assess the quality of foreign education systems and work credentials. Immigrant perceptions, and some empirical evidence, suggesting that discriminatory attitudes play a role in these negative assessments require the use of more experimental design studies that could better estimate these effects.

While it is well-understood that female newcomers experience disadvantage on the economic front, few studies have examined gender variations on social integration measures. Furthermore, contemporary studies of civic participation tend to examine the impact of ethnicity, visible minority and immigration status for the general population, rather than for immigrants or newcomers. This is primarily due to the lack of sufficiently large samples of immigrants in most social and political surveys. Given these gaps, and the inconclusive nature of research on the impact of diversity on social capital, there is a need to bolster research on female immigrants, and to improve the breadth and quality of social data on immigrants.

Reitz has argued that more research is needed on the long-term employment effects of selection-based criteria on general employability in Canada through the points system, and on the impact of settling outside of Canada’s largest urban areas for immigrants in Canada (2007a). Picot has noted that the

impact of language proficiency, school quality, the non-recognition of work experience and discrimination needs to be further examined due to a lack of quality data in existing datasets (2004).

In *Regards croisés sur l'immigration*, Belkoudja (2011) reflects on the meaning of immigration, nationalism and integration for small communities across Canada, and in New-Brunswick in particular, where the social integration of immigrants is important for the vitality of linguistic communities. The author discusses various community-based initiatives that support social integration (activities, dialogues, etc.). More work in this vein needs to be done; first, by paying more attention to the meaning of social integration in different settings —both large and small, majority and minority linguistic communities—and second, by devoting more attention to the concrete impact of public services, public spaces and community organizations on facilitating cross-cultural interactions, combatting discrimination and encouraging a sense of belonging.

VARIABLES CORRELATED WITH ECONOMIC INTEGRATION OUTCOMES

	Labour Market Participation	Income	Employment/ Unemployment	Poverty	Working in Related Profession
Immigration Class	Strong (skilled workers advantage)	Strong (skilled workers advantage)	Strong (skilled workers advantage)		
Country/Region of Origin	Strong (Asia, Africa disadvantage)	Strong (Asia and Africa disadvantage)	Strong (Africa and Asia disadvantage)	Strong (rising LICO for Africa, Asia, most of Europe)	Strong (Europe, North America, Oceania, S. Africa advantage)
Visible minority /ethnic background		Moderate (South Asian advantage for men; White and Black advantage for females)	Moderate, negative		
Recent immigrant cohort	Strong, negative	Strong, negative	-Strong, negative for unemployment rate -Strong, positive for self-employment		Strong, negative
Longer period of residency	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Moderate, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive
Foreign credential/experience recognition	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive
Professional Sector					Strong, physicians & engineers disadvantage
Higher level of education	Moderate, positive	Mixed	Mixed		
Country where education obtained	Strong (Asian countries disadvantaged)		Strong (foreign education disadvantaged)		
Perceived quality of education system		Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	
Language proficiency	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive	Strong, positive
Literacy		Moderate, positive			
Female	Strong, negative	Strong, negative	Strong, negative		
Older age			Strong, positive (youth disadvantage)		
Older age at immigration	Moderate, negative (youth advantage)	Moderate, negative (youth advantage)			
Family Status				Moderate (sole support parents/unattached individuals disadvantage)	
Social networks	Moderate, positive	Moderate, positive (ethnically diverse favoured)	Mixed (ethnically diverse favoured)		
Ethnic enclaves		Mixed			

Discrimination	Strong, negative		Strong, negative	Strong, negative	
Favourable macroeconomic conditions			Strong, positive		
Province		Moderate (Ontario advantage)			Moderate (Atlantic Canada, SK, AB advantage)
Larger cities	Moderate, negative	Mixed	Moderate, negative		

VARIABLES CORRELATED WITH SOCIAL INTEGRATION OUTCOMES

	Canadian ethnic identification	Sense of Belonging/Life Satisfaction	Discrimination	Civic Participation	Cross-cultural Interaction	Citizenship
Country Origin		Moderate (East Asia, Africa, Caribbean weak; South Asia strong)		Moderate (non-democratic or weak democratic traditions of sending country a disadvantage)		Strong (developing countries)
Visible minority / ethnicity	Moderate, (Black immigrants least likely to identify)	Moderate (visible minority disadvantage)	Strong (visible minority disadvantage)	Mixed (effects contingent on measure of civic participation)		
Longer period of residency	Moderate, positive	Strong, positive		Strong, positive		Strong, positive
Higher level of education			Strong, negative	Moderate, positive		
Higher income				Mixed (effects contingent on measure of civic participation)		
Language proficiency	Moderate, positive	Strong, positive	Moderate, negative	Moderate, positive		
Females			Moderate, positive	Moderate, negative		
Older Age				Strong, positive (youth disadvantage)		
Older age at arrival						Strong, negative (youth advantage)
Marital status				Positive (married/common law advantage)		
Discrimination	Moderate, Negative			Strong, positive		
Racism		Moderate, negative				
Social networks	Moderate, positive, (diverse network advantage)	Strong, positive				
Family trust/contact				No effect		
Religious worship				Strong, positive		
Religious affiliation	Moderate, Negative					
Personal factors/ Motivation		Moderate, negative (work and family commitments)		Strong, positive		

Ethnic enclaves					Strong, negative	
Spatial concentration of immigrants		No effect		Strong, positive		
Spatial concentration of visible minorities				Mixed	No effect	
Public Services/ community organizations					Mixed	

Bibliography

- Aizlewood, A. and R. Pendakur. (2005). Ethnicity and Social Capital in Canada. *Canadian Ethnic Studies/Études ethniques au Canada* 37, no. 2: 77-102. [affiliation: government].
- Akbari, A.H. (2008). The role of networks in economic integration. In *Our Diverse Cities: Atlantic Canada*. Metropolis. http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_spring2008_e.pdf
[affiliation: university]
- Akbari, A. A. (2011). Labour market performance of immigrants in smaller regions of western countries: Some evidence of Atlantic Canada. *International Migration and Integration*, 12, 133-154. [affiliation: university].
- Alboim, N., Finnie, R. & Meng, R. The discounting of immigrants' skills in Canada: evidence and policy recommendations. *IRPP Choices*, 11 (2).
[affiliation: NGO]
- Anderson, R. & Milligan, S. (2011). Immigration, ethnicity and voluntary membership in Canada: individual and contextual effects. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*. 29(2), 139-154.
[affiliation: university].
- Arcand, S., Helly, D. et Lenoir, A. (2009). Insertion professionnelle d'immigrants récents et réseaux sociaux : le cas de Maghrébins à Montréal et Sherbrooke. *Canadian Journal of Sociology/Cahiers canadiens de sociologie*, 34, 373–402.
[affiliation: Université]
- Aydemir, A., & Skuterud, M. (2004). Explaining the deteriorating entry earnings of Canada's immigrants' cohorts: 1966-2000. *Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series, Statistics Canada*. [affiliation: university].
- Baffoe, M. (2011). Navigating two worlds: New identity constructions as determinants for successful integration of new black immigrant and refugee youth in Canadian society. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 7(4), 475-485. Retrieved February 3, 2012, from http://go.galegroup.com/ps/retrieve.do?retrieveFormat=PDF_FROM_CALLISTO&inPS=true&prodId=AONE&userGroupName=st46245&workId=PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-1.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-2.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-3.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-4.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-5.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-6.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-7.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-8.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-9.JPG|PI-0VVV-2011-OCT00-LASON-10.JPG&docId=GALE|A273080333&callistoContentSet=PER&isAcrobatAvailable=false
[affiliation: university]
- Bauder, H. (2003). Immigrants in urban labour markets: place of birth and immigrant concentrations in British Columbia. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*. 12(2), 179+.

[affiliation: university]

Beaudry & Belkhouja, C. (2008). *Développer une Stratégie en Matière d'Accueil et d'Intégration en Milieu Minoritaire Francophone et Urbain : l'expérience de quelques structures d'accueil à travers le Canada*. Disponible en ligne :

http://www.atlantic.metropolis.net/WorkingPapers/Beaudry_Belkhouja_WP_14.pdf

[affiliation: ONG]

Béland, P. (2008). Langue et immigration, langue du travail : éléments d'analyse. *Conseil supérieur de la langue française du Québec*. Disponible en ligne :

<http://www.cslf.gouv.qc.ca/publications/pubf228/f228.pdf>

[affiliation: gouvernement]

Belkhouja, C. (2011). *Regards croisés sur l'immigration*. Perce-Neige. [affiliation: Université]

Bernard, A. (2008). *Les immigrants dans les régions. L'emploi et le revenu en perspective*. Vol. 9, no. 1. Statistique Canada. Catalogue no. 75-001-X. Disponible en ligne :

<http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/75-001-x/2008101/article/10505-fra.htm>

[affiliation: gouvernement]

Bloemraad, I. (2006). *Becoming a citizen: Incorporating immigrants and refugees in the United States and Canada*. Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press. [affiliation: university]

Boissonneault, M.A. (2009). De la survie à la vie: L'intégration des nouveaux arrivants en Outaouais. Le Jumelé, hiver, p. 10. Agir pour intégrer, l'action communautaire au cœur de l'accueil des immigrants. Table de concertation des organismes au service de personnes réfugiées et immigrantes (TCRI). Disponible en ligne :

<http://www.tcric.qc.ca/pdf/lejumele/2009%20Hiver%20LeJumele.pdf>

[affiliation: organisation]

Bonikowska, A, Green, D.A. & Riddell, C. (2008). Literacy and the labour market: cognitive skills and immigrant earning. *Statistics Canada*. Catalogue number 89-552-M, no. 020. Retrieved from

<http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-552-m/89-552-m2008020-eng.pdf>

[affiliation: government]

Bonikowska, A., Hou, F. & Picot, G. (2011). A Canada-US comparison of labour market outcomes among highly-educated immigrants. *Canadian Public Policy*, 37 (1), 25-48.

[affiliation: government]

Bonikowska, A., Hou, F. & Picot, G. (2011). *Les immigrants très scolarisés obtiennent-ils des résultats différents sur le marché du travail au Canada et aux États-Unis?* Statistique Canada. Catalogue no. 11F0019M. Ottawa, «Direction des études analytiques: documents de recherche», no. 329.

Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11f0019m/11f0019m2011329-fra.pdf>

[affiliation: gouvernement]

- Boudarbat, B. (2011). Les défis de l'intégration des immigrants dans le marché du travail au Québec : enseignements tirés d'une comparaison avec l'Ontario et la Colombie-Britannique. CIRANO. Retrieved from <http://cirano.qc.ca/pdf/publication/2011RP-07.pdf> [affiliation: ONG]
- Boudarbat, B. et Boulet, M. (2007). Détérioration des salaires des nouveaux immigrants au Québec par rapport à l'Ontario et à la Colombie-Britannique. *Revue Choix*. IRPP. Vol. 13, n°7, novembre. [affiliation: ONG]
- Boudarbat, B. et Boulet, M. (2010a). Un diplôme post-secondaire canadien : un tremplin vers des emplois de qualité pour les immigrants?. *Étude IRPP*. N°8, septembre. Disponible en ligne : http://www.irpp.org/fr/pubs/IRPPStudy/IRPP_study_no8.pdf [affiliation: ONG]
- Boudarbat, B. et Boulet, M. (2010b). *Immigration au Québec : Politiques et intégration au marché du travail*, rapport de projet CIRANO, no 2010RP-05. [affiliation: Université]
- Boudarbat, B., Boulet, M. et Zhu, N. (2010). "Participation au marché du travail et revenus d'emploi des immigrants au Québec par rapport au reste du Canada", *Nos diverses cités*, numéro 7, pp. 60-66. [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Boudarbat, B. et Cousineau, J.-M., (2009). La situation économique des immigrants au Québec. Relations industrielles/Industrial Relations, 64 (2), pp. 230-249. [affiliation: Université]
- Boudarbat, B. et Cousineau, J.-M. (2010). Un emploi correspondant à ses attentes personnelles? Le cas des nouveaux immigrants au Québec. *Revue de l'intégration et de la migration internationale*, Volume 11(2), pp. 155-172. [affiliation: Université]
- Boudarbat, B. et Gontero S, I. (2008). Offre de travail des femmes mariées immigrantes au Canada. *L'actualité économique*. Vol. 84, n°2, 2008, p. 129-153. [affiliation: université].
- Boyd, M. & Schellenberg, G. (2007). Réagrément et professions des médecins et ingénieurs immigrants. *Tendances sociales canadiennes*. Statistique Canada. Catalogue no. 11-008. Ottawa.. Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-008-x/2007004/pdf/10312-fra.pdf> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Brunner, L.R., Hyndman, J. & Friesen, C. (2011). Post-IRPA GARs from Aceh: an analysis of refugee integration five years on. In D. Hiebert (Ed.), *Our Diverse Cities*. Metropolis British Columbia. Retrieved from http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/odc_bc_2011_e.pdf
- Brunner, L.R., Hyndman, J. & Friesen, C. (2011). Réfugiés pris en charge par le gouvernement, arrivés d'Aceh après la mise en oeuvre de la Loi sur l'immigration et la protection des réfugiés: analyse sur cinq ans de l'intégration des réfugiés. In D. Hiebert (Ed.), *Nos diverses cités: Colombie-Britannique*. Metropolis. p. 115-123. Retrieved from http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/odc_bc_2011_f.pdf

[affiliation: Université et gouvernement]

- Canadian Council for Refugees. (2011). Refugee integration: key concerns and areas for further research. *Canadian Council for Refugees*. Retrieved from <http://ccrweb.ca/files/refugee-integration-research-report.pdf> [affiliation NGO]
- Caron-Malenfant, E. et Martel, L. 2004. L'immigration récente au Canada en provenance des Balkans ». Statistique Canada. *Rapport sur l'état de la population du Canada*. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=91-209-X20030009189&lang=fra> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Chicha, M.T. (2010). La déqualification des immigrées hautement qualifiées à Montréal. : une question de degré? In A. Germain, F. Armand and M. McAndrew(Ed.), *Nos diverses cités Le Québec*. Metropolis. p. 77-82. Retrieved from http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_vol7_spring2010_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]
- Chicha, M. T., & Charest, E. (2008). *L'intégration des immigrants sur le marché du travail à Montréal: Politiques et enjeux*. *The Institute for Research on Public Policy*, 14(2), 1-64. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.irpp.org/fr/choices/archive/vol14no2.pdf> [affiliation: ONG]
- Chiswick, B. R., & Miller, P. W. (2002). The complementarity of language and other human capital: Immigrant earnings in Canada. *The Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA), Discussion Paper No. 451*. [affiliation: university].
- Chui, T & Tran, K. (2003). *Longitudinal survey of immigrants to Canada: progress and challenges of new immigrants in the workforce*. Statistics Canada. Catalogue number 89-615-XIE. Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-615-x/89-615-x2005001-eng.pdf> [affiliation: government]
- Chui, T. & Tran, K. (2005). Enquête longitudinale auprès des immigrants du Canada : progrès et défis des nouveaux immigrants sur le marché du travail ». Statistique Canada. *Hors-série*. Paru le 13 octobre. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=89-615-X&lang=fra> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Cloutier, G. (2011). *La valorisation des savoirs de femmes immigrantes en milieu communautaire. Source d'inspiration pour l'intervention sociale* Collection Migration et diversité - Enjeux sociaux et de santé, CSS-CAU de la Montagne, Richard Vezina Éditeur, 157 p. [affiliation: Université]
- Creese, G. (2011). Belonging and community building among new African diaspora in Vancouver. In *Our Diverse Cities*. Ed. Hiebert, D. Metropolis British Columbia. Retrieved from http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/odc_bc_2011_e.pdf [affiliation: university]
- Creese, G. (2011). Le sentiment d'appartenance et le développement communautaire de la nouvelle diaspora africaine de Vancouver. In D. Hiebert (Ed.), *Nos diverses cités: Colombie-Britannique*.

- Metropolis. p. 109-114. Disponible en ligne : http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/odc_bc_2011_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]
- Creese, G. & Wiebe, B. (2009). 'Survival employment': gender and deskilling among African immigrants to Canada. *International Migration*, 50 (1), doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2435.2009.00531.x [affiliation: university]
- Desjardins, D. & Cornelson, K. (2011). Immigrant labour market outcomes in Canada: the benefits of addressing wage and employment gaps. *Royal Bank of Canada: Economics Branch*. Toronto. Retrieved from <http://www.rbc.com/economics/market/pdf/immigration.pdf> [affiliation: private sector]
- Evans, S. D. (2007). Youth sense of community: Voice and power in community contexts. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 35, 693-709.
- Ewoudou, J. (2011). Location of study and labour market success of immigrants in Canada. *Statistics Canada*. Catalogue number 81-595-M, no. 93. Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-595-m/81-595-m2011093-eng.htm> [affiliation: government]
- Fédération canadienne des municipalités. (2009). *La qualité de vie dans les municipalités canadiennes: L'immigration et la diversité dans les villes et les collectivités canadiennes*. Fédération canadienne des municipalités. Disponible en ligne : http://www.fcm.ca/Documents/reports/Immigration_and_Diversity_in_Canadian_Cities_and_Communities_FR.pdf [affiliation: ONG]
- Ferrer, A., Green, A.D. & Riddell. (2006). The effect of literacy on immigrant earnings. *Journal of Human Resources*. 41(2), 380-410. [affiliation: university]
- Ferrer, A., & Riddell, W. C. (2008). Education, credentials, and immigrant earnings. *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 41(1), 186-216. Retrieved February 11, 2012, from <http://journals1.scholarsportal.info.proxy.library.brocku.ca/tmp/16088525933367644042.pdf> [affiliation: university].
- Fleury, D. (2007). A study of poverty and working poverty among recent immigrants to Canada. *Human Resources and Social Development Canada*, HS28-121/2007E. Retrieved from http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/publications_resources/research/categories/inclusion/2007/sp_680_05_07_e/page01.shtml [affiliation: government].
- Frenette, M., & Morissette, R. (2003). Will they ever converge? Earnings of immigrant and Canadian-born workers over the last two decades. *Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series No. 215, Statistics Canada*. [affiliation: government].
- Gallant, N. (2008). How social networks help to attract, integrate, and retain immigrants: A multidimensional research initiative. *Our Diverse Cities: Atlantic Canada*, 5, 73-76.

- Gallant, N. (2008). Comment les réseaux sociaux contribuent à attirer, à intégrer et à retenir les immigrants. In T. Murphy & J. de Finney (Ed.), *Nos diverses cités: Région de l'Atlantique*. Metropolis. p. 83-6. Disponible en ligne: http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_spring2008_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]
- Germain, A. (2009). De quelques débats sur l'intégration des immigrants au Québec et sur la diversité culturelle à la lumière d'un retour critique sur la notion de capital social, *Univers canadien/Canadian Universe*, vol. 1, no 1, p. 169-176. [affiliation: Université]
- Germain, A.; Mongeau, J. et Martineau, Y. avec la collaboration de Agossou, D. et Apparicio, P. (2005). *La problématique de la main-d'œuvre immigrante dans la région de Laval : portrait et questions* Document réalisé pour la Direction régionale de Laval d'Emploi-Québec, INRS Urbanisation, Culture et Société, 64 p. Disponible en ligne: http://www1.ucs.inrs.ca/pdf/mo_immigranteLaval2005.pdf [affiliation: Université]
- Gilmore, J. (2008). The Canadian immigrant labour market in 2007. *Statistics Canada, catalogue number 71-606-X2008003*.
- Gilmore, J. (2009). *Les immigrants sur le marché du travail canadien en 2008 : analyse de la qualité de l'emploi. Série d'analyses de la population active immigrante no. 5*. Statistique Canada. Catalogue number 71-606-XIF2009001. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2009001-fra.pdf> [affiliation: gouvernement]
- Gilmore, J. & Le Petit, C. (2008). *Les immigrants sur le marché du travail canadien en 2007: analyse selon la région d'obtention des études postsecondaires. Série d'analyses de la population active immigrante no. 4*. Statistique Canada. Catalogue number 71-606-XIF2008004. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2008004-fra.pdf> [affiliation: gouvernement]
- Girard, M., Smith, M., & Renaud, J. (2008) Intégration économique des nouveaux immigrants: Adéquation entre l'emploi occupé avant l'arrivée au Québec et les emplois occupés depuis l'immigration. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 33(4), 791-814. Disponible en ligne: <http://ejournals.library.ualberta.ca/index.php/CJS/article/view/4519/3649> [affiliation: Université]
- Goodkind, J.R. & Foster-Fishman, P. G. (2002). Integration diversity and fostering interdependence: Ecological lessons learned about refugee participation in multiethnic communities. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 30, 389-409.
- Gouvernement du Québec. (2005). Les personnes immigrantes formées à l'étranger et l'accès aux professions et métiers réglementés. Rapport du Groupe de travail sur l'accès aux professions et métiers réglementés. Montréal. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.micc.gouv.qc.ca/publications/fr/dossiers/AccesProfessionsMetiers-Rapport200502.pdf> [affiliation: gouvernement]

- Green, D.A. & Worswick, C. (2010). Entry earnings of immigrant men in Canada: the roles of labour market entry effects and returns to foreign experience. In T. McDonald, E. Ruddick, A. Sweetman & C. Worswick (Eds.) *Canadian Immigration: Economic Evidence for a Dynamic Policy Environment*. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queens University Press, 77-110.
- Green, D. A., & Worswick, C. (2010). Entry earnings of immigrant men in Canada: The roles of labour market entry effects and returns to foreign experience. *Canadian Immigration: Economic Evidence for a Dynamic Policy Environment*. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 77-110.
- Gulian, T. (2010). L'Intégration professionnelle des immigrants: des défis persistants aux solutions novatrices. In A. Germain, F. Armand and M. McAndrew (Ed.), *Nos diverses cites: Le Québec*. Metropolis. 151-155. Disponible en ligne : http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_vol7_spring2010_f.pdf [affiliation: Université]
- Hall, P.V. & Sadouzai, T. (2010). The value of 'experience' and the labour market entry of new immigrants to Canada. *Canadian Public Policy*, 36 (2), 181-198. [affiliation: university]
- Hall (2006). *Caring Canadians, Involved Canadians: Highlights from the 2004 National Survey of Giving, Volunteering, and Participating*. Statistics Canada. Ottawa: Statistics Canada. Retrieved April 2012 from http://www.givingandvolunteering.ca/pdf/CSgvP_Highlights_2004_en.pdf.
- Handy, F. & Greenspan, I. (2009). Immigrant volunteering: A stepping stone to integration? *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 38(6), 956-982.
- Hathiyani, A. (2007). Immigrants de formation professionnelle en passe de devenir chauffeurs de taxis à Toronto. In K. Graham (Ed.), *Nos diverses cites: Ontario*. Metropolis. p. 149-155. Disponible en ligne : http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_vol7_spring2010_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]
- Hawthorne, L. (2006). Labour market outcomes for migrant professionals: Canada and Australia compared (executive summary). *Citizenship and Immigration*. Retrieved February 5, 2012, from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/resources/research/2006-canada-australia.asp> [affiliation: university].
- Hiebert, D. (2011). The economic integration of immigrants in Vancouver. In D. Hiebert (Ed.), *Our Diverse Cities*. Metropolis British Columbia. p. 15-23. Retrieved from http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/odc_bc_2011_e.pdf [affiliation: university]
- Hou, F. et Picot, G. 2003. La hausse du taux de faible revenu chez les immigrants au Canada ». Statistique Canada. Hors-série. N°198. Juin. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=11F0019M2003198&lang=fra> [affiliation: Gouvernement]

- Houle, R. et Yssaad, L. 2010. « Reconnaissance des diplômes et de l'expérience de travail acquis à l'étranger des nouveaux immigrants ». *L'emploi et le revenu en perspective*. Statistique Canada. Vol. 22, n°4. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=75-001-X201000411342&lang=fra>
- Hum, D. & Simpson, W. (2004). Economic integration of immigrants to Canada: A short survey. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 13(1), 46-61.
- Human Resources and Skills Development Canada. (2008). Pan-Canadian study of first year college students, report 2: The characteristics and experience of aboriginal, disabled, immigrant, and visible minority students. Gatineau, QC: Human Resources and Skills Development Canada Publications Centre.
- Hum, D. & Simpson, W. (2004). Economic integration of immigrants to Canada: A short survey. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 13(1), 46-61.
- Kanu, Y. (2009) Educational pathways to successful social integration for African refugee students in Manitoba. *Our Diverse Cities*, 114-119.
- Kay, F. M. & Johnston, R. (Eds.) (2007). *Social Capital, Diversity, and the Welfare State*, Vancouver: UBC press. [affiliation: university]
- Kazemipur, A.. (2006). A Canadian Exceptionalism: Trust and Diversity in Canadian Exceptionalism: Trust and Diversity in Canadian Cities. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 7(2):219-240.
- Kazemipour, A. (2008). *Social Capital Profiles: immigrants and the native-born in Canada*. WP02-08. Prairie Metropolis Centre. Available at: <http://pccrui.metropolis.net/WorkingPapers/WP0208.pdf>
- Kelly, P., Damsbaek, N., Lemoine, M., Fang, T., Preston, V., & Tufts, S. (2010). Language skills and immigrant labour market outcomes. *TIEDI Analytical Report 11*.
- Kelly, P., Park, S., & Lepper, L. (2011) Economic recession and immigrant labour market outcomes in Canada, 2006-2011. *TIEDI Analytical Report 22, July 2011*.
- Labelle, M., Field, A.-M., Icart, J.-C. (2007.) Les dimensions d'intégration des immigrants, des minorités ethnoculturelles et des groupes racisés au Québec . Document de travail. UQÀM. Disponible en ligne : http://www.criec.uqam.ca/Page/Document/textes_en_lignes/dimensions_integration.pdf [affiliation: Université]
- Lafontant, J. (2009). L'intégration en emploi des immigrants francophones racisés à Winnipeg : résumé d'une étude exploratoire. In T. Carter, T. Derwing, L. Ogilvie & T. Wotherspoon (Ed.), *Nos diverses cités: Région des Prairies*. Metropolis. p. 131-35. Disponible en ligne: http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_vol6_spring09_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]

- Lai, Y., & Hynie, M. (2010). Community engagement and well-being of immigrants: The role of knowledge. *Canadian Issues*, Summer, 93-97. [affiliation: university].
- Lenoir-Achdjian, A. et Morin, P. (2008) *La situation socio-économique des minorités visibles et religieuses du Québec* Rapport présenté au Centre Métropolis du Québec Domaine 4. Université de Sherbrooke. Disponible en ligne: http://www.im.metropolis.net/frameset_f.html [affiliation: Université]
- Lenoir-Achdjian, A., Arcand, S., Helly, D., Drainville, I., Laaroussi-Vatz, M. (2009). Les difficultés d'insertion en emploi des immigrants du Maghreb au Québec. *Revue Choix. IRPP*. Vol. 15. N°3, mars. Disponible en ligne : www.irpp.org [affiliation: ONG]
- Li, P. S. (2003). Initial earnings and catch-up capacity of immigrants. *Canadian Public Policy*, 29(3), 319-337.
- Lo, L., Damsbaek, N., Phan, M., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Fang, T., Preston, V., & Tufts, S. (2010). Are degrees/diplomas from inside and outside of Canada valued differently in the labour market? *TIEDI Analytical Report 14*, 1-12.
- Mata, F. (2008). Exploring linkages between the country and post-secondary education completion and labour market activity of immigrants in Canada. *Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Diversity: Metropolis British Columbia*
- Métropolis. L'Intégration des enfants et des jeunes immigrants de première génération au Québec : Perspective des organismes communautaires au service des nouveaux arrivants. Rapport de recherche Table de concertation des organismes au service des personnes réfugiées et immigrantes (2011). Disponible en ligne: http://im.metropolis.net/annonces/annonces_content/2011-03-31_divers_CRAJ.pdf
- Ministère de l'Immigration et des Communautés culturelles. (2009) Immigrants et le marché du travail québécois en 2008, Volet 1, novembre. Disponible en ligne http://www.micc.gouv.qc.ca/publications/fr/recherches-statistiques/Immigrants_MT_Volet1.pdf Volet 2, novembre 2010. Disponible en ligne http://www.micc.gouv.qc.ca/publications/fr/recherches-statistiques/Immigrants_MT_Volet2.pdf [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Multris, P. (2010). Disqualification professionnelle et expériences temporelles : enquête auprès des immigrants francophones installés en Alberta, *British Journal of Canadian Studies*, no. 23, vol. 1, p. 73-77 [affiliation: Université]
- Murdie, R. & Ghosh, S. (2010). Does spatial concentration always mean a lack of integration? Exploring ethnic concentration and integration in Toronto. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*. 36(2), 293-311. [affiliation: university]
- Nadeau, S. & Seckin, A. (2010). The immigrant wage gap in Canada: Quebec and the rest of Canada. *Canadian Public Policy*, 36(3), 265-285.

- Nakhaie, R., Lin, X., & Guan, J. (2009). Social capital and the myth of minority self-employment: Evidence from Canada. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35(4), 625-644. [affiliation; university]
- Navaratna, P. (2007). Établissement des réfugiés parrainés par le gouvernement à Hamilton, en Ontario. In K. Graham (Ed.), *Nos diverses cites: Ontario*. Metropolis. p. 132-137. Disponible en ligne: http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_vol7_spring2010_f.pdf [affiliation: Université et gouvernement]
- Oreopoulos, P. (2008). Why do skilled immigrants struggle in the labour market: A field experiment with six thousand resumes. Vancouver: Economics Department, University of British Columbia.
- Palameta, B. (2007). *Intégration au marché du travail : enjeux et défis pour les nouveaux immigrants*. Centre syndical et patronal du Canada. Disponible en ligne : http://www.clbc.ca/files/Reports_French/IHB_section_c_fr.pdf [affiliation: ONG]
- Picot, G. (2004). The deteriorating economic welfare of Canadian immigrants. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*. 13(1), 25-45. [affiliation: government]
- Picot, G. (2004). *Dégradation du bien-être économique des immigrants et causes possible*. Ottawa : Statistique Canada. Disponible en ligne : <http://publications.gc.ca/collections/Collection/Statcan/11F0019MIF/11F0019MIF2004222.pdf> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Picot, G. (2008). *Situation économique et sociale des immigrants au Canada : recherche et élaboration de données à Statistique Canada*. Document de recherche. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11f0019m/11f0019m2008319-fra.pdf> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Picot, G. & Hou, F. (2009). *Les caractéristiques des immigrants, l'effondrement de la TI et leur effet sur les gains initiaux des immigrants*. Statistique Canada. Catalogue no. 11F0019M. Ottawa: Direction des études analytiques: documents de recherche, no. 315. Disponible en ligne http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2009/statcan/11F0019M/11f0019m2008315-fra.pdf [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Picot, G., Hou, F., & Coulombe, S. (2007). Chronic low-income and low-income dynamics among recent immigrants. *Statistics Canada, catalogue number 11F0019MIE*, no. 294.
- Picot, G., & Piraino, P. (2012). Immigrant earnings growth: Selection bias or real progress? *Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series*. [affiliation: government].
- Pinsonneault, G., Lechaume, A., Benzakour, C. et Lanctôt, P. (2010). Recours au programme d'aide sociale par les immigrants de la catégorie des travailleurs qualifiés : échec ou transition dans le processus d'intégration?, Québec, ministère de l'Immigration et des Communautés culturelles, et ministère de l'Emploi et de la Solidarité sociale, Gouvernement du Québec, 46 p.

[affiliation: Gouvernement]

- Plante, J. (2010). *Caractéristiques et résultats sur le marché du travail des immigrants formés à l'étranger*. Catalogue no. 81-595-M, no. 84. Statistique Canada. <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-595-m/81-595-m2010084-fra.pdf> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Plante, J. (2011). *Intégration des immigrants formés à l'étranger au marché du travail canadien : facteurs déterminants de la réussite*. Statistique Canada. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-595-m/81-595-m2011094-fra.htm> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Preston, V., Chua, J., Phan, M., Park, S., Kelly, P., & Lemoine, M. (2011). What are immigrants' experiences of discrimination in the workplace? *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative Analytical Report*. <http://www.yorku.ca/tiedi/pubreports.html> [affiliation: university and NGO]
- Preston, V., Damsbaek, N., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Lo, L., Shields, J., Tufts, S. (2010a). Do country of birth and level of educational attainment affect the labour market outcomes of immigrants? *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative Analytical Report 13*. [affiliation: university and NGO].
- Preston, V., Damsbaek, N., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Lo, L., Shields, J., Tufts, S. (2010b). How do gender and country of birth affect labour market outcomes for immigrants? *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative Analytical Report* [affiliation: university and NGO]
- Preston, V., Damsbaek, N., Kelly, P., Lemoine, L.L., Shields, J., & Tufts, S. (2010). What are the labour market outcomes for university-educated immigrants? *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative Analytical Report 8*. [affiliation: university and NGO]
- Preston, V., Damsbaek, N., Kelly, P., Lemoine, L.L., Shields, J., & Tufts, S. (2011). Do educational attainment, gender, and age affect labour market outcomes of immigrants? *Toronto Immigrant Employment Data Initiative Analytical Report 16* [affiliation: university and NGO]
- Putnam, R. (2000). *Bowling Alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster. [affiliation: university].
- Reitz, J. (2007a). Immigrant employment success in Canada, part 1: individual and contextual causes. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. 8, 11-36. [affiliation: university]
- Reitz, J. (2007b). Immigrant employment success in Canada, Part 2: understanding the decline. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*. 8, 37-62. [affiliation: university]
- Reitz, J. & Banerjee, R. (2007). Racial inequality, social cohesion and policy issues in Canada. In K. Banting, T. Courchene & L. Seidle. *Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada*. Montreal: Institute for Research on Public Policy, 489-546. [affiliation: university]

- Renaud, J. & Cayn, T. (2006). *Un emploi correspondant à ses compétences ? Les travailleurs sélectionnés et l'accès à un emploi qualifié au Québec*. Ministère de l'Immigration et des Communautés culturelles. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.micc.gouv.qc.ca/publications/fr/recherches-statistiques/AccesEmploiQualifie-RapportRenaudCayn.pdf>
[affiliation: Université]
- Schaafsma, J. & Sweetman, A. (2001). Immigrant earnings: age at immigration matters. *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 34 (4), 1066-1099.
[affiliation: university & government]
- Schuetze, H. J. (2010). Immigration policy and the self-employment experience of immigrants to Canada. *Canadian Immigration: Economic Evidence for a Dynamic Policy Environment*. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 147-181.
- Shields, J., Phan, M., Yang, F., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Lo, L., Preston, V., & Tufts, S. (2010). Do immigrant class and gender affect labour market outcomes for immigrants? *TIEDI Analytical Report 2*.
- Somerville, K., & Walsworth, S. (2010). Admission and employment criteria discrepancies: Experiences of skilled immigrants in Toronto. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 11(3), 341-354.
- Soroka, S., Johnston, R. & Banting, K. (2007). Ties that bind? Social cohesion and diversity in Canada. In K. Banting, T. Courchene & L. Seidle. *Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada*. Montreal: Institute for Research on Public Policy, 561-600. [affiliation: university]
- Statistique Canada. (2005). Enquête longitudinale auprès des immigrants du Canada, S'établir dans un nouveau pays: un portrait des premières expériences. Statistique Canada. Catalogue number 89-614-XIF. Disponible en ligne: <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/89-614-x/89-614-x2005001-fra.pdf>
[affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Statistics Canada. (2005). Knowledge of official languages among new immigrants: How important is it in the labour market? *Statistics Canada, catalogue number 89-624-XWE*.
- Sweetman, A. (2004). Immigrant source country educational quality and Canadian labour market outcomes. *Statistics Canada*. Catalogue number 11F0019MIE, no. 234.
[affiliation: university]
- Sweetman, A. (2004). Qualité de l'éducation des immigrants dans leur pays d'origine et résultats sur le marché du travail canadien ». Statistique Canada. Direction des études analytiques : documents de recherche. N° 234. 15 décembre. [affiliation: university]
- Thomas, D. (2005). I am Canadian. *Statistics Canada*. Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-008-x/2004004/article/7774-eng.pdf>
[affiliation: government]

- Thomas, D. (2011). Personal networks and the economic adjustment of immigrants. *Statistics Canada*, Catalogue number: 11-008-X, no. 2011002. [affiliation: government]
- Thomas, D. (2011). Réseaux personnels et adaptation des immigrants sur le plan économique. *Tendances sociales canadiennes*. Statistique Canada. Catalogue no. 11-008-X.. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-008-x/2011002/article/11592-fra.pdf> [affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Tossutti, Livianna S. 2003. Does Voluntarism Encourage Young Newcomers to Participate in Politics? An Assessment of Individual and Group-Based Forms of Unpaid Service. *Canadian Ethnic Studies/Études ethniques au Canada* 35(3): 1-15.
- Tossutti, L. S., Kaas-Mason, S. & Ming Wang, D. (2008). Family, religion, and civic engagement in Canada. *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal*, 40.3, 65-91. Retrieved February 5, 2012, from http://go.galegroup.com/ps/retrieve.do?retrieveFormat=PDF_FROM_CALLISTO&inPS=true&prodId=AONE&userGroupName=st46245&workId=PI-0KBR-2008-FAL00-IDS1-64.JPG|PI-0KBR-2008-FAL00-IDS1-65.JPG|PI-0KBR-2008-FAL00-IDS1-66.JPG|PI-0KBR-2008-FAL00-IDS1-67.JPG|PI-0KBR-2008-FAL00-IDS1-68.JPG|PI-0KBR-IDS&callistoContentSet=PER&isAcrobatAvailable=false [affiliation: university]
- Topen, A. (2008). How integrated are women from sub-Saharan Africa in the Canadian labour force? Halifax case study. In *Our Diverse Cities: Atlantic Canada*. Metropolis. http://canada.metropolis.net/pdfs/ODC_spring2008_e.pdf [affiliation: university]
- Tran, K., Kustec, S. & Chui, T. (2005). Becoming Canadian: Intent, process, and outcome. *Statistics Canada*, 1-6. [affiliation: government]
- Tran, K., Kaddatz, J. & Allard, P. (2005). South Asians in Canada: unity through diversity. *Statistics Canada*. Retrieved from <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/bsolc/olc-cel/olc-cel?catno=11-008-X20050028455&lang=eng> [affiliation: government]
- Tufts, S., Samsbaek, N., Phan, M., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Lo, L., Shields, J., & Preston, V. (2010). Does self-reported English and French speaking ability affect labour market outcomes for immigrants? *TIEDI Analytical Report 6*.
- Walters, D., Phythian, K., & Anisef, P. (2007). The acculturation of Canadian immigrants: Determinants of ethnic identification with the host society. *Canadian Review of Sociology & Anthropology*, 44.1, 37-64. Retrieved February 5, 2012, from <http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=745bcf42-cfa1-4d55-a9f0-3fc481383bec%40sessionmgr13&vid=5&hid=25> [affiliation: university]
- Wanner, R. (2003). Entry class and the earnings attainment of immigrants to Canada, 1980-1995. *Canadian Public Policy*. 29(1), 53-71. [affiliation: university]

- Warman, C.R. & Worswick, C. (2004). Immigrant earnings performance in Canadian cities: 1981-2001. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*. 13(1),62-84.
[affiliation: university]
- Warman, C. (2007). Ethnic enclaves and immigrant earnings growth. *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 40(2), 401-422. [affiliation: university].
- Xie, Y. & Gough, M. (2011). Ethnic Enclaves and the Earnings of Immigrants. *Demography*, 48, 1293-1315.
- Xue, L. (2006). *The labour market progression of the LSIC immigrants: A perspective from the second wave of the longitudinal survey of immigrants to Canada (LSIC) – Two years after landing*. Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Retrieved February 5, 2012, from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/lsic.pdf>.
[affiliation: government].
- Xue, L. (2007). *Portrait of an integration process: Difficulties encountered and resources relied on for newcomers in their first four years in Canada: Evidence from three waves of the longitudinal survey of immigrants to Canada (LSIC)*. Citizenship and Immigration Canada. [affiliation: government]
- Xue, L. (2007). *Portrait d'un processus d'intégration: Difficultés rencontrées et ressources mises à profit par les nouveaux arrivants au cours des quatre années qui suivent leur arrivée au Canada*. Données tirées des trois cycles de l'Enquête longitudinales auprès des immigrants du Canada (ELIC). Citoyenneté et Immigration Canada. Disponible en ligne : <http://www.cic.gc.ca/francais/pdf/recherche-stats/portrait-integr-process-f.pdf>
[affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Xue, L. (2008a). *Initial labour market outcomes: A comprehensive look at the employment experience of recent immigrants during the first four years in Canada*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Retrieved February 5, 2012, from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/LSIC-employment-outcome.pdf>
[affiliation: government].
- Xue, L. (2008b). *Social capital and wages: Outcomes of recent immigrants to Canada*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada. [affiliation: government].
- Xue, L. (2008c). *Social capital and employment entry of recent immigrants to Canada: evidence from the longitudinal survey of immigrants to Canada (LSIC)*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Retrieved January 31, 2012, from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/social-capital-w3-eng.pdf> [affiliation: government]
- Xue, L. (2008c). *Capital social et entrée sur le marché du travail des nouveaux immigrants au Canada. Données provenant des trois cycles de l'Enquête longitudinales auprès des immigrants du Canada (ELIC)*. Citoyenneté et Immigration Canada. Retrieved from <http://www.cic.gc.ca/francais/pdf/recherche-stats/social-capital-w3-fra.pdf>
[affiliation: Gouvernement]

- Zhao, J., Xue, L., Gilkinson, T. (2001). État de santé et capital social des nouveaux immigrants: données probantes issues de l'Enquête longitudinale auprès des immigrants du Canada. Citoyenneté et Immigration Canada. Disponible en ligne : https://docs.google.com/viewer?a=v&q=cache:fnblHncjgq4J:www.cic.gc.ca/francais/pdf/recherche-stats/donnees-immigrants.pdf+J+Zhao+2010+État+de+santé&hl=fr&gl=ca&pid=bl&srcid=ADGEESiBKTJpbU1KmF79L7uENqqwrQCE7IFt1dJp-Ktj9S3xPESRwayluDbZEKwhVaCXvx1xMty9EIUGRswO1iA4iO0yIRE2O0qEY5_WrieubgBmcbUnqgGyuWO5ScZ-enenHqsioVSC&sig=AHIEtbRNDVYL55h_Kb11enMHRjpHP08pXQ&pli=1
[affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Zietsma, D. (2007). *Les immigrants sur le marché canadien du travail en 2006 : premiers résultats de l'Enquête sur la population active du Canada*. Ottawa : Statistique Canada. Série d'analyses de la population active immigrante. Septembre.
[affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Zietsma, D. (2010). *Immigrants exerçant des professions réglementées. L'emploi et le revenu en perspective*. Vol. 11 No 2. Catalogue no. 75-001-X. Ottawa : Statistique Canada. Disponible en ligne : <http://statcan.gc.ca/pub/75-001-x/2010102/pdf/11121-fra.pdf>
[affiliation: Gouvernement]
- Zikic, J., Damsbaek, N., Phan, M., Kelly, P., Lemoine, M., Fang, T., Preston, V., & Tufts, S. (2010). How does immigration class affect immigrants' experiences with credential recognition? *TIEDI Analytical Report 10*. Retrieved February 11, 2012, from <http://www.yorku.ca/tiedi/doc/AnalyticalReport10.pdf> [affiliation: research institute].